



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe**

**Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and  
Environmental Activities**

**Vienna, 19 April 2004**

To: All OSCE Delegations  
Partners for Co-operation  
Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation

Subject: Third Preparatory Seminar for the Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum:  
“Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”

Attached herewith is a document consisting of the Consolidated Summary of the Third Preparatory Seminar for the Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum: “Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”, which took place in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, 29-30 March 2004.



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe**

**Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic  
and Environmental Activities**

**Vienna, 19 April 2004**

## CONSOLIDATED SUMMARY

THIRD PREPARATORY SEMINAR FOR THE TWELFTH OSCE ECONOMIC FORUM:  
PROFESSIONAL SKILLS NEEDED FOR DEVELOPING A MARKET ECONOMY

*BISHKEK, KYRGYZSTAN, 29-30 MARCH 2004*

## TABLE OF CONTENT

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF THE SEMINAR.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>OPENING PLENARY SESSION</b>	
Welcoming address by H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan.....	6
Welcoming address by Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria, OSCE Chairmanship .....	8
Welcoming remarks by Ambassador Markus Müller, Head of the OSCE Center in Bishkek.....	10
Keynote Address by Prof. Dr. Suleiman I. Cohen, Netherlands School of Economics, Erasmus University Rotterdam.....	12
Welcoming remarks by Mr. Marcin Świącicki, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities.....	18
<b>CLOSING SESSION</b>	
<b>Rapporteurs' summaries of the working sessions</b>	
<b>Working Session 1 - Training of public administration staff.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Working Session 2 - Training of academic professionals and students.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>Working Session 3 - Business related training.....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>Working Session 4 - Education for Sustainable Development.....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Working Session 5 - Employment related training and development of the young generation.....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>Closing Remarks</b>	
Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria, OSCE Chairmanship.....	33
Mr. Marcin Świącicki, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities.....	34
<b>ANNEXES :</b>	
ANNEX 1 : Introductory Note.....	37
ANNEX 2: Agenda.....	41
ANNEX 3: List of Participants.....	45
ANNEX 4: List of Distributed Documents.....	58

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### **Introduction**

The Third Preparatory Seminar for the 12<sup>th</sup> OSCE Economic Forum was held on 29-30 March 2004 in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan. The topic of the seminar was “Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”.

This seminar was the last in a series of three preparatory seminars for this year’s Economic Forum (“New Challenges for Building up Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic Development and Co-operation”, Prague, 31 May – 4 June 2004). The first seminar took place in Yerevan, Armenia, on 17-18 November 2003 and focused on supporting SME development. The second preparatory seminar was organized in Dublin, Ireland, on 16-17 February 2004 and focused on stimulating foreign and domestic investment.

The event was organised by the Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities (OCEEA) in close co-operation with the Bulgarian Chairmanship of the OSCE and in collaboration with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Kyrgyzstan.

The seminar was opened by H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister of Kyrgyzstan. Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria, Ambassador Markus Müller, Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek, Mr. Marcin Swiecicki, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, and Professor Solomon Cohen from the Erasmus University, (keynote speaker) also addressed the seminar during the opening session.. Their interventions are included in the Consolidated Summary.

Over 180 participants, official representatives from 29 OSCE participating States, numerous International and Non-Governmental Organizations, 14 OSCE Field Offices, as well as academic and business community representatives attended the seminar and engaged in discussions.

29 speakers, experts from OSCE participating States, International Organisations and NGOs, business and academic community, presented their inside knowledge and their views thereby stimulating the discussion. Throughout the deliberations all the participants freely expressed their views and contributed to formulating concrete suggestions for further consideration by the OSCE Economic Forum in Prague.

Numerous documents and presentations have been circulated. A list of these documents is included as an annex in the Consolidated Summary. The documents will be published on a CD-Rom available upon request from the OCEEA

### **Structure and objectives of the Seminar.**

The seminar consisted of both plenary sessions (opening and closing) and five working sessions. The working sessions were dedicated to the following topics:

- Training of public administration staff - Working Session I  
Session one tried to identify ways and means for strengthening and developing the professional skills of civil servants dealing with economic, financial, legal and fiscal issues in ministries and other public institutions on central and municipal level as well as in regions away from the capitals and main cities.
- Training of academic professionals and students - Working Session II  
Session two analyzed the strengths and weaknesses of the higher education system and administration in economic and business related disciplines and tried to identify ways and means to improve the access to information, strengthen international co-operation of higher learning institutions, expand the exchange programmes, increase the private sector involvement in shaping and developing education curricula and training programmes, etc.
- Business related training - Working Session III  
Session three focused on specific training needed to improve corporate governance in the field of corporate finance and auditing practises, business ethics and codes of conduct as well as on training and educational needs of entrepreneurs and SMEs.

- **Education for Sustainable Development - Working Session IV**

Session four focused on identifying ways and means to help the public understand the connections between environmental, social, economic and security concerns, on possible OSCE involvement in a regional strategy for promoting education for sustainable development, the use of the Aarhus convention to improve the access to information about environmental issues, etc.

- **Employment related training and development of the young generation - Working Session V**

Session five tried to identify ways and means to support the young generation with regard to the requirements of, and entrance into the labour market, to promote entrepreneurship, to counter the 'brain drain' of trained young professionals, etc.

The overview of the discussions and the recommendations were presented by the rapporteurs in the closing plenary session. Rapporteurs' Reports are included in the Consolidated Summary.

### **Recommendations**

This seminar has accomplished its main goal of putting forward useful recommendations regarding professional skills needed for developing a market economy. These recommendations provide valuable input for further discussion and consideration by OSCE participating States in the Economic Forum in 2004.

The list of conclusions and recommendations for the OSCE/OCEEA and the OSCE participating States, presented below, summarizes those from the Rapporteurs' Reports.

It is envisaged that the next Sub-Committee discusses the suggestions included in the Consolidated Summary, in order to streamline the preparatory process for the Forum.

### **Training of public administration staff - Working Session I**

- Civil service needs to be based on an adequate legal base : OSCE can provide legal advice;
- Training on both technical and institutional skills required;
- Training of civil servants involved in privatisation of state property;
- Co-ordination and exchange of information between countries at different stages of development;
- Co-ordination of donor activities;
- Develop incentive systems rewarding good performance;
- Representation of ethnic minorities in administration;
- Elaboration of international standards for education suggested;
- Twinning and international exchanges of civil servants.

### **Training of academic professionals and students - Working Session II**

- Promote systematic cooperation of international donor organisations and Central Asian governments and ministries of science and education on comprehensive educational reform, including vocation-technical and university curriculum and pedagogy, regional and international mutual recognition of programmes and degrees, and promotion of universities as centres of research and scholarship;
- Provide assistance to governments in revising and modernising their educational laws to support systemic educational modernisation, and promote equal development opportunity, access to financial resources, and marketplace viability for private and public higher educational institutions;
- Assist the establishment of and access to an international electronic library as part of a concerted effort to expanded electronic modes of learning, scholarship and Internet access throughout the educational system;
- Provide expertise and financial assistance to regional and international accreditation standards in the context of the Bologna Process on Higher Education and the needs of the marketplace for high quality educational outcomes;
- Assist governments to implement equal educational access to all economic classes, women, national minorities and all educationally at-risk peoples.

### **Business related training - Working Session III**

- Ensure the correlation between training/education and the needs of the job market;
- Vocational training : balance between classroom and “on-the-job”;
- Extend entrepreneurship training to formal academic sector, including scientists and engineers;
- The important role of the media as a contributor to market reform : training of journalists;
- The important role of consulting services with which donors should not compete by providing free services (some exceptions) - Possibilities of training;
- Efficient training must be adapted to local operating conditions;
- Donor coordination or competition ?

### **Education for Sustainable Development - Working Session IV**

1. What can the OSCE do?
  - Use developed structures to introduce and promote activities related to sustainable development and to disseminate best practice as defined by the UNECE Strategy for Education on Sustainable Development;
  - Promote activities that result in informational material and text books written in the local language on the subject of sustainable development. Projects such as “The Green Pack” and similar educational packages should be supported;
  - Promote the implementation of the Aarhus Convention, for example, by establishing Public Information Centres;
2. What can the participating states do?
  - Support activities related to education for sustainable development;
3. What can other international organisations do?
  - Promote regional co-operation in education for sustainable development and continue to encourage dialogue between organisations.

### **Employment related training and development of the young generation - Working Session V**

- Education of the young generation must remain a priority for all states of the region;
- Encourage and promote a clear link between education and the labour market;
- Encourage the development of a more pro-active education system;
- Services, such as tourism, provide an important sphere of activity for the youth;
- Counter the “brain-drain” in cooperation with governments, academia, NGOs and international organizations by developing fresh initiatives.

### **Annexes**

A number of annexes has been attached to complete your picture of the Third Preparatory Seminar. For further reading, please note that background documents from this seminar can be found on the OSCE web site under [www.osce.org/eea](http://www.osce.org/eea) or requested at the Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities ([gabriel.leonte@osce.org](mailto:gabriel.leonte@osce.org) or [andrea.gredler@osce.org](mailto:andrea.gredler@osce.org)).

## **WELCOMING ADDRESS**

**by H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev,  
Deputy Prime Minister of Kyrgyzstan**

Dear participants of the seminar!  
Ladies and gentlemen!

I appreciate your invitation and I would like to stress that in the run-up to the 12<sup>th</sup> OSCE Economic Forum in Prague of the 31<sup>st</sup> of May to the 4<sup>th</sup> of June, 2004, today's seminar - Human resources for market economy development, - is useful to prepare concrete recommendations for further effective development of market economy, including in the Kyrgyz Republic.

The problems which will be discussed during the seminar, as reflected in the program, refer to raising the qualification level of higher and professional education in social, academic and private sectors, the importance of learning of such disciplines as economics, finance, management, business practice for successful promotion of reforms and the special role of managers in realization of market transformations.

As you know, the main aim of Kyrgyzstan is the reduction of poverty through achieving steady economic growth. The Comprehensive Development Framework (CDF) 'Kyrgyzstan – 2010' was designed to achieve this goal and was prepared by the entire civil society.

CDF is a long-term strategy. Its realization will provide a systematic division of tasks, will lead to dynamic developments within state and society, in political, social and economic spheres. This challenge is based on effective use of human, economic and natural potential in national development. It can be realized through an active partnership and participation of Government, private sector and civil society in co-operation with the international community.

As it was mentioned by H.E. Mr. A. Akaev, the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, during the 58<sup>th</sup> Session of UN General Assembly, 'every country has her own specific tasks besides those it has in common with the international community. Kyrgyzstan tries to solve them with its own forces. The President of the Kyrgyz Republic proclaimed the idea that 'Kyrgyzstan is a country of human rights'. The Democratic Code was worked out and the Social Council of Democratic Security was founded to develop this idea. As a result of a Referendum the New Edition of the Constitution was adopted. It demonstrates the achieved level of democratic development and incorporates new tasks to be further implemented. These measures greatly stimulated the progressive advancement of the country along the democratic path.

Establishment of the principles of transparent, responsible and diligent governance is of great importance in the Kyrgyz Republic. The National Council On Diligent Governance was founded in 2003 to improve the work on a number of matters such as: effectiveness and transparency of governance; new concepts of transparent human resource policy based on the respect of human dignity, equity and justice; quality control of state and local governance; evaluation of the transparency of state regulation; analysis of the effectiveness of normative legal acts preventing corruption; preparation of proposals to improve legal regulation preventing corruption and the legalization of non-official economy. Human resources of the country play a special role in addressing these vital problems.

Dear participants of the seminar!

I would especially like to stress the necessity of the formation of competent and prepared specialists for the different sectors of market economy. As it is known, highly qualified human capital is instrumental for inducing positive dynamic developments in both public and private institutions. Specialists in marketing, financial analysis, corporate relationship, legal problems of market, stock market and also professionals in preparation and implementation of business projects, analysts and highly qualified consultants in basic directions of market reforms – are greatly needed.

I would like to dwell on several priority directions for Kyrgyzstan's development. As you know, the efforts of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic are directed toward the promotion the most modern trends of global technico-scientific progress within the Kyrgyz society. The number of universities in Kyrgyzstan increased from 9 to 40 during the last ten years. The number of graduating students from IT and high technologies faculties increased 2.5 times. Kyrgyzstan is on the first place among former Soviet states with regard to the ratio of Internet access per capita. The scientific-educational computer network in the Republic, called 'Virtual Silk Route', supplies free and high-speed access to informational resources of the Internet.

The development of a modern system of education is an important premise for the successful entrance of Kyrgyzstan into the civilized world.

The issues which will be discussed in this seminar are very important for our Republic. I am sure that the participants of the seminar will address a wide range of questions and problems regarding human resource policy for effective promotion of market reforms.

Dear participants of the seminar!

