OSC e

Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights

PRINCIPALITY OF LIECHTENSTEIN

PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 9 February 2025

ODIHR NEEDS ASSESSMENT MISSION REPORT 13 – 14 November 2024



Warsaw 16 January 2024

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
III.	FINDINGS	. 3
A.	BACKGROUND AND POLITICAL CONTEXT	3
B.	LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND ELECTORAL SYSTEM	4
C.	ELECTION ADMINISTRATION	5
D.	VOTER REGISTRATION	
E.	CANDIDATE REGISTRATION	
F.	CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE	7
G.	Media	8
H.	ELECTORAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION	
I.	ELECTION OBSERVATION	10
IV.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION	10
ANN	EX: LIST OF MEETINGS	11

PRINCIPALITY OF LIECHTENSTEIN PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 9 February 2025

ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report

I. INTRODUCTION

Following an invitation from the authorities of the Principality of Liechtenstein to observe the 9 February 2025 parliamentary elections and in accordance with its mandate, the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) undertook a Needs Assessment Mission (NAM) on 13 and 14 November. The NAM included Vladimir Misev, ODIHR Senior Adviser on New Voting Technologies, and Goran Petrov, ODIHR Election Adviser.

The purpose of the mission was to assess the pre-election environment and preparations for the parliamentary elections. Based on this assessment, the NAM should recommend whether to deploy an ODIHR election-related activity for the forthcoming elections and, if so, what type of activity best meets the identified needs. Meetings were held with officials from state institutions and the election administration, as well as with representatives of political parties, media and civil society. A list of meetings is annexed to this report.

ODIHR would like to thank the Government Chancellery of the Principality of Liechtenstein for its assistance and co-operation in organizing the NAM. ODIHR would also like to thank all of its interlocutors for taking the time to meet with the NAM and to share their views.

II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On 9 February 2025, 25 members of parliament will be elected for a 4-year term under a proportional representation system in two multi-mandate constituencies. The current seat allocation assigns disproportionally more mandates to one of the constituencies, which may affect the equality of the vote. In the run-up to elections, one of the political parties introduced an initiative to amend the electoral system, aiming to increase proportionality by altering the seat allocation mechanism, but if adopted, the change will not be implemented during these elections. The threshold to enter parliament is eight per cent, which some ODIHR NAM interlocutors saw as too high, leaving parts of the electorate unrepresented, while others argued that it is necessary to prevent parliamentary fragmentation and proliferation of radical political groups.

The electoral legal framework includes the Constitution, the Citizens Political Rights Act and government instructions, typically reissued a few months before each parliamentary election. The election legislation has remained unchanged since the last parliamentary elections. The ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that the legal framework provides an appropriate basis for the organization and conduct of democratic elections.

The government holds primary responsibility for managing and overseeing the overall process. Voting and counting are performed by a two-tier system consisting of two Main Election Commissions (MECs) and 11 Commune Election Commissions (ComECs). Ten out of 22 MEC members (45 per cent) and 28 out of 74 of ComEC members (38 per cent) are women. All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the work of the election administration. Most voters vote via post; the ODIHR NAM interlocutors lauded postal voting as an effective voting method and

did not express any secrecy-related concerns. While the ODIHR NAM was informed that all polling stations are accessible, no other accessibility measures to facilitate independent voting of persons with disabilities are in place. The legislation does not contain explicit provisions for election observation, challenging OSCE commitments, but the standing government regulations grant full access to national and international observers.

A total of 21,118 voters were eligible to vote as of 13 November. The right to vote is granted to citizens over 18 years of age with in-country permanent residence for at least one month before elections. Voters temporarily abroad can request ballots to be mailed to them. Citizens declared incapable of judgment by a court decision are disenfranchised, contrary to international obligations and standards. In general, the ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed confidence in the accuracy of the voter register.

All eligible voters have the right to stand. The right to submit a candidate list is granted to electoral groups established by a minimum of 30 voters from the same constituency. A voter could sign in support of only one list, which is at odds with international good practice. All ODIHR NAM interlocutors described the candidate registration process as inclusive. However, some said it is a challenge to identify suitable candidates, especially among women, and the largest parties noted that less than a third of their candidates will be women. While some progress has been made in increasing women's representation in political and public life since the introduction of women's suffrage in 1984, including in the central and local governments, in general achieving gender parity remains an ongoing endeavor.