During the transition to a market economy, the preparation and availability of highly qualified human resources, particularly among the youth, is very important, as they will become leaders in promoting and successfully implementing market reforms. For instance, in our Republic we understand the important role of an effective human resource policy for developing and implementing legal reforms and structural transformations in order to achieve an improvement of governance at all levels. This will stimulate economic growth by active attraction of investments and development of external trade.

Liberalization of external trade and lowering government interference in favor of free market became essential policies of economic reforms in Kyrgyzstan. The Kyrgyz Republic developed trade-economic relations with 100 states of the World Trade Community. The Republic has also developed financial systems and governmental and non-governmental organizations supporting small and medium business. Consulting organizations make scientific investigations on investment activity, prepare investment projects, carry out technical, technological, legal, financial analysis of projects, marketing investigations, etc.

The problem of human resources for development of market economy and the issue of economic education of the population are important components for development of democratic institutions and successful promotion of economic reforms in the countries with transitional economy.

Discussion of these questions during the seminar will give additional impulse for effective decisions regarding problems related to human resource necessary for developing a market economy.

Dear participants of the seminar!

Concluding my speech, I would like to express once more my appreciation to the organizers of the seminar, to thank them for the invitation and to wish successful work to all participants of the seminar, interesting discussions and a pleasant stay in Kyrgyzstan.

Thank You for attention.



## **WELCOMING ADDRESS**

**by Ambassador Ivan Naydenov,  
Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate,  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria  
OSCE Chairmanship**

Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman,  
Mr. Deputy Prime Minister,  
Ladies and Gentlemen,

It is an honour and privilege for me to address participants in the seminar on “Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”. We are particularly pleased that this event takes place in Kyrgyzstan where profound economic reforms have been implemented over the last years. May I commend the Government of Kyrgyzstan for taking the initiative to host this event. I wish to note with high appreciation the participation of H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister of Kyrgyzstan, to whom we are also grateful for his remarkable contribution to the previous Preparatory Seminar in Dublin last February. Allow me to thank the Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities and the OSCE Centre in Bishkek for their valuable input in the preparation of the seminar.

The 11<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Ministerial Council of the OSCE, held in Maastricht, the Netherlands, on 1 and 2 December 2003 underscored the increasing importance of the economic and environmental dimension within the OSCE concept of comprehensive and co-operative security. The Ministerial Council adopted the OSCE Strategy Document for the Economic and Environmental Dimension which sets priorities and re-enforces the framework for policies and activities designed to enhance economic performance in the participating States and foster economic co-operation in the OSCE area. The Strategy Document defines the Economic Forum as the major annual event of the OSCE economic and environmental dimension and insists on better targeting of its theme on issues of common concern.

The 12th Meeting of the OSCE Economic Forum to be held in Prague from 31 May to 4 June, will consider the new challenges for building up institutional and human capacity for economic development and co-operation. The Bulgarian Chairmanship promotes this theme for the Forum because we regard viable market economy institutions and adequate human resources as essential factors for successful economic transition, regional security and co-operation. We also believe that more efforts should be exerted to strengthen national institutions and further develop human capacity across the OSCE region.

The Bishkek Seminar is the final one in a series of three preparatory seminars leading up to the OSCE Economic Forum in Prague. Previous seminars in Yerevan and Dublin dealt with developing small and medium-sized enterprises and stimulating foreign and domestic investments. The topic of the Bishkek seminar, as part of the general theme of the forthcoming Economic Forum, is related to the issues of education and building human capital with a view to establishing strong public and private institutions, enhancing sustainable development and promoting economic co-operation.

The main goals of the Seminar will be to reveal strengths and weaknesses of the education and training systems in economic and business related disciplines in the various sub-regions of the OSCE, to facilitate dialogue between governments, universities, international organizations, business sector and NGOs, to share expertise on educational programs for the purposes of sustainable development and to prepare proposals that the OSCE bodies could further consider and transform into concrete recommendations and follow-up measures.

The Bulgarian Chairmanship of the OSCE attaches particular significance to the theme of the Bishkek seminar because we have identified education as one of our main priorities in 2004. We believe that education is a major tool for setting up democratic institutions, securing democratic governance, generating respect for human rights and raising human resources for successful market economies. Our Chairmanship strives to mobilize every resource and effort available to promote education and training activities in the OSCE area.

I would use this opportunity to draw your attention to the high level conference, entitled "Education as an investment into the Future", to be held in Tashkent, Uzbekistan, on 5 April 2004. The conference will be opened by the Chairman-in-Office, Minister Passy, and will bring together Central Asian Ministers of Education and international organisations engaged in the region, including international financial institutions and development agencies, as well as research institutes from within and outside the region.

The Maastricht Strategy Document for the Economic and Environmental Dimension clearly states that "human resources are an essential factor for economic growth and development, which require knowledge and skills, *inter alia* in economic, administrative, legal and scientific matters". Participating States committed themselves to take appropriate measures to promote education and training and increase international co-operation in these areas. In order to provide assistance to participating States on the implementation of their commitments, the OSCE Secretariat, OSCE Institutions and field presences in co-operation with other relevant international institutions shall elaborate and arrange programs and projects on training national, regional and local administrations, academics, business communities and NGOs.

In line with these commitments, the Bishkek Seminar and then the Economic Forum will also consider ways through which the OSCE can contribute to intensification of educational exchanges, especially in economic disciplines.

Mr. Chairman,

The economic and social developments in the OSCE area over the last decade have increasingly underlined the need of well-trained human resources. One of the main prerequisites for successful structural reforms of economies in many participating States is achieving a substantial improvement of quality of education and training of professionals to enable them to more efficiently participate in the policy-making process, successfully manage public institutions and private enterprises or reasonably take the risk of their own business.

The OSCE and its field presences have accumulated valuable experience in economic and business education and training with a view to foster economic development and stability. I wish to specifically commend the OSCE Centre in Bishkek for its recent workshop, in co-operation with the Woman Congress of Kyrgyzstan, on training in basic entrepreneurial and practical skills in Kara Balta District, Kyrgyzstan, the OSCE Centre in Tashkent for its series of workshops on entrepreneurial training for youth in Uzbekistan, to name only few recent initiatives. My expectations are that the field missions will continue to propose and implement more new projects on economic and business education and training.

The European Union, UNESCO, UNDP, ILO, OECD, the Council of Europe, BSEC, WB, EBRD, USAID, the Open Society Institute, the Eurasia Foundation, other international and regional organizations and bodies in the OSCE area also attribute priority to economic education and entrepreneurial training. The seminar provides a good opportunity to learn what other organizations are doing in building up human capacity for economic development, assess the results of the OSCE interaction with them and recommend further steps to develop synergies.

The OSCE has immense political potential for enhancing awareness and mobilizing resources for more active involvement of local administrations, governments or international organizations. The Organization has shown that it can also facilitate contacts and interaction between civil society, entrepreneurs and public authorities. With 18 field presences situated across its vast area the OSCE can accurately assess the assistance needed and be helpful in initiating programs and projects on business education and entrepreneurial training particularly for vulnerable population groups and disadvantaged areas.

Mr. Chairman,

I believe the significant theme of the Conference and the high level participation will ensure fruitful discussions and, I have no doubt, a successful outcome.

Thank you for your attention!

## WELCOMING REMARKS

by Ambassador Markus Müller, Head of the OSCE Center in Bishkek.

Dear Ladies and Gentlemen, dear colleagues and dear friends,

On behalf of the OSCE Center in Bishkek it is a pleasure to welcome you for the 3 preparatory seminar in the context of this years Economic Forum.

The topic of our work: “Professional Skills needed for developing a market economy” is of burning actuality mainly for transition countries who have engaged themselves over the last decade in a process of drastic economic, social and political reforms. The Bulgarian chairmanship has rightly chosen education as the main working topic of this year.

Whereas the gigantic collapse of the Soviet economic system had immediate, real and painful consequences in the live of peope, the simultaneous collapse of the social system (including the education system) could be qualified as the invisible catastrophe. Not only was the dimension of the silent collapse of the education systems of most of the transition countries for a long time underestimated and hardly addressed as a priority in the international bilateral and multilateral assistance programs; the necessary reform of the education sector is still considered a second priority in many countries and seem to suffer from a kind of Disney syndrome. You have all seen these comics where the heroes are chased over some precipice and continue running as if they had still ground under their feet. And only much later the illusion is gone and Newton’s law of the free fall come into effect.

These illusions are illustrated in many of the transition countries (an other countries of course as well) by the following problems:

- a) Poor quality and quality control: Access to education institutions and qualifications, marks, degrees are given on the basis of other than performance criteria.
- b) Poor relation between the supply side of education and demand of the job markets: in the case of Kyrgyzstan there is e.g. an oversupply of medical doctors and a shortage of accountants, financial managers, English teachers, computer specialists etc.
- c) Extreme imbalance between higher education and vocational training: an explosive growth of higher education institutions can be e.g in Kyrgyzstan. The number of higher education institutions has more than tripled over the last five years and the number of students in this institutions has grown from 65’000 to 159’000. Vocational training has in the same period got hardly any attention and also funding.
- d) Deterioration of academic quality:as a result poor salary conditions, emigration of highly qualified staff and inflation in the number of institutions.
- e) Deterioration of th quality of primary school education mainly in the rural areas:as a result of insufficient funding, lack of qualified teachers, lack of schoolbooks etc.

How to address this Disney syndrome in the education sector? Our seminar will of course work on some concrete proposals and recommendations.

In my presentation I would like to make one main point and formulate it as a question:

**Should we not try to introduce in the education systems some kind of international ISO standards, which would define minimum requirements of an education system, identifying clear and measurable quality indicators**

which could internationally be monitored?

Defining quality standards for the education system and doing regular conformity assessments (as this is done with respect to the ISO standardization for products, trade, business procedures, services etc.) would

allow public and private decision makers in the education sector to get a clear and internationally comparable assessment of the shortcomings and main issues to be addressed in their reforms avoiding the above described free fall to reality.

Dear ladies and gentlemen, the world famous book of Bocaccio called the Decameron (Pasolini made a very fine film about it) is a collection of stories told by young noblemen who went in the time of the great pest to the mountains of the Tuscany and told these stories collected then in the world famous book. Similar to our meeting here in Bishkek, kind of. We might not be able to write a book like the Decameron on the basis of our discussions. But if we manage to formulate on the basis of our discussions some good practical recommendations relevant in the real world the goal of our meeting is achieved.

Thank you for your attention

MM28/3/04

## KEYNOTE ADDRESS

by Prof. dr. Suleiman I. Cohen,  
Netherlands School of Economics,  
Erasmus University Rotterdam

### INSTITUTIONAL SKILLS FOR SUCCESSFUL TRANSITION: STRATEGY AND DESIGN<sup>1</sup>

#### I. Introduction

The ingredients for transition are now known to be stabilisation, liberalisation, privatisation, appropriate institutions, and professional skills to run these newly introduced institutions. There are many examples of institutional failures in transition economies that are due to shortages of institutional skills. The emphasis is on institutional skills (IS) that are new to the transition settings, in contrast to technological skills which are relatively more available and whose contents are generally invariable of the economic system. For example, the work and qualifications of the mechanical engineer or medical doctor that existed before transition are basically the same today. The situation is different with institutional skills. There are now institutions relating to business, markets, laws and governance. For these you need business managers, accountants, lawyers, public administrators, etc. You cannot create institutions without having the right institutional skills to run them.

It is usual to make a distinction between A and B categories of IS, the A is more fundamentally and professionally oriented and requires a university degree of some 4 to 6 years, the B is practically oriented towards occupational specifics and requires tertiary education of 1 to 3 years. Examples: a degree in accountancy versus a diploma in bookkeeping. Another example: an MBA executive versus an account manager.

This short paper elaborates on six major decisions that policy makers in transitional contexts face as regards initiating and strengthening their professional capacities in institutional skills. All countries worldwide face these decisions regularly, and there are some emerging tendencies and patterns in university education of general validity. Where applicable, I shall mention some of these. Policy makers in decentralizing countries need to consider these tendencies in developing a long-term perspective strategy towards sustainable human resource development.

#### II. Major IS policy decisions in the transitional context

Strategies and designs for satisfying the governmental and market needs of IS have to make choices with respect to six issues.

(1) What are the institutional skills to focus on? These are closely linked to the newly introduced institutions, and would cover economics and business, trade and finance, management and administration, accounting and auditing, and law and sustainability in the wider sense. The role and functions of the state are otherwise in a mixed market-state economy and this requires new administrative, fiscal and auditing institutions that in turn need public administrators, fiscal economists and auditors to run these institutions. These categories coincide closely with the working sessions in this conference.