The conduct of the election campaign is largely unregulated, and political parties can campaign at any time. Contestants mostly campaign through newspapers, online media and social networks and, to some extent, in broadcast media. According to the ODIHR NAM interlocutors the main campaign issues are health care, traffic, the environment and cost of living. Parties intend to actively use Facebook and Instagram, as well as LinkedIn, YouTube and other social networks. ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not express significant concerns over the use of intolerant language or disinformation.

The campaign finance rules were significantly amended in 2019 to include party registration, publication of annual financial statements, political finance oversight and sanctions for noncompliance and introduce a ban on anonymous donations over CHF 300 (approximately EUR 322). There are no donations or spending limits, and the identity of donors need not be publicly disclosed. Public funding is available to parliamentary political parties and to those that received at least three percent of the votes; it is their main funding source. While most ODIHR NAM interlocutors agreed that the regulatory scope related to campaign financing remains sparse, most also stated that introducing more stringent regulations would be counter-productive, given the general state of parties' limited finances.

The country's constitution guarantees freedom of the press, and this right is respected in practice, but the limited range of domestic media options poses challenges to diverse public discourse on the local level. A referendum in October resulted in the repeal of the law which regulated *Radio Liechtenstein* as state-owned and state-funded. While some ODIHR NAM interlocutors emphasized the importance of fair competition and supported the change, others expressed concerns that it could further reduce the availability of locally relevant media content. Furthermore, in 2023, one of the two daily newspapers, each seen as supporting a different main political party, ceased operations due to economic constraints, thus further limiting the space for political information and debate. The remaining local media intends to actively cover the campaign.

The election law provides the possibility to appeal voter and candidate registration decisions, but there is no clear guidance on how other complaints, including those related to the campaign, voting and counting procedures and the work of election commissions, should be handled. The State (Constitutional) Court has the authority to invalidate the election results if the identified irregularities had or could have had a significant impact on the outcome. ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not raise concerns over the election dispute resolution system and underlined that in the last two decades, no election-related complaints were lodged.

All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the electoral process and the ability of the election administration to conduct election procedures, and the vote count professionally and reliably. They also underlined that there have been no changes in the election law since the 2021 parliamentary elections. Most of the ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not see a significant added value in an external observation and assessment of the upcoming elections, and no concerns were expressed relating to the respect for fundamental freedoms, voter registration, candidate registration, the electoral campaign, election dispute resolution and election day procedures. Some interlocutors stated divergent views on the need to reform the electoral system for future elections and which direction to take to ensure the highest levels of proportional representation. While it is up to Parliament to decide on the appropriate course, ODIHR encourages the authorities to conduct a timely, comprehensive and inclusive review in case they wish to engage in such reform.

Based on this, the ODIHR NAM does not recommend deploying any election-related activity for the 9 February 2025 parliamentary elections. ODIHR stands ready to assist the Principality of Liechtenstein in any future electoral reform and encourages the authorities to consider issues of concern raised in this and previous reports.

III. FINDINGS

A. BACKGROUND AND POLITICAL CONTEXT

According to the Constitution, the Principality of Liechtenstein is a hereditary monarchy governed on a parliamentary basis with the powers of the state embodied in the Reigning Prince, who has substantial powers, including the authority to dissolve the parliament, appoint and dismiss the government, appoint judges, and suspend legal acts.¹

Executive powers are vested in the government, consisting of a head of government and four ministers. The government members are appointed by the Prince on the proposal of the *Landtag* (Parliament).

The parliament is the main legislative body comprising 25 members (MPs) elected for a term of four years, with MPs serving on a part-time basis, balancing legislative work with other professional commitments. The 2021 parliamentary elections resulted in a close contest between the Patriotic Union (PU) and the Progressive Citizens' Party (PCP), winning ten seats each. The Free List (FL) and Democrats for Liechtenstein (DpL) won three and two seats, respectively. Following the election, the PU and PCP formed a power-sharing government with the prime minister and two ministers nominated by the PU and two by the PCP.

¹

Currently, this is Prince Hans-Adam II, although since 2004, through a delegation of authority, governance has been largely handled by his son, Hereditary Prince Alois. The Council of Europe's Venice Commission criticized the extensive powers of the Prince in its 2002 <u>Opinion on the Amendments to the Constitution of Liechtenstein</u> <u>Proposed by The Princely House of Liechtenstein</u>.