(2) Which IS orientation to follow? Because transition countries are starting from square one the building of IS capacity has to rely by necessity on external assistance from countries with established IS. There is a choice dilemma here. For example, even though there is one management science, one can speak of American, European, Japanese and Chinese orientations. Accountancy practices in America and Europe

---

<sup>1</sup> Content of keynote address, Seminar on Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy, to be held at Bishkek, 29-30 March 2004. Seminar is within the framework of the preparatory process leading to the Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) 12th Annual Economic Forum in Prague, to take place from 31 May to 4 June 2004.

differ. Laws differ. There are healthy gives and takes between the different orientations; and a recommended strategy is often that of diversification rather than exclusion. In practice, the source of the technical assistance determines the orientations. The two major sources are EU and the World Bank. Most bilateral assistance is now allied with one of the two, resulting in predominantly American and European institutional orientations. Fortunately, there are no embedded cultures in economics or banking. Although economists and bankers work with many different national currencies, they are always able to convert them into one currency. This is not feasible in other behavioural sciences.

(3) How to organise building the IS capacity? The choice extends to how to organize the external reliance and manage it internally: organize along externally and internally centralised and pre-specified channels, or be least restrictive and organize along a mix of bilateral/multilateral assistance and sponsorships and decentralised internal networks with minimum control. The evidence shows that externally mixed and internally diversified, horizontal and decentralized networks have become more popular and perform better, even though they produce a messy picture that escapes public control. Whatever choice is made, healthy and fair competition can be promoted by a balanced distribution of tasks among competing agencies and institutions and the installation of some basic qualitative benchmarks concerning skill certifications and the training institutions issuing skill certificates.

(4) Major decisions are necessary on how many tertiary students to train in each institutional skill. Given the difficulties in predicting specific professional requirements from a government office and in assuring their fulfillment the recommendation is to be guided in these decisions by average compositions as found in OECD lower income countries, and work indirectly through collection and dissemination of converging information on professional vacancies and remuneration levels, and attempt to satisfy in a stepwise fashion the changing compositional preferences of the public/private market and the enrolling students. A greater integration of neighbouring economies and enhanced mobility of labour skills across countries will contribute to a reduction of national skill imbalances. To illustrate, some examples of the average compositions in OECD countries can be mentioned.

(5) Major decisions are necessary on how to finance the educational system making use of public and private resources in efficient and fair ways. A mixed regime that incorporates partial self-financing by graduate students and a recycling of funds for future students is recommendable. The experience of the OECD countries in this respect is relevant and can be recalled here.

(6) Major decisions need to be taken concerning reproductive capacity designs at the academic level, i.e. upgrading of teachers and researchers to assure quality graduates and R&D; and at the pre-academic level, i.e. well prepared student intake at the secondary level. Here too, some relevant norms from OECD countries can be mentioned as guidelines.

Effective answers to the above questions and consequent policies would be greatly helped if more coordination can be achieved among neighboring countries in (a)building their human resource capacity, and (b) opening up of their borders to allow for a greater mobility of the thinly distributed institutional skills. Such multi-country liberalisation measures would not only relieve persistent shortages in IS, but would lay down the fundamentals for regional integration in the longer run in the Caucasus and Central Asia. This region appears to be one of the least economically and politically integrated regions in the world despite sharing a similar physical environment and a common cultural heritage. IS can be the objective as well as the means for promoting a closer regional integration.

## SHEETS

### INSTITUTIONAL SKILLS FOR SUCCESSFUL TRANSITIONS: STRATEGY AND DESIGN

---

Technological skills = no problems

**Institutional skills = BIG problems**

Creation of new institutions for the mixed market-state economy requires institutional skills, IS,  
to run them.

Transition economies are starting from square one.

Important to distinguish in IS between

A categories (4 to 6 years),

and

B categories (1 to 3 years)

---

SIX questions for policy- making:

- (1) What are the institutional skills to focus on?
  - (2) Which orientation to follow in building institutional skills capacities?
  - (3) How to organise building the institutional skills capacities?
  - (4) How many tertiary students to train in each institutional skill?
  - (5) How to finance the educational system making use of public/private resources in efficient and fair ways?
  - (6) How to assure quantity and quality in reproductive capacity at the academic level, i.e. teachers and researchers, and at the pre-academic level, i.e. well prepared student intake from the secondary level ?
-

#### 4. Student requirement patterns consistent with the satisfaction of institutional skill needs

Guidelines for policy making : Percentage distribution of tertiary graduates in OECD countries, 2001.

		Education	Humanities arts	social sciences business law	Services	subtotal instit- utional disciplines	Technical disciplines	grand total
OECD mean	A	13.1	12.0	31.7	2.6	59.4	40.6	100
	B	13.0	8.8	24.1	9.2	55.1	44.9	100
US	A	13.1	14.0	42.6	2.4	72.1	27.9	100
	B	2.7	0.2	32.8	8.8	44.5	55.5	100
Turkey	A	22.5	10.1	21.5	2.4	56.5	43.5	100
	B	X	2.3	28.3	4.7	35.3	64.7	100

X=included elsewhere

Source OECD: Education at a glance, 2003, Paris. Adapted from Table A3.1

#### 5. Financing education via public and private resources efficiently and fairly

The distinction between public and private funding runs across the rows of public and private tertiary educational institutions, as well as the expenditure types that are covered by government versus parents and students. In the pre-transition regimes the first uppermost cell, standing for state financing and public universities, accounted for 100%. This is no more so. Some guidelines from OECD practices are in place. For the OECD as a whole, public educational institutions are for about 88 percent funded directly from public sources, while 12% is taken care of by private sources. But there are significant exceptions towards more private financing. In Korea, private sources account for 40% of educational finance, the figure for US is one-third, and it is in Japan and Australia about one-quarter. These are also the countries that spend substantial and greater shares of their GDP on education than others.



<b>Educational Finance: Recipient tertiary institutions, financing agents and expenditure items</b>					
<b>Recipient tertiary institutions</b>	<b>Government departments Central/local</b>	<b>Business sectors</b>	<b>National philanthropists</b>	<b>International assistance</b>	<b>Students</b>
<b>Public university or institute</b> (Run by public body and predominantly financed from taxes)	<b>1. Government's budgetary allocations to public university or institute</b> 2. Government may provide supplementary grants and/or loans for special projects	Business pays for delivered production, consulting, research, development, and renting	Alumni and foundations contribute donations	Bilateral and multilateral agencies donate assistance	1. Parents/Students paying fees for instruction, i.e. educational core costs.  2. Parents/Students spending outside the educational core on ancillary services such as living, transport, books, tutors, and extras.
<b>Private university or institute</b> (.Run by private body and predominantly financed on (semi) commercial basis)	1. Government may provide some subsidy 2. Government may engage on a contract basis	1. Business pays for delivered production, consulting and rental services <b>2. Banks may provide loans</b>	Alumni and foundations contribute donations	Bilateral and multilateral agencies donate assistance	1. Parents/Students paying fees instruction.  2. Parents/Students spending outside the educational core on ancillary services.
P.M.					
Students	1. More governments are providing soft loans to students to finance fees and living 2. Some governments collect graduate taxes	1. Business funding of soft loans to students to finance fees and living. 2. Often guaranteed subsidized by government			

## 6. Reproductive capacity at academic and pre-academic levels

*As an indication of the composition of cost per student for institutional professions the following means for the OECD are indicative. The current to capital expenditure shares amount to about 90% to 10%. The educational core costs per student amount to US\$ 6701, ancillary services per student amount to US\$ 336. The mean expenditure per student on research and development in tertiary education as a whole is US\$ 2499. Total is US\$ 9536 per student. Of course, there is a wide range of variation behind these country means. These can be compared with an average cost per student in for primary and secondary education (US\$ 4985) to give an idea of the incremental needs.*

### Annual cost and percentage distribution of cost components per student: Mean values for OECD countries

	Primary and secondary	Professional skills
Average annual cost per student in US\$	US\$ 4985	<b>US\$ 9536 *</b>
Current expenditure: capital expenditure	92.0: 8.0	88.0: 12.0
Education core: Ancillary services: R & D	94.2: 5.8: P.M.	70.0: 3.5: 26.5

\* Annual cost per student for A level categories is about 1.2 times that for B level categories. Accumulated cost over total duration is 3.0 times as much, i.e. (1.2 X 5 years) / (1 X 2 years).  
Source OECD: Education at a glance, 2003, Paris. Adapted from various A, B and C tables.

## WELCOMING REMARKS

by **Mr. Marcin Świącicki,**  
**Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities**

**Your excellencies,  
Mr. Prime-Minister,  
Ladies and Gentlemen,**

- On behalf of the OSCE, I would like to welcome you all to the 3<sup>rd</sup> Preparatory Seminar of the 12<sup>th</sup> OSCE Economic Forum here in Bishkek. I am delighted to see that the topic of our Seminar has met with such wide spread interest not only among academic institutions, but also among governments, NGOs and international organisations. I take this as a sign of both awareness and willingness of all of you to contribute to the strengthening of the human capital in the entire OSCE area, but above all here in Central Asia and the South Caucasus, and hope that this Seminar will lead to concrete proposals of action and co-operation.
- As you know, the theme of this year's OSCE Economic Forum in Prague will be: "New Challenges for Building Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic Development and Co-operation". The theme reflects three of the most important elements of economic transition : the development of Small and Medium Sized Enterprises, Investment and Human Capital.
- The previous two preparatory seminars dealt with the two first topics : Small and Medium Enterprise Development was discussed in Yerevan in November last year and the Promotion of Foreign And Domestic Investment was debated in Dublin in February.
- This is the third and final Preparatory Seminar before the Forum (which will last from 31 may to 4 June) and its focus is on "Professional Skills needed for the development of a Market Economy" with particular attention given to Central Asia and the Caucasus. The Seminar will be instrumental in obtaining insight into the requirements of developing strong market economies based on adequately trained professionals. One of the focal points for the discussions of the seminar will be to identify concrete actions in the field of higher education and vocational training and that the OSCE can undertake in co-operation with its partners to foster educational exchange in these areas.
- Finally, I would like to extend my appreciation and thanks to the Government of Kyrgyzstan for hosting this Seminar and assisting in its organization. Special thanks go to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. We are very much honoured by the presence here today of His Excellency, Mr. Djoomart Otorbaev, the Deputy Prime Minister.
- Your Excellency, you have the floor.

[SPEECH BY H.E. DJOOMART. OTORBAEV]

- Thank you very much, Mr. Deputy Prime Minister
- May I now give the floor to Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, representing this year's Bulgarian Chairmanship of the OSCE, for his Opening Remarks. Let me underline in this context the importance that the Bulgarian Chairmanship is attaching to the issue of building up a skilled and well-trained labour force able to effectively contribute to the development of the economy in the OSCE region.
- You have the floor, Sir.

[SPEECH BY AMBASSADOR IVAN NAYDENOV]

- Thank you, Ambassador.

- I would like to give the floor to the Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek, Ambassador Markus Müller, and use the occasion to thank him and his team for their invaluable support and contribution to the organisation of this Seminar.
- Mr. Ambassador, you have the floor.

[SPEECH BY AMBASSADOR MÜLLER]

- Thank you, Ambassador.

**Your excellencies,  
Minister,  
Ladies and Gentlemen,**

Let me now say a few words about the purpose and the structure of this seminar.

The main **focus of the Bishkek seminar** will be on examining the gaps and needs in the fields of higher education, professional and vocational training in the public, academic and private sectors, related specifically to disciplines relevant for economic transition : economics, finance, management, business administration and sustainable development.

The **aim of the seminar** is to obtain a more comprehensive insight into the different programmes and initiatives being carried out in the Eurasian region, and especially their impact and effectiveness in bringing the professional skills of the region's people in line with the requirements of a market economy. We would also like to identify which particular areas and issues still need addressing. We would like the seminar to result in a set of recommendations and concrete activities that the OSCE may undertake in co-operation with its partners as a facilitator, co-ordinator or awareness raiser in the field of education.

In line with the five main areas of potential activity that we have identified, the Seminar is **composed of five thematic Working Sessions** :

#### **I. Training of public administration staff**

The first Working Session will be dealing with the needs in public administration in the fields of economic, financial, legal, fiscal, and trade issues on both the national and municipal levels. We will examine existing training programmes in this area and hope to identify new ones.

#### **II. Training of academic professionals**

The second Working Session will look into the details of the higher education system and its structures; and will deal with questions such as the recognition of degrees, the brain drain of academic staff and professional development opportunities. It will discuss international co-operation and private sector involvement in shaping curricula as well as access to information. It will also look at existing fellowships and international exchange programmes.

#### **III. Business related training**

The third Working Session will look at issues in the field of vocational training and corporate governance. It will try to create a bridge to the private sector by asking about the needs of entrepreneurs and especially SMEs. Finally, it will deal with development opportunities for vulnerable population groups.

#### **IV. Education for Sustainable Development**

The Fourth Working Session will look closely at the needs of public training in the field of Education for Sustainable Development and will deal specifically with the implementation of the Aarhus Convention. It will also look into the possibilities of developing a regional ESD strategy in co-operation with the Green Pack.

## V. Employment related training and development of the youth and successor generation

The fifth and last Working Session, which will take place tomorrow, will deal with the needs of the young generation, specifically with issues related to career development, summer schools, private sector internships, mentoring, and local fellowships to counter professional “brain drain”.