Liechtenstein is committed to direct democracy, allowing its citizens to initiate referendums on all legislative and constitutional matters. In 2024, Liechtenstein held eight referendums, including on joining the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and abolishing the law regulating Radio Liechtenstein as a public service (see also the *Media* section) and, on 1 December 2024, aimed at reforming the state pension fund.²

Women remain less represented in the Liechtenstein parliament, seven women MPs (28 per cent) were elected in 2021, and women comprise 34.8 per cent of the elected local councilors. Election stakeholders perceive this under representation due to historical and cultural factors, traditional gender roles, limited political encouragement, and the small political sphere.³ In the current government, three cabinet members are women.

ODIHR has previously deployed three NAMs to Liechtenstein since 2008, most recently in connection with the 2021 parliamentary elections. All previous NAMs noted the confidence of all its interlocutors in the integrity of the electoral process and the professionalism and impartiality of the election administration and did not recommend deploying any election-related activity.⁴

B. LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND ELECTORAL SYSTEM

The electoral legal framework comprises the 1921 Constitution (significantly amended in 2003, most recently amended in 2020), the 1973 Citizens Political Rights Act (CPRA, last amended in 2018) and government instructions, typically reissued a few months before each parliamentary election.⁵ Overall, the election legislation has remained largely unchanged since the last parliamentary elections.

Liechtenstein is party to major international and legal instruments pertaining to the conduct of democratic elections.⁶ Notably, Liechtenstein signed the 2006 UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) in 2020 and ratified it in December 2023.

The CPRA defines voter eligibility and registration, organization and work of electoral commissions, voting and counting procedures and reporting of election results. The additional instructions further clarify certain aspects of elections, including the voter eligibility criteria, voter lists inspection, inperson and postal voting procedures and materials, security measures, ballots validity, and verification and transmission of election results. The Government Chancellery informed the ODIHR NAM that it did not have plans to introduce any changes to the instructions. The ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that the legal framework provides an appropriate basis for the organization and conduct of democratic elections, but some noted a need to reform how mandates are allocated.

According to the Constitution, the parliament is elected through a proportional representation system in two multi-member constituencies: 15 members are elected from the Upper Country (*Oberland*)

² To initiate a referendum, a minimum of 1,000 or 1,500 voters' signatures is required, depending on the type of referendum or motion.

³ Liechtenstein <u>granted</u> rights to women to elect and be elected in 1984, and the first woman was elected as an MP in 1986.

⁴ See all prior <u>ODIHR reports on Liechtenstein</u>.

⁵ Other relevant laws include the 1984 Law on Payment of Contributions to Political Parties (LPCPP), the 2005 Law on Media, the Law on the Organization of Courts, the Law on the State Court, and the Code of Civil Procedure.

⁶ Including the <u>1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)</u>, <u>1979 Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)</u>, <u>1965 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD)</u> and <u>2003 Convention Against Corruption (CAC)</u>.

Principality of Liechtenstein Parliamentary Elections, 9 February 2025 ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report, 13 - 14 November 2024

and 10 members from the Lower Country (*Unterland*). Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors observed that this distribution is not fully proportional to the voter distribution.⁷

Each candidate list is presented on a separate ballot, allowing voters to express their preferences by striking out candidates and optionally writing in candidates from other lists by hand. Despite the complexities of the voting options and potential challenges to ballot validity, most ODIHR NAM interlocutors indicated that these options are clear to the majority of voters.⁸

To win parliamentary seats, contestants must secure at least eight per cent of the valid votes cast nationwide. While many ODIHR NAM interlocutors considered this threshold excessively high, others argued that it is necessary to prevent parliamentary fragmentation and the entry of radical political groups in the parliament. However, some noted that this threshold might leave parts of the population without parliamentary representation. For each electoral group surpassing the threshold, candidates are ranked within their constituency based on the number of votes received. Mandates are then allocated among the contestants using a quota system with the largest remainder.