- The Seminar will be concluded with a **Closing Plenary Session, during which** the reports and conclusions from the five working groups will be presented, as well as their recommendations for further action.
  - The recommendations will be compiled and used for drafting a **Professional Capacity Building Programme** which my office will submit to the OSCE Participating States for further discussion in the Economic and Environmental Sub-Committee and at the Twelfth Economic Forum.
  - Next I would like to introduce our keynote speaker: Professor Solomon Cohen, from Erasmus University, in Rotterdam.
  - Professor Cohen you have the floor, Sir.
- [SPEECH BY PROFESSOR COHEN]
- Thank you, Sir.
  - Before opening the floor for discussion allow me to share with you some considerations about the topic “**Human Capital for Economic Transition**”.

With the fall of communism and the break-up of the Soviet Union, the former ideological barriers to building market economy ceased to exist. In 1990 All OSCE member States subscribed to market principles in the Bonn document. Market economy requires adequate legislation, new or radically transformed institutions such as banks, companies, ministries and state agencies, stock exchange, local administration. New legislation will not be effectively implemented and new institutions will not function as desired unless human capacity adequately trained to market is in place.

Under the previous system, higher education was of high standard in disciplines such as natural sciences, medicine, engineering, or languages, whereas education in economics, and business studies were subordinated to the needs of a command economy. Therefore, with the transition towards a market economy, many countries have found themselves in great need of skilled professionals, who can actively contribute to the economic transition and policy-making process, the reform of the legal and structural frameworks and the strengthening of good governance at all levels necessary to stimulate economic growth.

The demand for highly skilled economic policymakers with a capacity to analyse and formulate economic policies, as well as economists and commercial lawyers such skills have put strong pressure on the transition countries' education systems to reform their entire curricula and degree system, retrain or acquire new teaching staff, acquire new teaching materials, textbooks as well as support systems.

Successful economic transition depends to a very large extent on the young generation, who will play a particularly important role in the transition process as future leaders. Their active participation in the labour market has to be encouraged in order to avoid frustration and the “brain drain” affecting many transition countries. For example, according to the Russian Academy of Science, Russia alone has seen more than 70,000 highly qualified scientists leave the country over the last decade. One of the questions this seminar should address is what can be done to retain highly qualified personnel who can find more attractive work opportunities in developed countries.

Since the break-up of the Soviet Union, the states of Central Asia and the South Caucasus have faced numerous challenges in reforming and converting their education system, to meet the needs of the

market. One of the challenges has been to maintain adequate levels of funding at a time of economic decline, accompanying the first years of transformation, and tight budgets. Almost inevitably, the financial support to education has suffered in most countries as a result.

The impact of reduced state spending on the quality of education has had a series of negative consequences. It has directly affected the remuneration and career possibilities of academic staff, the access to and use of up-to-date teaching material, as well as the availability of technical equipment. The result has been an exodus of qualified and talented academic staff to the private sector, international organisations and foreign institutions which are able to offer higher income and better personal development prospects. The shortage of academic staff in combination with limited access to modern teaching manuals and equipment have seriously affected the quality and standards of education in general, and of economic disciplines in particular.

According to the *World Bank study on Capacity Building in Economics Education<sup>2</sup> of January 2002*, there is an urgent need in many CIS countries to develop a high quality cadre of professional economists who can effectively contribute to economic thinking, policy planning and economic decision making. In their study, the World Bank stresses that business administration and basic economics courses have developed rapidly in the regions, but more advanced and theoretical economics courses and research in the international sense have received less attention and, in some instances, barely exist. Often there is a shortfall of resources and equipment, such as computers, journals, networks, and research outlets, and a lack of trained researchers.

The study also found that the greatest needs exist in the Caucasus and Central Asia, where despite reforms and the introduction of new private education institutions, the quality of economic education and research is still lagging. Many university lecturers are inadequately trained in market economics and curricula require updating.

Activities in other regions may serve as an example what can be done. During the 1990s, numerous economic education programmes were established with support of external donors in the Russian Federation and many East and Central European countries. These programmes have contributed to the formation of a cadre of highly skilled economic professionals. Similar programmes up to doctorate level and supported by continuous research, should be established in Central Asia as well. Some programmes already exist like the Kazakhstan Institute of Management, Economics, and Strategic Research (KIMEP), and some other initiatives are being considered, but this area certainly requires careful attention.

To improve the attractiveness for young bright students to stay in academia and pursue post-graduate studies and research, activities such as **professional development funds supporting young promising academics in their research work and teaching should be considered**, building on existing initiatives.

Reduced state funding and the opening of higher education to competition have led to the emergence of private learning institutions in many transition countries including Kyrgyzstan. This development has usually prompted the introduction of fees for higher education. The annual fees charged normally depend on the location and reputation of the institution, with the highest fees being charged in the capitals and by the most prestigious institutions. To this have to be added accommodation, textbooks and other expenses. This development has made it difficult for lower income families to afford paying for their children's higher education. To allow equal access to higher studies to talented young people regardless of their financial or social background, it is therefore essential to consider establishing a variety of scholarship schemes.

Another factor seriously affecting the quality and credibility of degrees are wide-spread malpractices associated with entry examinations to higher education, graduation examinations and delivery of diplomas. In an attempt to stem such practises, a *National Merit Scholarship Test* has been set up in Kyrgyzstan, which allocates scholarships purely based on examination result. Also, some universities in Central Asia have taken measures to reduce the risk of unfair practises, for example the Turkish Manas

---

<sup>2</sup> "Capacity Building in Economics Education and Research in Transition Economies", The World Bank, January 2002.

University and the American University in Central Asia, by introducing *computerised entry examination systems*. However, more needs to be done to tackle the root causes of such practices as they have an highly adverse affect on building high-level skills and knowledge needed for future economic, scientific and industrial development of the region.

Following the Bologna Process on reform of higher education in Europe as closely as possible could assist states in the region in benchmarking reforms in the higher education systems, including accreditation and quality assurance practices. Closer integration will also help towards ensuring recognition of qualifications attained in the region by other neighboring countries as well as by the planned European Higher Education Area.

It is widely known that in Soviet times, Central Asian women had achieved a high degree of equality as the right to education and employment were considered the norm in urban areas. But, since independence, the educational and employment situation of women have deteriorated faster than for their male counterparts. In times of economic constraints, traditional gender views start to re-emerge, restricting women to domestic chores or poorly paid activities.

Today, university courses such as law and economics contain few young women. As these are subjects which later provide the possibility of taking up leadership and decision-making positions in society, it is essential that higher education programmes encourage young girls to take up such studies to become equal partners in society.

Furthermore, to ensure that all vulnerable population groups, including ethnic minorities, refugees and people living in disadvantaged areas are given access to the economic and employment benefits of a market economy, particular attention should be given by the donor community to the need for economic and business education and training of these population groups, in order to avoid that widespread unemployment or lack of economic opportunities lead to potential conflicts and destabilisation.

To support and strengthen the development of the private sector in transition economies, it is essential to develop a business-friendly environment, based on good governance to attract investment and develop trade and thus create an environment conducive to business development and growth. Good governance implies the creation of predictable economic policies, business-friendly legislation, and clear and transparent regulations in support of economic activity. Introducing and maintaining high standards of governance require efficient management skills, operational and financial accountability as well as respect for the rule of law, business ethics and codes of conduct. These standards can best be reached through an efficient education system that instils the skills and attitudes required for a functioning market economy in the young generation.

The economic downturn of the last ten years has adversely affected the employment situation of young people. Particularly in rural areas, with few economic opportunities, the young generation has been hard hit and forced to leave in search of better income prospects elsewhere. Many university educated young people also find it difficult to get a job in line with their studies and remain jobless for extended periods. Increasing youth unemployment is a cause for serious concern as it leads to large-scale migration and causes frustration and dissatisfaction with the potential of igniting social tensions, increases in drug trafficking and religious fundamentalism.

According to UNICEF, Tajikistan is one of the poorest states of the region, with over 83% of the population living below the national poverty line. Salaries average USD 11 a month, while the minimum wage is a mere 2 dollars. Poverty begets illegal activities, with Central Asia becoming one the world's most important transit routes for heroin.

It is therefore more important than ever to develop the SME sector to absorb unemployed youth and contribute to economic growth and stability.

The young generation in particular should be made aware of the possibilities for entrepreneurship and should be encouraged to set up their own businesses. Entrepreneurship training should increasingly be incorporated in higher education, but also in vocational training institutions, summer camps and high school courses. Many small businesses are furthermore based on vocational trades and traditional crafts and the more aware their leaders are of commercial concepts, the more likely their business venture will

survive the start-up years and grow and provide employment to others in the future, thus creating a dynamic SME environment.

The OSCE has assisted small and medium-sized companies and potential entrepreneurs through training programmes in business and management skills. These activities are carried out in the context of conflict prevention and post-conflict rehabilitation where the focus lies on potential conflict areas situated outside the capital cities and in border areas.

One of the initiatives undertaken is the **Youth Entrepreneurship Seminars**, also known as the YES Programme, which has been implemented in South Eastern Europe (in Albania, BiH, Serbia and Montenegro), the South Caucasus, in Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan. It strives to educate young people in the fundamentals of starting a business with the aim of generating new economic thinking and opportunities. Moreover, it helps to promote human capital and private sector (especially SME) development and contributes to efforts of reducing brain-drain and emigration. The YES Programme in Uzbekistan, for example, trained the participants in how to identify fresh business opportunities, develop business plans, get access to micro loans, register a business, and deal with various administrative and financial requirements.

Let me conclude by saying that with this seminar, the OSCE hopes to bring together key partners involved in developing professional capacities in the OSCE region, with the aim of obtaining a more comprehensive insight into the programmes and initiatives being carried out at present. Our discussions during these two days should focus on trying to identify the gaps and needs in higher education, professional and vocational training of civil servants, academics, students and business people related to economic disciplines and sustainable environmental development.

The aim of the Seminar will be to produce a set of concrete activities and recommendations for actions to be discussed at the OSCE Economic Forum in Prague as well as acted upon by the organisations and institutions represented here today. We would also like to set the platform for a constructive dialogue to encourage co-operation and co-ordination of different programmes and initiatives to ensure greater complementarity and avoid the duplication of efforts and precious resources.

Thank you very much for your attention. The floor is now open for your questions and comments.



## RAPORTEURS' REPORTS

### **WORKING SESSIONS 1 - "Training of public administration staff"**

#### **Rapporteur: Mr. Torbjorn Bjorvatn, Senior Economic Officer, OSCE Center in Dushanbe**

The session was devoted to five presentations giving examples of public administration staff training in three different countries: Serbia and Montenegro, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan.

In Serbia and Montenegro, the OSCE is currently involved in training representatives of national minorities in order to qualify them for positions in the court system. In an attempt to reduce corruption, and in order to attract and retain well-qualified personnel, the Serbian government has increased salaries for public administration staff. Elsewhere, similar measures ('bridge funds') have been introduced with the direct involvement of the international community. OSCE may choose to discuss this model further in the context of its anti-corruption and good governance activities.

Kazakhstan has, with the assistance of international partners, designed and implemented a comprehensive training programme for civil servants. Kazakhstan has also introduced an efficient staff recruitment tool which minimises the risk of corruption and ensures that high professional levels are maintained in the public administration. Also, Kazakhstan offers university scholarships to outstanding students who are offered an opportunity to study abroad. The condition is that they return home and work for the government for a certain period of time upon completing their studies.

In Kyrgyzstan, the issue of civil servants training has a high priority. However, the initiative has been more on the side of NGOs than of the government. Some of the main problems are:

- There is a need to standardise and institutionalise public administration staff training.
- Legislation is not up to date and contradictory.
- Responsibilities between central, regional and local governments are not clear.
- The centralisation of power reduces transparency and civil society involvement in public affairs at the local level.
- There are mixed rationalities, where personal agendas exist alongside the public agenda.
- There is a shortage of funding.
- There is resistance against change.

In an ideal case there should be a clear concept of the public administration supported by a legislation which is consistent with it. The selection and training of staff have then to define, introduce and maintain the respective quality criteria. The main challenge is, however, the change of the old mentality towards a new concept of public service and people's participation.

The case of Kazakhstan shows that the question of funding is critical for any reforms, as is the introduction of a systematic "quality management and control".

The OSCE could facilitate the experience exchange between member countries on best practices and results. Also, together with other international organisations, the OSCE can make a difference by providing financial support for governments' training programmes for public administration staff.

In some countries, corruption and nepotism constitute a problem. For that reason it is critical to implement incentive systems that reward good performance. Where transparency, professionalism and high ethics are not firmly entrenched in the public sector, corrupt officials continue to be rewarded for counterproductive and unethical behaviour.

In order to optimise the use of resources it is crucial that donor organisations and governments co-ordinate their efforts. Moreover, the objectives and activities of the international agencies should be

closely co-ordinated with the host government and civil society in the host country. In some cases, the OSCE may assume such a co-ordinating role.