The ODIHR NAM was informed that, in December, Parliament was to discuss amending the CPRA, following a proposal by the PCP, to modify the seat allocation method for elections starting in 2029.⁹ The stated aim was to achieve more proportional representation among political parties and reduce the impact of the differing sizes of the two constituencies. In its assessment, the government noted that while the initiative aligned with the Constitution, a broader review of electoral reforms could be undertaken to enhance voter representation effectively, also by reviewing other factors affecting proportionality, such as the electoral threshold. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed that the proposed mechanism favours smaller parties, potentially leading to a more diverse parliament. However, they also noted that the seat allocation system might be overly complex for election stakeholders to fully comprehend. On 5 December, the parliamentary initiative was defeated by a margin of a single vote, and subsequently the youth chapter of PCP declared it will propose a popular initiative in this respect.¹⁰

C. ELECTION ADMINISTRATION

The government plays a crucial role in election management, including calling elections, issuing instructions, registering candidates, printing and distributing voting materials, allocating mandates, and addressing certain types of complaints.

At the lower level, elections are managed by two Main Election Commissions (MEC), one for each constituency and 11 Commune Election Commissions (ComECs). Members of these election commissions are nominated by political entities in proportion to their representation in parliament. Ten out of 22 MEC members (45 per cent) and 28 out of 74 of ComEC members (38 per cent) are women.

Oberland has 13,500 voters registered, while Underland has 7,618. ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that to achieve closer proportionality, Oberland should have 16 MPs elected and Unterland 9. Section 2.2.iv of the 2002 Venice Commission Code of Good Practice in Electoral Matters recommends: "The permissible departure from the norm should not be more than 10%, and should certainly not exceed 15% except in special circumstances (protection of a concentrated minority, sparsely populated administrative entity)".

⁸ The number of invalid ballots in the 2021 parliamentary elections was 141 or 0.91 per cent. The vast majority were due to a lack of voters' signatures on the ballot envelope and largely unrelated to ballot markings.

⁹ The proposal describes introducing a so-called '<u>Pukelsheim</u>' electoral system which uses mathematical optimization to distribute seats in a way that better reflects the overall share of votes received by parties, reducing the distortions that could be caused by varying constituency sizes.

¹⁰ See <u>an article</u> by the youth chapter of PCP.

The MECs are permanent bodies appointed by the government for a four-year term and consist of up to 11 members and 6 substitutes. The MEC chairpersons are usually from the party with the best election results in the constituency. The MECs are responsible for the mandatory re-counting of ballots and verification of the results submitted by ComECs.

The ComECs are permanent bodies headed by the mayor *ex officio* and consisting of up to six members and three substitutes elected by respective commune councils. On election day, ComECs are responsible for the conduct of voting, the vote count and transfer of results and election materials to the MECs. During counting, the ComECs are supported by staff appointed by commune councils, which work in pairs of two and are nominated by different parties. The representatives of the Government Chancellery informed the ODIHR NAM they will conduct training sessions for ComECs and MECs, focusing primarily on the use of the counting and tabulation system.¹¹ All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the work of election administration.

Voting is compulsory by law. Although this rule has not been enforced, voter turnout has exceeded 75 per cent in all recent parliamentary elections. Voters can vote in person at polling stations on election day, open from 10:30 am to 12:00 pm. To receive a ballot, voters must present their voting card, which is delivered by post to all voters and contains their personal data and a barcode. At the time of voting, voters are checked against a central voter register, which prevents the possibility of multiple voting. While the ODIHR NAM was informed that all voting locations are accessible for wheelchair access, no other accessibility measures to facilitate independent voting of persons with disabilities are in place.

Postal voting is available from two weeks before the election until two days prior, without a need to provide justification.¹² Voting by post was introduced in 2004, and in recent parliamentary elections, most voters chose this voting method.¹³ ODIHR NAM interlocutors lauded postal voting as an effective voting method and did not express any secrecy-related concerns. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised a concern that in 2021, several postal ballots were invalidated due to missing voters' signatures on the voting card, despite existing instructions, indicating that voter information in this respect could be strengthened..

D. VOTER REGISTRATION

The right to vote is granted to citizens over 18 years of age with permanent residence for at least one month before the election day. Those temporarily abroad who retain in-country residence, including students abroad or accommodated at a foreign medical facility, can request voting materials to be mailed to them by the communes. Citizens who are declared incapable of judgment for elections and referendums by a court decision or convicted and sentenced to at least one year of unconditional imprisonment for specified criminal offences or more than five years for any intentional crime. ODIHR has consistently noted that disenfranchisement based on any disabilities is contrary to international obligations and standards.¹⁴

¹¹ The system used, <u>SESAM Wahlen Proporz</u>, is developed and maintained by a Swiss company.

¹² Ballot papers and voting materials are sent to all voters along with their voting cards.

¹³ In the 2021 parliamentary elections, 97.34 per cent of voters voted by post.

¹⁴ Articles 12 and 29 of the 2006 <u>UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD)</u> stipulate that the "state Parties shall recognize that persons with disabilities enjoy legal capacity on an equal basis with others in all aspects of life" and ensure their "right and opportunity [...] to vote and be elected". Paragraph 48 of the <u>2014 General Comment 1</u> to Article 12 of the CRPD states that "a person's decision-making ability cannot be a justification for any exclusion of persons with disabilities from exercising [...] the right to vote [and] the right to stand for election".

A total of 21,118 voters were eligible to vote as of 13 November. Voter lists are created based on the information extracted by communes from the permanent population register. The lists were available for public check from 7 to 9 January 2025. Voters are entitled to check their data and can appeal undue inclusion or exclusion to the communes. Voters can be included on the voter list on election day by the ComEC if their omission was an obvious mistake. In general, the ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed confidence in the accuracy of the voter register.

E. CANDIDATE REGISTRATION

All eligible voters have the right to stand as candidates. The right to nominate a candidate list is granted to electoral groups established by a minimum of 30 voters from the same constituency. As prescribed by law, at the time of calling elections, the Government Chancellery announced that the official period for submitting candidate lists was from 22 November until 6 December.

A voter could sign in support of only one list, which is at odds with international good practice.¹⁵ Data of voters who signed in support of a list is verified by communes. Voters can withdraw their support but are then not allowed to sign in support of another list. In case some signatures are disqualified, a contestant is given two days to re-submit missing signatures. All ODIHR NAM interlocutors described the candidate registration process as inclusive.

By law, the number of nominated candidates per list can range from 1 to 15 in the Upper Country and 1 to 10 in the Lower Country. At the time of the NAM, the four parliamentary parties had declared their intention to stand in these elections, and some were actively promoting their candidates. There are no legally established mechanisms to increase women's political participation or internal party policies for gender quotas on the candidate lists.¹⁶ Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors remarked on a general challenge in identifying suitable candidates, especially among women, and the main political parties noted that less than a third of their candidates will be women.¹⁷

F. CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE

The conduct of the election campaign is largely unregulated, and political parties can campaign at any time. Contestants mostly campaign through newspapers, online media and social networks and, to some extent, in broadcast media. Direct canvassing is not used, and meetings with voters are usually held on a small scale. Following the longstanding practice, the main political parties have announced their candidates for the post of prime minister and other cabinet members, who also actively participate in the campaign despite not standing in the elections. According to the ODIHR NAM interlocutors the main campaign issues are gravitating around health care, traffic, the environment and cost of living.

¹⁵ Paragraph 3 of the <u>1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document</u> states that the OSCE participating States "recognize the importance of pluralism with regard to political organizations." Paragraph 196 of the <u>2020 ODIHR and Venice Commission Guidelines on Political Party Regulation</u>, second edition, states, "a requirement that a citizen be allowed to sign in support of only one party should be avoided, as such a regulation would affect [their] right to freedom of association and could easily disqualify parties despite their attempts in good faith to fulfil this requirement."

¹⁶ In August 2020, a referendum was held to amend the constitution with a provision mandating a "balanced representation of women and men in political bodies", but it was rejected with 79 per cent of the votes.

¹⁷ The part-time nature of the post as a member of the parliament and suspension of certain social security schemes were also named as some of the reasons.

Parties intend to actively use Facebook and Instagram and to a lesser extent LinkedIn, YouTube and other social networks.¹⁸ The ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not express significant concerns over the use of intolerant language or disinformation on social networks, but some noted that voters continue to rely on traditional media for accurate political information.

Political party financing is regulated by the 1984 Law on Payment of Contributions to Political Parties (LPCPP, last amended 2023). This law was significantly amended in 2019 to include a requirement for parties to register as a legal entity to become eligible for public funds, publication of audited annual financial statements by parties, oversight of party financial reporting by the Government's Office of Finance and introduce a ban on anonymous donations over CHF 300 and a wide range of sanctions.¹⁹ While most ODIHR NAM interlocutors agreed that the regulatory scope related to campaign financing remains sparse, they were also of the opinion that introducing more stringent regulations would be counter-productive, given the limited financial resources with which political parties operate.