Similarly, schools and institutions of public administration must co-ordinate their syllabuses and programmes in order to establish a more coherent approach.

Along the same lines, international quality standards for education may be developed and implemented. Such “ISO standards” would make it possible to assess the quality of education on an international level. OSCE may be in a favourable position to elaborate this idea further and launch it in an international context.

There are various inter-governmental exchange programmes for civil servants, although it may be a problem for the poorest governments to find funding to participate in them. Here too, the OSCE and its member states may offer support.

## **WORKING SESSIONS 2 – “Training of academic professionals and students”**

**Rapporteur: Mr. Luis Francisco Martinez Montes, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE**

Working Session II dealt with the training of academic professionals and students as a part of human capacity building in the transition towards a market economy. The Working Session was divided into two separate meetings.

### **Working Session 2 A)**

Mr. John H. Knight, Regional Executive Director from the Education Network recognised the importance of monetary issues without neglecting the need to focus on quality. In Central Asia in particular there are too many academic institutions competing for limited financial resources. As a result there is a surplus of underfinanced programmes leading to low quality diplomas lacking in credibility at the market place.

Mr. Andrew Wilson, Vice-president of the Eurasia Foundation explained the origins and evolution of the Foundations’ involvement in transition economies. At present, the Foundation is evaluating its past and ongoing programmes. The main results of that process were shared with the audience. The essential lessons to be learned from previous experiences are:

- a) the need to be realistic when setting the goals and
- b) the importance of building strong international and local partnerships.

Mr. Rufat Kasunov, from Azerbaijan’s State Economic University, focused his intervention on the need to identify the human resources and capabilities required by societies in transition towards a market economy. In that endeavour it is important to maintain a dialogue between public authorities and the business community.

Ms. Mila Eshonova, from the International Business School in Uzbekistan spoke about her own experience in setting up the School within the larger context of the educational situation in Uzbekistan. In particular she underlined the absence in her country of democratic reforms in the sphere of education. She emphasized the need to introduce marketing relations and quality indicators at all levels of the national educational system.

### **Working Session 2 B)**

Mr Voldemar Tomusk, from the Soros Foundation emphasised the importance of institutions and in particular universities. Encouraging young students who have obtained a diploma abroad to get back to their alma maters in their home countries is a necessity. In order to achieve that goal administrative reform in the academic world is much needed. He said that in the former communist times universities were an example of institutionalised corruption. From the point of view of an Open Society, when devising educational reform it is also important to focus on the humanistic and social studies because of their critical role in society, particularly in transition economies.

Mr Tendik Tynystanov from the EU Tempus Office in Kyrgyzstan, together with Mrs Abdurakhmanova from Uzbekistan and Mrs Choreklieva, from Turkmenistan introduced the experience of Tempus programmes in their respective countries. Linking up with European Union academic institutions and learning from their best practises is one of the main added values of Tempus. They also mentioned practical cases of networking and regional dissemination of knowledge. Student exchanges, grants and the possibility of joining the Bologna process via the creation of National Commissions, like in Kyrgyzstan, were also appreciated.

Ms Annette Kramer, from the OSCE Academy in Bishkek made a presentation of a project which combines post-graduate education with practical training. The main goal of the Academy is to improve the security- related regional and international expertise in Central Asia. In achieving that goal, the Academy has focused on professional training and devised a Master in Political Science. Facilitating contacts among alumni, creating an experts pool and setting up a regional and international cooperation network are also priorities for the Academy.

Mr. Eric Johnson, from the Global Internet Policy Initiative explained the importance of Internet and other ICTs for transition economies. Access to ICT's is important but also the acquisition of the required skills. A leap into becoming Information Societies will necessitate cost cutting measures when it comes to Internet access but also better technical education.

Finally, Mr Charles Fletcher, from Caledonia Media, focused on the role of the media in developing democracy. As both an actor and a reflector of society, the media has a prominent role to play when it comes to freely and fairly disseminating information and skills. But those involved in the media need also training in order to do their job better. At the end of the day, a mature society needs a strong and educated media and the other way around.

Both the speaker's interventions and the lively and articulated discussions resulted in the following **recommendations:**

**A) Cross Cutting recommendations.**

- **Establish an international accreditation center.** As an alternative, improve co-ordination and cooperation among national agencies responsible for accrediting educational institutions.
- Create **quality evaluation systems** at the national, regional and international levels. In doing so take into account the requirements of the market without neglecting the search of academic excellence.
- Introduce a **system of curricula standardisation and mutual recognition of programs and degrees.** In doing so try to follow the Bologna process.
- Promote higher **academic institutions as centers of research and scholarship.**
- Introduce **private\ public partnerships** at different layers of the educational system.
- Facilitate access to the **new information communication technologies.** Train people adequately in using ICT's.
- Introduce **equal participation and gender balance** measures in legislative educational reform and implementation.

**B) For participating States:**

- Introduce **educational reform** where needed. Fighting corruption has to be an integral part of the reform process. Educational reform has to be based on local culture, including local languages and conditions and focus on a long term strategy. It has to be coordinated at the international and regional levels. One of the main aims of educational reform has to be the training of highly qualified, flexible specialists.
- When designing the curriculum **take into account the characteristics of the local economy,** particularly where there is a prevalence of SMEs. Promote vocational training.

### **C) For International Organisations.**

- Provide assistance to governments in revising and modernizing their educational systems. Promote in this respect legislative initiatives and implementation aimed at achieving equal opportunity and gender balance.
- Facilitate access to financial resources.
- Co-ordinate more and avoid overlapping in donor projects.

### **D) For the OSCE.**

- Provide advise to local governments in legal educational reform, including developing legislation, improving vocational training, fighting against corruption in the educational systems.
- Compile and disseminate best practises at the OSCE level on standardization of curricula and mutual recognition of diplomas, provide assistance in translating training materials into local languages.
- Facilitate an OSCE University or Academic Network.

## **WORKING SESSIONS 3 – “Business related training”**

**Rapporteur: Mr. Christophe Ceska, Deputy Head of Mission, Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE**

Working session III was devoted to specific training required to improve corporate governance in the field of corporate finance and auditing practices, business ethics and codes of conduct; training and educational needs of entrepreneurs and SMEs (vulnerable population groups) in areas of management, finance, business planning and development.

### **Working Session 3 A)**

As the 1<sup>st</sup> speaker of session A, Juergen Kupfer of GTZ highlighted the importance of vocational training as the main supplier of qualified workers to the labour markets of transition countries. Apart from academics and devoted entrepreneurs sustained economic development of these countries would need also qualified and skilled workers educated in a demand driven oriented vocational training framework. However, in view of a general tendency to low prioritisation of this sector among the authorities in these countries the need for a stronger focus on high-quality vocational training is becoming urgent according to Juergen Kupfer.

Michael Assländer from the Internationales Hochschulinstitut in Zittau emphasized why even the best governance structures have to rely on the assistance of governmental regulations and personal integrity of the individual actors in order to avoid corporate misbehavior.

Gabriel Al-Salem from the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development elaborated on the role of the EBRD in Central Asia and its business advisory service program for local companies and donor institutions. He recommended a combination of consulting services with business training for local companies in transition countries and highlighted the importance for subsidies to vanish once the market has developed so that people learn to respond to incentives and operate autonomously. He also pleaded for donor competition which can become a good incentive for quality improvement of donor programming.

David Grant of the International Business Council in Kyrgyzstan provided information on recent business survey in the region according to which business confidence in Kyrgyzstan is greatest among medium-sized business and identified as the recurrent problems of the business environment in this country the difficult access of business to finance because of high interest rates, the short-term loans and the generally to high collateral requirements, the limited market-size of Kyrgyzstan, its complex and opaque taxes and customs and its lack of equipment and skilled people. To counteract these deficits however, the government is showing willingness to restructure the tax system and reduce its corporate rates. Another

good sign is that interest in technical training is very high as well as in improving marketing skills in general. He named several examples of successfully consulted Kyrgyz SMEs.

Wojciech Hubner from UNDP provided background on the necessary requirements for entrepreneurs to develop successfully in Kyrgyzstan. He was of the opinion that in order for them to create the foundations for a sound market economy in central Asian countries where very few business case studies have ever been applied more cultural changes would be needed.

### **Working Session 3 B)**

Alisher Rahimov who represented the Association of trainers for “Start and improve your business programme” in Tajikistan in session B emphasized the difficulties to improve business framework in a country where 80% of its population is poor. He provided information on an entrepreneur training programme in Tajikistan which has showed its strength in training successful businesspeople.

Costas Masmanidis, Secretary General of the Turkish Business Council, elaborated on the challenges that transition countries are facing in their regional integration and the recipes to overcome their inherited deficits: For a successful integration into global economy these countries would need a profound cultural change - their high-quality scientists e.g. should become innovative by acquiring a more commercial mindset. He criticised the too theoretical education system and pleaded for teaching more soft skills like creativity and critical thinking already at school. In order to be successful in the age of globalisation he emphasized the importance of learning to change. Besides that he pleaded for an overall co-ordination of all business actors – regional organisations, chamber of commerce, business representatives and donors - when realizing concrete projects.

Slavica Singer provided information on a recently set up graduate university programme on entrepreneurship at J.J. Strossmayer University of Osijek in Croatia and pleaded for extending entrepreneurship training to formal academic sector given its ability to make students acquire strong business-oriented problem-solving capacities.

Charles Fletcher of Caledonia Media highlighted the importance of responsible, well-informed and unbiased business journalism in developing a modern market economy.

Finally Claude Potelle who is Chairman from Corporate Resources International in Brussels, Belgium, explained that the legacy of state command economy has left some assets – among them a few companies in the energy market, good scientists and highly valuable research capacities – which should be valued. However, according to his analysis, the general economic environment left is in poor condition and needs vigorous help from western countries in order to cope with the challenges of globalisation.

Speaker’s presentations were followed by and animated discussion.

### **Recommendations commonly agreed on:**

- Ensure the correlation between training/education and the needs of the job market,
- Vocational training: balance between classroom and “on the job”,
- Extend entrepreneurship training to formal academic sector, including scientists and engineers,
- The important role of the media as a contributor to market reform (training of journalists),
- The important role of consulting services with which donors should not compete by providing free services,
- Efficient training must be adapted to local operating conditions and
- The important role of donor co-ordination and competition

## **WORKING SESSIONS 4 – “Education for Sustainable Development”**

**Rapporteur: Ms. Heidi Smith, Economic and Environmental Officer,  
OSCE Office in Minsk**

### **Introduction**

Working Group IV focused on Education for Sustainable Development. The framework was set by a presentation of the UNECE regional strategy for Education for Sustainable Development currently in preparation. The strategy is an initiative of UNECE member countries, Sweden and Russia are leading the preparation. The strategy emphasizes the cross dimensionality of sustainable development, including economic, social and environmental components, as well as the need to move away from conventional lecture style education towards interactive and participatory methods making full use of multimedia tools and innovative methodology. The draft strategy encompasses not only formal school education but also education of citizens through awareness raising and similar activities.

The concept of Public Information (Aarhus) Centers was presented as an example of informal education in line with the UNECE draft strategy. Examples were given from Armenia and Tajikistan where the OSCE is supporting such centers. It was emphasized that the strength of the OSCE supported Aarhus centers lays in their participatory character.

Experiences of using the Green Pack as a tool for formal education in Central and Eastern Europe were also presented. The Green Pack is a multi-medium environmental education kit which emphasises the formation of new values in students rather than simply the accumulation of knowledge in particular environmental areas. The OSCE’s intention to partner with the Regional Environmental Centre for Central and Eastern Europe to adapt this product to the post conflict situation in Serbia and Montenegro, and train teachers there in using this tool was also touched upon.

### **Session Report**

#### **Key points raised during the session:**

- Education programmes for sustainable development must be adapted to meet local needs and take into account local culture and conditions. Wholesale adoption of training from other countries is not a good approach
- Sustainable development is a complex cross-cultural and cross dimensional topic and in teaching it a wide range of factors such as local, national or international, economic or social factors need to be included.
- Education for sustainable development is about changing methods of teaching and learning. Use of interactive, participatory methods and multi media tools are a part of the concept.
- Participants repeatedly raised the question of language and several participants stressed the need to develop training in the local language so as to attain maximum outreach. A need for text books and other educational materials in local language was emphasized.
- A number of international organizations and NGOs are already working to promote education for sustainable development with the active participation of Ministries of Environment as outlined by the adoption of the Strategy for Education in Sustainable Development document in Kiev in May 2003.
- OSCE is also active in a number of areas related to environmental education and education for sustainable development, and has already supported a number of initiatives in this area, including establishment of Aarhus Centers and development of educational and awareness raising programs.
- One participant objected to the focus on the Aarhus Convention and suggested that other international conventions on issues such as climate change and biodiversity etc. should also be considered.