Political parties are financed through public and private funds. Public funding is available to parliamentary political parties and to those that received at least three per cent of the votes in each constituency in the previous parliamentary elections. An amendment on 5 December 2023 increased the annual state contribution per party from CHF 55,000 to CHF 80,000. Additionally, parliamentary parties receive a total of CHF 710,000 annually, distributed proportionally based on the number of votes they received in the last elections. Legal entities and individuals can also make donations without any limits, and contributions from foreign sources are not regulated. Political parties receiving state financial support are required to establish formal guidelines or rules detailing the handling and management of donations.²⁰

Contestants are not subject to limits on campaign expenditures. Annual financial statements, including summaries of various types of funding and expenditures, must be submitted to the Government's Office of Finance by 31 August of the following year. The Office has the authority to commission an independent auditing company to review these financial statements. In cases of violations, the Office may impose fines of up to CHF 50,000, suspend public funding, or, in cases of severe violations, sentence offenders to up to six months of imprisonment.

G. MEDIA

The media are regulated by numerous acts, including the Constitution, the 1999 Information Act, the 2005 Media Act and the 2006 Law on Funding of the Media.²¹ The Media Act applies to broadcast, print and online media, but it does not regulate any aspects of media activity over social networks.

The country's constitution guarantees freedom of the press, and this right is respected in practice, but the limited range of domestic media options poses challenges to diverse public discourse on the local

¹⁸ According to <u>Dataportal</u>, as of January 2024, Liechtenstein had approximately 11,000 active social media users, representing 27.7 per cent of the total population.

¹⁹ 1 CHF equals approximately EUR 0.93.

²⁰ These internal regulations include information under which conditions donations can be accepted and how the party plans to disclose the information on donations. The party is legally obliged to post the internal regulations on the Internet.

²¹ In 2020 Liechtenstein started to implement <u>Directive (EU) 2018/1808 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 14 November 2018</u>, amending <u>Directive 2010/13/EU</u> on the coordination of certain provisions laid down by law, regulation or administrative action in Member States concerning the provision of audiovisual media services (Audiovisual Media Services Directive).

level. The residents also consume media content from the neighbouring countries, which offers them a broader range of perspectives and coverage.

Broadcast media include the public Radio Liechtenstein and the private TV channel 1FLTV, which has been broadcasting daily programs since 2008.²² In October 2024, a referendum resulted in the repeal of the 2003 Broadcasting Act, which regulated Radio Liechtenstein as a state-owned and state-funded corporation.²³ Most ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that this development has significant implications for media funding and the future of public broadcasting. While some interlocutors emphasized the importance of fair competition in the media landscape and supported the change, others expressed concerns that it could further reduce the availability of locally relevant media content. ODIHR NAM was informed that the radio's management was tasked with proposing a transition plan to the government to operate as a private entity while retaining a level of state funding.

Until 2023, the print media sector in Liechtenstein had two daily newspapers, the *Liechtensteiner Volksblatt* and the *Liechtensteiner Vaterland*. However, the *Volksblatt* ceased operations due to economic constraints, leaving the *Vaterland* as the sole daily, thus further limiting the space for political information and debate. According to some ODIHR NAM interlocutors, the closure of *Volksblatt* led to a disbalance between the two main political parties in terms of media access due to the partisan ownership structure.²⁴ The ODIHR NAM was informed that in February 2024, the *Vaterland* introduced a new statute to stipulate the independence of its editorial board, but some still see it as politically biased.

According to the ODIHR NAM interlocutors, *IFL TV* and *Liechtensteiner Vaterland* plan to cover the campaign extensively, including through the presentation of candidates and debates.

H. ELECTORAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION

The CPRA provides the possibility to appeal voter and candidate registration decisions. If a complainant believes that fundamental rights were violated, an appeal can also be lodged to the State (Constitutional) Court, after exhausting all other instances.

Complaints regarding the voter lists can be filed with the Government and then appealed to the Administrative Court and the State (Constitutional) Court as the final instance.²⁵ The law does not offer clear guidance on how other complaints, including those related to the campaign, voting and counting procedures and the work of election commissions, should be handled.

Appeals of the election results can be submitted to the government within three days after elections, and furthered appeal within an additional five days, which is immediately forwarded to the State (Constitutional) Court.²⁶ The Court has the authority to invalidate the election results if the identified irregularities had or could have had a significant impact on the outcome. ODIHR NAM interlocutors

²² In addition, the government operates a state television *Landeskanal* broadcasting government proceedings and public affairs programming, and each commune operates its own general information channel.