- Another participant replied that since the Aarhus Convention is a cross cutting treaty providing the basic tool for guaranteeing citizens' right to information and participation in environmental decision making regarding all environmental issues, it is a good basis for spreading awareness and educating citizens about their rights and the environment. Hence the focus on this convention in this context was adequate.
- A suggestion was made not to clone Aarhus Centers, but to consider the establishment of information centers. Another participant suggested that Aarhus Centers are more proactive in engaging public participation than Information Centers and that Aarhus Centers has a broader outreach.
- In Armenia the Aarhus Centre was considered a success from the point of view of providing a venue where discussion and activities may take place and became a natural centre for information related to the environment. It had a clearly participatory approach which set it apart from other information centers.
- The proposed future cooperation between OSCE and the Regional Environment Centre for Central and Eastern Europe(REC) to develop a multi-media training package on sustainable development with a focus on the post conflict situation in Serbia and Montenegro was given as a positive example of cooperation between organizations and the security relevance of the topic.
- One participant made a request to the OSCE and other members of the international community to support projects on sustainable development proposed for Central Asia
- It was noted that OSCE has a role to play in fostering and promoting education for sustainable development. Its cross-dimensional approach to security can complement activities underway in other international organizations.
- Finally it was noted that in terms of sustainable development, all countries are to some extent in transition

### **Recommendations**

The following recommendations came out of the session:

#### **What can OSCE do ?**

- Use developed structures, such as meetings and seminars, to introduce and promote education for sustainable development and to gather and disseminate best practice.
- Promote activities that result in informational material, education kits and text books written in local language on the subject of sustainable development. Projects developing and introducing educational packages, such as the Green Pack, should be supported.
- Assist in the development of educational curriculum and make recommendations for curriculum development.
- Promote the ratification and implementation of the Aarhus Convention, for example, by establishing and/or supporting Aarhus Centers, taking into due account existing structures and initiatives.
- Promote training in topics that intersect OSCE dimensions, for example human rights in the area of environment, security, business and trade development
- Promote training programs for advocates, judges and students of law on environmental legislation

#### **What can the participating states do ?**

- Support projects related to education for sustainable development through lobbying, funding and political commitment, particularly in terms of the development of curriculum and text books
- Promote the ratification of the Aarhus Conventions and to assist and support projects that promote it

- Show active interest in the establishment of the Aarhus Centers and monitor their development, growth and outreach
- Support cooperation with the Regional Environment Centre to develop the Green Pack towards a concept of Environmental Security

**What can other International Organisations do ?**

- Communicate local and regional needs on relevant educational topics to other donor organisations
- Promote regional cooperation in education for sustainable development, encourage dialogue and promote exchange of experiences
- Encourage local, national and regional coordination for projects related to sustainable development

**WORKING SESSIONS 5 – “Employment related training and development of the young generation”**

**Rapporteur: Mr. Douglas Tookey, Economic and Environmental Officer,  
OSCE Center in Tashkent**

**Overview of Presentations**

The Civic Education Project in Kyrgyzstan has a number of initiatives to promote higher education in Kyrgyzstan, including the “Local Faculty Fellowship Program” which supports individuals, who have studied in western universities, to teach in their native countries by providing them with professional development support. The “Visiting Faculty Fellowship Program” brings foreign scholars to Kyrgyzstan to teach critical thinking and research and writing skills.

The Eurasia Foundation in Kyrgyzstan has a number of initiatives related to employment training for youth, including career centers, business incubators and vocational training. Eurasia tailors its programs to meet needs of local markets, and works to establish strong regional and international partnerships. Its efforts include multilingual education for primary school children, and arts and crafts initiatives for young artisans.

The International Business School “Kelajak Ilmi” in Uzbekistan works to instill ethics and leadership skills in its students. It offers two internship programs as part of its curriculum. The first internship, at the end of the students’ third year, is for those students majoring in finance and accounting, and places students in different companies in Uzbekistan to help them understand the practical side of doing business. The second internship takes place during the students’ last semester, and allows them to work at a company while they also write a thesis.

The OSCE Field Office in Gharm, Tajikistan has developed an innovative “economic summer camp” for young people in Rasht Valley to deal with post-civil war economic problems. The program is for secondary school students and focuses on providing the students with entrepreneurial skills. As many youth in Rasht Valley have limited access to education, the summer camp is meant to educate and empower the young people.

In Bosnia and Herzegovina, Macedonia and Albania, OSCE and SEED (Southeast Europe Enterprise Development, [www.ifc.org/seed](http://www.ifc.org/seed)) have developed the Youth Entrepreneurship Seminar (“YES”) program, which has now been replicated by OSCE Centers in Central Asia. In the first phase of the YES program, young people, aged sixteen to twenty-five were taught the basics of entrepreneurship, while a second phase dealt with more advanced topics. The program includes several interactive components, and has been successful in promoting youth entrepreneurship.



## **Main Points of Discussion**

Participants agreed that the various programs presented by the speakers are worthwhile, and are the key to ensuring that future generations acquire the tools they need to become skilled entrepreneurs. These programs include, but are not limited to: career development services offered by schools, mentoring opportunities, internship programs, and study tours.

To support youth in entering the labour market, partnerships between Government-Business-Civil Society must be enhanced. In addition to sound academic training, youth need more opportunities for practical employment related training. The gap between the requirements of the current labour market, and what is offered by university and technical programs, must be decreased. Faculty training, in terms of course development and teaching skills, was also identified as a continuing need.

Tourism may provide one area where youth can develop entrepreneurial skills, as it offers opportunities for economic and social development, while also breaking down cultural barriers and broadening perspectives.

Perhaps most important, disadvantaged youth (for example young criminals, youth who cannot afford school fees, or youth from households with drug users or alcoholics) who may not have an opportunity to be part of the traditional education system must be included in entrepreneurial development activities.

## **What the OSCE can do ?**

- Continue to make youth educational issues (at the primary, secondary, and higher education levels) a priority.
- Engage in an ongoing dialogue with the Governments of Participating States about the need to develop fresh initiatives to counter the “brain drain” of talented young professionals from their countries.
- Support quality educational programs that emphasize practical entrepreneurial skills (e.g. speaking & presentation skills, computer skills, knowledge of local markets) and that inspire and empower students, and encourage them to be proactive.
- Enhance partnerships with local, regional and international organizations that seek to prepare youth to enter the job market, in order to co-ordinate resources and initiatives.

## CONCLUDING REMARKS

**by Ambassador Ivan Naydenov,  
Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate,  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria  
OSCE Chairmanship**

Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman,  
Ladies and Gentlemen,

In my view the presentations of Rapporteurs of the Working Groups precisely highlight the major issues of economic education and business training in the OSCE area and in particular in the Central Asia participating States as they have been discussed at our seminar. In order to refrain from repeating what has been already stated I would like to draw your attention to some general remarks.

We are very much satisfied that the seminar attracted more than 180 participants from participating State and Partners for co-operation, international government and non-government organizations, business community and academia which represents the highest attendance of international event of this kind within the OSCE economic and environmental dimension.

The seminar underscored that the OSCE needs to expand its activities on facilitating economic education and business training. The participants noted that the field presences have the potential to propose and implement further projects on education and training in economic and business related disciplines. The seminar reaffirmed that in conformity with the Platform for Co-operative Security, the OSCE is strongly committed to continue developing synergies at various levels and enhance co-operation with other international organizations and institutions involved in economic education and business training. It welcomed activities of the OSCE Academy in Bishkek as a regional educational institution.

I believe that this seminar has accomplished its main goals of revealing strengths and weaknesses of the economic education and business training systems in the OSCE area, facilitating dialogue between the stakeholders and sharing expertise on educational and training programs for the purposes of sustainable development. It has elaborated a number of proposals that the OSCE bodies could further consider and transform into concrete recommendations and follow-up measures. In my view the large majority of proposals are directly related to the discussions to take place at the 12th Economic Forum in Prague.

Let me once again mention the forthcoming meeting of education of the Central Asian states and Afghanistan where these issues would be further brought forward based the seminar conclusions.

Mr. Chairman,

Allow me to express sincere gratitude to the Government of Kyrgyzstan for its exceptional hospitality during our stay in Bishkek and the highest appreciation of the personal involvement and contribution of H.E. Dجومart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan.

I would like to express highest appreciation of the efforts of the Office of the Co-ordinator for the OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities and the OSCE Center in Bishkek for the careful preparation, excellent organization and smooth proceedings of the seminar. I wish to commend the contribution of the moderators, rapporteurs, key-note speakers and other participants. And last but not least my special words of thanks go to the organizers, the translators and other members of the logistic team for their outstanding performance.

Finally, let me invite you to the Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum “New Challenges for Building up Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic Development and Co-operation” to be held in Prague from 31 May to 4 June.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

## CONCLUDING REMARKS

by **Mr. Marcin Świącicki**,  
**Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities**

Excellencies,  
Ladies and Gentlemen,  
Dear Participants,

I would like to welcome you all to the Closing Plenary Session. Over the last two days we have heard very interesting presentations on a wide range of issues related to the professional skills needed for developing a market economy and we had very fruitful debates.

I have the pleasure to start this session by giving the floor to the rapporteurs of the working groups. They will summarize the discussions and concentrate on the key suggestions formulated during the seminar.

The report on Working Session I - Training of public administration staff – will be presented by Mr. Torbjorn Bjorvatn, Senior Economic Officer, OSCE Center in Dushanbe.

(REPORT).....

The report on Working Session II - Training of academic professionals and students - will be presented by Mr. Luiz Francisco Martinez Montes, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE.

(REPORT).....

The report on Working Session III - Business related training – will be presented by Mr. Christopher Ceska, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE, and Mr. Andrew Wilson, Eurasia Foundation, Moderator of the session.

(REPORT).....

The report on Working Session IV - Education for Sustainable Development – will be presented by Ms. Heide Smith, Economic and Environmental Officer, OSCE Office in Minsk.

(REPORT).....

The report on Working Session V - Employment related training and development of the young generation will be presented by Mr. Douglas Tookey, Economic and Environmental Officer, OSCE Center in Tashkent.

(REPORT).....

I would like to thank all the rapporteurs for their work.

I have the pleasure to give now the floor to Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the "OSCE Chairmanship" Directorate of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, representing Bulgaria, OSCE Chairmanship for 2004, for his summarizing remarks.

(SPEECH).....

Now I pass the floor to ambassador Markus Müller, Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek.

(SPEECH).....

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Deputy Prime Minister H.E. Dجومart Otorbaev is not able to be with us because he has to attend an urgent meeting called on in relation to today's terrorist attack in Tashkent. The Kyrgyz government is represented by Ms. Fatima Sushanlo from the Department of Western Countries and OSCE at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Ms. Sushanlo, I welcome you very cordially to the podium.

Allow me now to draw some conclusions myself. It is not easy to summarise everything that has been said these days, but we heard many interesting views and good proposals. For your information, the consolidated summary of the seminar will be distributed to all delegations and participants. Therefore let me focus only on a few issues.

In the course of our seminar we learned a lot about the problems of education for the market. There is a deficit of lecturers prepared to teach market disciplines. Textbooks and teaching materials are a problem. Access to the internet, an inexpensive source of information, is often restricted. Curricula have been reformed but still too much training is in “technological skills” rather than in “institutional skills” is offered. Some departments still train engineers for industries that have ceased to exist.

Uncompetitive remuneration for those already trained in market disciplines makes emigration a tempting alternative and contributes to brain drain. Corruption also takes its toll.

Yet there are some good news. In some countries, e.g. in Kyrgyzstan, there has been an explosion of private higher education so that qualitative issues and adequate supply of jobs remain a problem. In other countries, a system of training civil servants has been created. We have also heard about initiatives and programmes of various international organisations active in the field of training and education.

We discussed what participating states, international organisations and the OSCE could do to fill the deficit in human capital for market institutions, private companies as well as public administration.

The OSCE can support and facilitate co-operation between countries and exchanges between countries. I refer here to all kind of exchanges, starting with the exchanges of information on practices, exchanges of students and academic staff to scholarships and fellowships, exchanges of civil servants, twinning of various kinds, networking among institutions etc. Increased co-operation and exchanges are not only in line with the new Strategy Document but even more, represent a core OSCE value.

Mutual recognition of diplomas should be promoted.

It is also important to strengthen the link and exchanges between academia, research institutions, business and state bodies.

The OSCE can assist in modernising legislation in the field of education and promote more openness and transparency. Moreover, having in mind that the theme of the Economic Forum is related to institutional development, OSCE can contribute to institutional strengthening. High level education institutions should become stronger and market oriented. State institutions as well as private ones such as consulting agencies should provide for competitiveness and effectiveness. Entrepreneurial spirit should be promoted and encouraged at all levels, in all segments of society. This is a condition for success in the era of globalisation. In this regard, computer skills and access to information through the internet are key issues. My office will also co-operate more with the OSCE Representative for the Freedom of the Media, as it was rightly pointed out that the media plays an important role in contributing to market reform and educating the public.

OSCE should also help introduce the concept of sustainable development at all levels of the society, promote dialogue between stakeholders on environmental matters, in the spirit of the Aarhus convention, promote specific programs rising environmental awareness, etc.

Last but not at least, the OSCE should promote equal access to education for ethnic minorities and encourage their representation in administration and also target the assistants to the needs of various population categories and regions at risk. My Office could collaborate on the former one issue with the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities. Finally, youth should be more and more the focus of our attention, as this is the key to a prosperous and secure future.

Last December OSCE Ministerial Council in Maastricht adopted Strategy Document for Economic and Environmental Dimension. This document contains, inter alia, provisions concerning commitments of participating states in educational area. Our seminar, I believe, will help us to make those commitments more operational and will help to monitor implementation of key commitments in developing human capital.

Ladies and Gentlemen,

At the next meeting of the Economic and Environmental Subcommittee and then at the 12<sup>th</sup> Economic Forum we will debate the suggestions made at the seminar regarding follow up actions by the OSCE, participating States and my office.

Before closing I once again would like to express gratitude to our Kyrgyz hosts, and ask Ms. Sushanlo to convey our sincere gratitude to H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister, Kyrgyzstan, and his colleagues.

I would also like to thank the Bulgarian OSCE Chairmanship, represented by Ambassador Ivan Naydenov for very smooth co-operation in preparations to the Seminar.

Special words of thanks also go to all the moderators, the stimulating speakers and rapporteurs.

Special words of thanks go to the interpreters and the Kyrgyz logistic team and as well as to the team from our OSCE Center in Bishkek - Ambassador Markus Muller, Asim Acikel, Economic and Environmental Officer, and Svetlana Raphaelovich, Economic and Environmental Assistant.

In addition I want to mention all the efforts made by the staff of my office, Ms. Andrea Gredler, Ms. Nina Lindroos Kopolo, Ms. Annica Carlson, Mr. Kilian Strauss and Mr. Gabriel Leonte. I thank you for your dedication and excellent work.

Our deliberations would of course not have been possible without all the participants in the event, and I would like to thank you all for your support and contributions. All the OSCE Delegations taking part, the International Organisations, NGOs and Academics, business representatives, OSCE Economic Officers, thank you very much.

Excellencies, ladies and gentlemen, it was an honour and a great pleasure to be with you in Bishkek these two days. I am looking forward to our continued co-operation.

Thank you and I wish all of you a safe journey home.



## Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe

### The Secretariat

Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE  
Economic and Environmental Activities

Vienna, 29 January 2004

**12<sup>th</sup> OSCE Economic Forum**  
**New Challenges for Building Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic Development and Cooperation**

Third Preparatory Seminar  
**“Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”**

*Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, 29-30 March 2004*

### Introductory Note

Successful economic reform and structural adjustment are two of the key contributors to security and stability, requiring functioning economic institutions, good public and corporate governance and adequate human resources. Given the need for skilled and well-trained professionals who can participate in and contribute to the economic transition and policy-making process, the OSCE Permanent Council Decision No. 558 of 31 July 2003 stipulated that the theme of the Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum (Prague, Czech Republic 31 May to 4 June 2004) will be: “New Challenges for Building [up] Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic Development and Co-operation”.

The OSCE, as an organisation committed to a comprehensive approach to security, recognises the importance to support activities aimed at strengthening economic institutions and human capital necessary for successful economic transition.

In the 1975 Helsinki Final Act and the 1990 Bonn Document, mention is made of “Co-operation and Exchanges in the Field of Education” and that the “participating States recognise the importance, for the economic process, of the development of human potential”. This is further supported in the new OSCE Strategy Document for the Economic and Environmental Dimension, adopted at the Maastricht Ministerial Council on 2 December 2003, which considers “human resources an essential factor for economic growth and development, which require knowledge and skills in economic, business, administrative, legal, and scientific matters”. To attain these skills, the Strategy states that the Office of the Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Activities (OCEEA), the OSCE’s institutions and field presences in Cupertino with other relevant international institutions, should develop, inter alia, programmes and projects facilitating training for national, regional, and local administrations, academics, business communities and NGOs.

The seminar in the Kyrgyz capital Bishkek, on 29 and 30 March 2004, will focus on the development of human capacity. The seminar is the final one in a series of three preparatory seminars leading up to the 12<sup>th</sup> Economic Forum. Previous seminars dealt with issues related to economic and institutional development, i.e. developing the Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) sector, stimulating investment and touched upon issues related to the development of human capacity. The Bishkek seminar will be instrumental in obtaining insight into the requirements of developing strong market economies based on adequately trained people. High quality human capital contributes to sound public and private

institutions, and a healthy and diversified private sector. One of the focal points for the discussions at the seminar will be to identify actions in the field of training and education that the OSCE can undertake to foster economic development and stability.

Yet the transition to a market economy is a complex process and its mismanagement can have serious negative consequences for a country and its citizens. One of the challenges many states are facing in their transition to market economies is the need for well-trained professionals, who can participate in and contribute to the economic transition and policy-making processes, including the reform of the legal and structural frameworks and the strengthening of good governance at all levels necessary to stimulate economic development, attract foreign investment and facilitate external trade relations. In particular there is a need for highly skilled economic policymakers, market economists and commercial lawyers working in ministries, regulatory agencies, stock exchanges, local administrations, tax revenue services, commercial judiciaries, and notary bureaux. The same can be said about the need for skilled business leaders familiar with market principles and modern financial and information technology as well as university lecturers prepared to teach modern economics or commercial law. Finally the youth as well as economic and business graduates need support for their career development and employment so as to avoid the “brain drain” affecting many countries of the OSCE region.

Economic and business education is also an important tool to promote entrepreneurship values in democratic societies as well as to empower all population categories to fully reap the benefits a market economy can provide. Particular attention should be given to the need for economic and business education and training of vulnerable population groups, such as women, ethnic minorities, refugees, young people and people living in disadvantaged areas, where widespread unemployment or lack of economic opportunities could lead to potential conflicts and destabilisation.

The seminar will therefore focus on gaps and required skills needed for economic transition. Particular attention will be paid to the current situation in the Caucasus and Central Asia. Participants from other OSCE regions will also be invited to share experience on already completed or ongoing professional capacity building initiatives in the economic and business field.

The seminar will start with an Opening Plenary Session, during which the state of education and human capacity building and the challenges ahead will be addressed. The Opening Plenary will be followed by five working plenary sessions during which the specific gaps and needs of the region’s public administration, academic institutions, business communities, the young and newly graduated will be discussed.

### **Working Session I      Training of public administration staff**

Working Session I will examine the need for strengthening and developing the professional skills of civil servants dealing with economic, financial, legal and fiscal issues in ministries and other public institutions. The Session will also look into the requirements at the municipal level and in remote regions away from the capital and main cities. Existing technical and financial assistance programmes will be analysed and discussed to learn from experiences and mistakes. In identifying the requirements for training and other support, consideration will also be given to the feasibility of inter-governmental twinning programmes.

### **Working Session II      Training of academic professionals and students**

Working Session II will examine the strengths and weaknesses of the education systems and structures in transition economies, especially in economic and business related disciplines at the central, regional and local level. The issues to be discussed include gaps and requirements of the higher education system and administration; quality and importance of the recognition of degrees; retention of academic staff and professional development opportunities; and international co-operation of higher learning institutions focussed on business schools, economic universities, and economic and commercial law departments. Measures to initiate and widen access to training and research institutions through increased fellowship and international exchange programmes will also be discussed. In addition, the Session will discuss the need for private sector involvement in shaping and developing education curricula and training

programmes to ensure that both secondary and higher education meet the demands of the labour market. Achievements of existing donor funded programmes and projects will also be reviewed.

### **Working Session III Business related training**

Working Session III will discuss specific training activities required to improve corporate governance in the field of corporate finance and auditing practises, business ethics and codes of conduct. This Session will also examine the training and educational needs of entrepreneurs and SMEs in areas such as improvement of managerial skills and capacities, techniques and methods. In particular, business related training needs of vulnerable population groups living in regions with high unemployment and few economic opportunities will be discussed. The contribution the business sector itself, both foreign and domestic, can bring to the development of human capacity will also be one of the focal points of the session.

### **Working Session IV Education for Sustainable Development**

When promoting economic development it is important to ensure it is environmentally sustainable. Well informed citizens who are actively involved in decision making processes are a powerful and necessary driver to achieve sustainable development. This session will focus on regional efforts to promote Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), identified as a top priority at the Fifth Ministerial Conference “Environment for Europe” in Kiev, May 2003. Issues to be discussed will include ways and means to help the public to understand the connections between environmental, social, economic, safety and security concerns; the use of the Aarhus convention to strengthen citizens’ rights to have access to information about environmental issues and to influence decision making; and ways in which the OSCE could be involved in and support the member states’ work (under the UNECE frame work) on a regional strategy for ESD.

### **Working Session V Employment related training and development of the youth and successor generation**

Working Session IV will discuss ways to support the young generation with regard to the requirements of and entrance into the labour market: summer schools in entrepreneurship activities and skills training, career development services, mentoring schemes, and widening access to national and international private and public sector internship programmes. The Session will also discuss possible incentive schemes to counter the ‘brain drain’ of trained young professionals, such as placement facilitation schemes and national fellowships encouraging graduates in economics, commercial law and business administration to join the civil administrations.

All Working Sessions are expected to lead to a set of concrete activities and recommendations.

In the **Closing Plenary Session** the reports and conclusions from the different working groups will be presented, as well as their recommendations for further action. The recommendations will be compiled and presented to the OSCE Participating States for further discussion in the Economic and Environmental Sub-Committee and at the Twelfth Economic Forum in Prague from 31 May to 4 June 2004.

National and international organisations and institutions active in the field of higher education and human capacity building, particularly in the Caucasus and Central Asia, as well as representatives of business community and civil society will be invited to the seminar to share their experiences and know-how. This will ensure that any OSCE human capacity building initiative being developed in co-operation with other organisations will complement or build on work already being carried out in these regions and thus will avoid duplication.

OSCE field presences and the OSCE Bishkek Academy will also be invited to actively participate in the different Working Sessions of the seminar.

Participants are expected to present concrete proposals on how the OSCE/OCEEA could be instrumental in contributing to human capacity building.



**Please find attached a draft agenda and the organisational modalities of the seminar. Further updates of the agenda and organisational modalities will be circulated to the delegations and participants in due time.**

**Information on the seminar – including registration forms, a regularly-updated programme and organisational modalities – are also available on the OSCE web site at <http://www.osce.org/eea>**

**Contacts: Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities**

**Mr. Gabriel Leonte**

**Tel: + 43 1 514 36 776**

**Fax: + 43 1 514 36 96**

**E-mail: [gabriel.leonte@osce.org](mailto:gabriel.leonte@osce.org)**

**Ms. Andrea Gredler**

**Tel: + 43 1 514 36 575**

**Fax: + 43 1 514 36 96,**

**E-mail: [andrea.gredler@osce.org](mailto:andrea.gredler@osce.org)**



Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe

The Secretariat

Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE  
Economic and Environmental Activities

Bishkek, 30 March 2004

Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum  
“New Challenges for Building up Institutional and Human Capacity for Economic  
Development and Co-operation”

Third Preparatory Seminar  
“Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”

Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, 29-30 March 2004

Conference venue: Hotel Pinara

### ANNOTATED AGENDA

#### SUNDAY, 28 MARCH 2004

- 17:00 – 19:00**      **Registration** of participants at Hotel Pinara
- 19.30**                **Welcoming Reception hosted by the Co-ordinator of OSCE  
Economic and Environmental Activities at the Restaurant "Steinbrau"**  
(Gertsena Str.5, Biskek, - departure of busses at 19:10, from Hotel Pinara)

#### MONDAY, 29 MARCH 2004

- 08.00**                **Registration of participants**
- 09.00 – 11.00**      **Opening Plenary Session (open to the Press)**
- Welcoming address      **H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev**, Deputy Prime Minister, Kyrgyzstan
- Opening remarks        **Ambassador Ivan Naydenov**, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship  
Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria
- Ambassador Markus Müller**, Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek
- Mr. Marcin Swiecicki**, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental  
Activities
- Keynote speech         **Mr. Solomon Cohen**, Professor, Erasmus University, “Institutional Skills for  
Successful Transitions: Strategy and Design”
- Discussion
- 11.00 – 11.30**      **Coffee Break**

## 11.30 – 13.00 Working Session I and II A meet in parallel

**Working Session I: Training of public administration staff** - The need for strengthening and developing the professional skills of civil servants dealing with economic, financial, legal and fiscal issues in ministries and other public institutions on central and municipal level as well as in regions away from the capitals and main cities.

**Working Session II: Training of academic professionals and students** - The strengths and weaknesses of the higher education system and administration in economic and business related disciplines; recognition of degrees; retaining academic staff; access to information and information technology; international co-operation of higher learning institutions; fellowships and international exchange programmes; private sector involvement in shaping and developing education curricula and training programmes.