²³ A total of 55.4 per cent of voters supported the measure.

²⁴ *Volksblatt* was owned by the PCP, while the *Vaterland* continues to be owned by the PU.

²⁵ The State (Constitutional) Court consists of five judges elected by the parliament and appointed by the Prince. Judges serve a five-year term, and there is a system where typically one judge is replaced annually. The State (Constitutional) Court judges work part-time; however, the Court informed the ODIHR NAM that a reform is underway to make judges' positions full-time.

²⁶ By law, an electoral complaint has to be notified to the government within three days after the election, and the complaint with the statement of grounds has to be submitted within a further five days to the government. The government has to transmit the complaint with the file immediately to the Supreme (Constitutional) Court.

did not raise concerns over the complaints and appeals system in place and underlined that in the last two decades, no election-related complaints were lodged.

I. ELECTION OBSERVATION

The legislation does not contain explicit provisions for election observation and is, therefore, challenging paragraph 8 of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document.²⁷ However, government regulations stipulate that the national and international observers must be granted access during the preparatory stages, throughout the voting process, including verification of postal ballots, counting of votes and the announcement of results. While the regulations do not specify an accreditation process, the Government Chancellery noted to the ODIHR NAM that OSCE observers would be welcome. None of the ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed an intention to observe the election process.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the electoral process and the ability of the election administration to conduct election procedures, and the vote count professionally and reliably. They also underlined that there have been no changes in the election law since the 2021 parliamentary elections. Most of the ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not see a significant added value in an external observation and assessment of the upcoming elections, and no concerns were expressed relating to the respect for fundamental freedoms, voter registration, candidate registration, the electoral campaign, election dispute resolution and election day procedures. Some interlocutors stated divergent views on the need to reform the electoral system for future elections and which direction to take to ensure the highest levels of proportional representation. While it is up to Parliament to decide on the appropriate course, ODIHR encourages the authorities to conduct a timely, comprehensive and inclusive review in case they wish to engage in such reform.

Based on this, the ODIHR NAM does not recommend deploying any election-related activity for the 9 February parliamentary elections. ODIHR stands ready to assist the Principality of Liechtenstein in any future electoral reform and encourages the authorities to consider issues of concern raised in this and previous reports.

²⁷

Paragraph 8 of the <u>1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document</u> states that "participating States consider the presence of observers, both foreign and domestic, can enhance the electoral process for States in which elections are taking place. They therefore invite observers from any other CSCE participating States and any appropriate private institutions and organizations who may wish to do so to observe the course of their national election proceedings, to the extent permitted by law."

ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS

Government Chancellery

Peter Sele, Deputy Head of the Government Chancellery/Head of Chancellery Services

Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Ambassador Martin Frick, Director of the Office for Foreign Affairs

Ministry of Home Affairs

Alexandre Müller, Senior Advisor to the Minister of Home Affairs, Economy and Environment

Office of Finance

Andreas Gritsch, Head of the Financial Affairs Unit Martina Rohner, Office of Finance

Office for Communication

Rainer Schnepfleitner, Head of Office, Office for Communications Severin Näscher, Office for Communications

State (Constitutional) Court

Christian Ritter, Vice President

Election Administration

Felix Beck, Chairperson Main Election Commission/Upper Country Elmar Gangl, Chairperson Main Election Commission/Lower Country Daniel Hilti, Head of Schaan Commune and Chairperson of Schaan Election Commission Christian Öhri, Head of Ruggell Commune and Chairperson of Ruggell Election Commission

Political Parties

Georg Kaufmann, Free List Thomas Zwiefelhofer, President, Patriotic Union Alexander Batliner, President, Progressive Citizen's Party

<u>Media</u>

Patrik Schädler, Liechtensteiner Vaterland, Editor in Chief

Civil Society Organizations

Christian Blank, National Human Rights Office Wilfried Marxer, National Human Rights Office Christine Schädler, Organisation for the Rights of People with Disabilities Lena Klein, Youth Council Thomas Milic, Lead Political Researcher, Liechtenstein Institute Andrea Hoch, Women's Network, Project Manager of Diversity in Politics

International Community²⁸

Representatives of diplomatic missions of Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom and the United States.

²⁸ The ODIHR NAM extended an invitation to representations of all OSCE participating States resident in Liechtenstein.