### WS I: Training of public administration staff

**Moderator: Ambassador Markus Müller**, Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek

**Rapporteur: Mr. Torbjorn Bjorvatn**, Senior Economic Officer, OSCE Center in Dushanbe

#### Speakers:

**Mr. Serik Kaparov**, Head, Department of Personnel Provision, State Service Agency, Kazakhstan

**Mr. Stephen Kelley**, Legal Advisor on Judicial Reform, Rule of Law/Human Rights Department OSCE Mission to Serbia and Montenegro

**Mr. Ahmat Madeyuev**, Director, Center for Public Policy, Kyrgyzstan

**Ms. Asel Bektenova**, Executive Officer, Urban Institute in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan

**Ms. Anastasiya Kurasova**, Deputy Head, Almaty City, Administration, Kazakhstan

### WS II A: Training of academic professionals and students

**Moderator: Mr. John H. Knight**, Regional Executive Director, Education Network, Kazakhstan

**Rapporteur: Mr. Francisco Martinez Montes**, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE

#### Speakers:

**Mr. John H. Knight**, Regional Executive Director, Education Network, Kazakhstan

**Mr. Andrew Wilson**, Vice President, Eurasia Foundation, Central Asia

**Ms. Mila Eshonova**, Executive Director, International Business School “Kelajak Ilmi”, Uzbekistan

**Mr. Rufat Kasumov**, Head of Talent Training, Azarbaijan State Economic University

## 13.00 – 14.30 Lunch Break

## 14.30 – 16.00 Working Session II B and III A meet in parallel

**Working Session II: Training of academic professionals and students** – continuation.

**Working Session III: Business related training** - Specific training required to improve corporate governance in the field of corporate finance and auditing practises, business ethics and codes of conduct; training and educational needs of entrepreneurs and SMEs (vulnerable population groups) in areas of management, finance, business planning and development.

### WS II B: Training of academic professionals and students

**Moderator: Mr. John H. Knight**, Regional Executive Director, Education Network, Kazakhstan

**Rapporteur: Mr. Francisco Martinez Montes**, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE

#### Speakers:

**Mr. Voldemar Tomusk**, Deputy Director, Soros Foundation, Budapest, Hungary

**Mr. Tendik Tynystanov**, National Tempus Office, EU Tempus programme, Kyrgyzstan: in cooperation with **Mrs. Aziza Abdurakhmanova**, National Tempus Office in Uzbekistan and **Mrs. Aina Chorklieva**, National Tempus

Office in Turkmenistan.

### WS III A: Business related training

**Moderator: Mr. Andrew Wilson**, President, Eurasia Foundation, Central Asia

**Rapporteur: Mr. Christophe Ceska**, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE

#### Speakers:

**Mr. Juergen Kupfer**, Programme Director, GTZ, Kazakhstan

**Mr. Michael Assländer**, Internationales Hochschulinstitut, Zittau, Germany

**Mr. Gabriel Al-Salem**, Director, Business Advisory Service Programme, EBRD, Central Asia

**Ms. Annette Kraemer**, Director, The OSCE Academy in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan  
**Mr. Eric Johnson**, Managing Director, Global Internet Policy Initiative, Paris, France  
**Mr. Charles Fletcher**, Caledonia Media, General Director, Scotland

**Mr. David Grant**, Director, International Business Council, Kyrgyzstan  
**Mr. Wojciech Hubner**, Regional Adviser on Economic Issues in Central Asia, UNDP, Kyrgyzstan

**16.00 – 16.30**                      **Coffee Break**

**16.30 – 18.00**                      **Working sessions III B and IV meet in parallel**

**Working Session III: Business related training** - continuation

**Working Session IV: Education for Sustainable Development** - Regional efforts to promote Education for Sustainable Development (ESD); ways and means to help the public understand the connections between environmental, social, economic, safety and security concerns; the use of the Aarhus convention to strengthen citizens' rights to have access to information about environmental issues; and possible OSCE involvement in a regional strategy for ESD.

#### **WS III B: Business related training**

**Moderator: Mr. Andrew Wilson**, President, Eurasia Foundation, Central Asia

**Rapporteur: Mr. Christophe Ceska**, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE

##### **Speakers:**

**Mr. Alisher Rahimov**, Representative of the Association of trainers for "Start and Improve Your Business Programme", Tajikistan

**Mr. Claude Potelle**, Chairman, Corporate Resources International, Brussels, Belgium

**Mr. Costas Masmanidis**, Secretary General, BSEC Business Council, Istanbul, Turkey

**Ms. Slavica Singer**, Head of the Graduate Program in Entrepreneurship, J.J. Strossmayer University of Osijek, Croatia

**Mr. Charles Fletcher**, Caledonia Media, General Director, Scotland

#### **WS IV: Education for Sustainable Development**

**Moderator: Mr. Denis Sidorenko**, Deputy Head, Permanent Delegation of the Republic of Belarus to the OSCE

**Rapporteur: Ms. Heidi Smith**, Economic and Environmental Officer, OSCE Office in Minsk

##### **Speakers:**

**Mr. Vladimir Tikunov**, Chair of the Laboratory on Sustainable Development of the Territories, Faculty of Geography, Moscow State University. The Russian Federation; in co-operation with **Mr. Jon Kahn**, Ministry of Environment, Sweden

**Ms. Sona Ayzazyan**, Environmental Policy Specialist, Centre for Regional Development, Armenia

**Mr. Kodir Boturov**, National Co-ordinator of the Aarhus Convention, International Relations, Ministry of Nature Protection, Tajikistan

**Mr. Kliment Minjov**, Project Manager, Capacity Building Program, Regional Environmental Center Central and Eastern Europe, Szentendre, Hungary,

**Ms. Annica Carlsson**, Environmental Adviser, OSCE OCEEA

**19.00**                                      **Reception hosted by the Government of Kyrgyzstan at Presidential residence "Ala-Archa-4" (departure of Busses at 18:30 from Hotel Pinara)**

## **TUESDAY, 30 MARCH 2004**

### **09.30 - 11.00            Working Session V**

**Working Session V: Employment related training and development of the young generation** - Ways to support the young generation with regard to the requirements of and entrance into the labour market: summer schools in entrepreneurship activities and skills training, career development services, mentoring schemes, and national and international private and public sector internship programmes; incentive schemes to counter the 'brain drain' of market trained young professionals.

### **Working Session V: Employment related training and development of the young generation**

**Moderator:** Mr. Voldemar Tomusk, Deputy Director, Soros Foundation, Budapest, Hungary

**Rapporteur:** Mr. Douglas Tookey, Economic and Environmental Officer, OSCE Center in Tashkent

#### **Speakers:**

**Ms. Bermet Tursunkulova**, Deputy Program Director, Civic Education Project, Kyrgyzstan

**Ms. Shakirat Toktosunova**, Country Director, Eurasia Foundation, Kyrgyzstan

**Ms. Mila Eshonova**, Executive Director, International Business School "Kelajak Ilmi", Uzbekistan

**Mr Alexandr Kuzmin**, Head of the OSCE Field Office in Gharm, Tajikistan

**Mr. Almir Pestek**, YES trainer and SEED Entrepreneurship Trainers Pool (ETP) Director, Bosnia and Herzegovina

### **11.00 – 11.30            Coffee break**

### **11.30 – 13.00            Closing Plenary Session: Reports and Recommendations**

- **Reports of the rapporteurs**
- **Ambassador Ivan Naydenov**, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria
- **Mr. Marcin Swiecicki**, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities

### **13.00 – 14.30            Lunch**



Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe

The Secretariat

Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE  
Economic and Environmental Activities

Bishkek, 30 March 2004

**Third Preparatory Seminar for the Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum  
“Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”**

**Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, 29-30 March 2004**

## LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

### OSCE PARTICIPATING STATES

#### ALBANIA

Mr. Valer PESHKEPIA Ministry of Education and Science Department,  
Specialist

#### GERMANY

Dr. Detlef WAECHTER Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Desk, First  
Secretary

Mr. Tobias GERSTER GTZ (German Agency for Technical  
Cooperation), Deputy Resident Representative

Mr. Gerald GUNTHER GTZ (German Agency for Technical  
Cooperation)

Mr. Juergen KUPFER GTZ, Programme Director , Kazakhstan

Mr. Klaus LEHMKE GTZ, Resident Representative, Kyrgyzstan

Ms. Tatjana NEKRASSOVA GTZ, Coordinator GUT Project "Vocational  
Training"

Ms. Ulrike ROESLER GTZ ,Resident Representative, Teamleader  
"Promotion of Private Sector Development

#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Ms. Susan ARCHER US Department of State, OSCE Desk Officer

Mr. Myrza KARIMOV USAID/CAR/Bishkek, Project Management  
Assistant

Ms. Aliya ISHMUKHAMEDOVA USAID/CAR, Enterprise & Finance project management specialist, Almaty, Kazakhstan

#### ARMENIA

Mr. Rouben GEVORGYAN Ministry of Finance and Economy, Chief of Staff

Mr. Aram OHANIAN Ministry of Trade and Economic Development, Investment Policy and Market Infrastructure Development, Senior Specialist

Mr. Tigran SUKIASYAN Head of Investment Policy Department

Ms. Sona AYVAZYAN Center for Regional Development, Environmental Policy Specialist

#### AUSTRIA

Mr. Christophe CESKA Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE, Counsellor

#### AZERBAIJAN

Mr. Anar HUSEYNOV Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department of Economic Cooperation and Development, acting Head of Division

Ms. Gulcin ALASGAROVA Ministry of Economic Development, Investment and International Economic Cooperation, Leading Advisor

Mr. Sabuhi ASLANOV Ministry of Economic Development, Expert

Mr. Natig JAFAROV Ministry of Economic Development, Expert

Mr. Namig HEYDAROV Ministry Economic Development

#### BELARUS

Mr. Dennis SIDORENKO Permanent Delegation of the Republic of Belarus to the OSCE, Deputy Head of Delegation

Mr. Alexander OPIMAKH Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE and Council of Europe Division

Mr. Anatoly ABRAMAN Ministry of Education, Director

#### BULGARIA/CIO

Ambassador Ivan NAYDENOV Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate

Mr. Rakovski LASHEV Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, State Expert

CROATIA

Ms. Katica MESIC  
Ministry of Economy, Labour and Entrepreneur,  
Head of Department

SPAIN

Mr. Luis Francisco MARTINEZ MONTES  
Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE,  
Vienna, Counsellor

FRANCE

Ms. Roza SADYRBKOVA  
Embassy of France in Kyrgyzstan, Political  
Department

UNITED KINGDOM

Mr. John GORE  
British Council, Kazakhstan

IRELAND/EU

Mr. Stephen DAWSON  
Permanent Delegation of Ireland to the OSCE,  
First Secretary

Mr. Eero VUOHULA  
European Commission, DG for External  
Relations, Advisor

ITALY

Mr. Fabio CRISTIANI  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Desk,  
Counsellor

Mr. Georgio FIACCONI  
Honorary Consul of Italy in Kyrgyzstan

KAZAKHSTAN

Mr. Serik IRSALIYEV  
Ministry of Education and Science, Department  
of Education Development Strategy and  
international Co-operation, Director

Ms. Anastasiya KURASOVA  
Almaty City Administration, Deputy Head

Mr. Serik KAPAROV  
Agency for Civil Service, Head of Department of  
Personnel Provision to State Service

KYRGYZSTAN

H.E. Djoormat OTORBAEV  
Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of  
Kyrgyzstan

Mr. T. KUSHCHUBEKOV  
First Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of the  
Republic of Kyrgyzstan

Mr. Jangoroz KANIMETOV  
Legislative Assembly – Parliament, MP,  
Chairman of the Committee on Education



Ms. Gaisha IBRAGIMOVA	Office of the President, Commission on Education and Science, Department for Social Policy, Executive Secretary
Mr. Kubat KANIMETOV	Presidential Administration, Head of Economic Policy Department
Ms. Gulnara ABDYJAPAROVA	President's Administration, Economic Policy Department, Expert
Mr. M. DUVANAEV	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Mr. SUSHANLO	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ms. Fatima SUSKANLO	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department of Western Countries and OSCE
Mr. Sergey BAJENOV	Administration of Internal Affairs, Department Against Crime, Vice-chief
Mr. Ahmat MADEYUEV	Center for Public Policy, Director
Mr. Janibek BEKTASHEV	Osh Regional Committee on Foreign Economic Relations, City of Osh, Chief specialist
Ms. Anara BEISHEMBAEVA	National Observatory, Team Leader
Ms. Damira ARAKULOVA	Osh City Administration, Mayor's Office
Mr. Kalys TOROKULOV	EuropeAid SME Development Programme,
Ms. Gulsara ALIEVA	Interior Ministry Academy, Deputy Chief
Ms. Gulmira OKOEVA	Ministry of Labour and Social Protection, Department of Social Protection, Deputy Director
Ms. Baltieva VICTORIA	Ministry of Education, Department of Development Strategy and Education Policy, leading specialist
Ms. Boyko EVGENIA	Ministry of Education, Sector of adult's education, Head of Sector
Dr. Turar KOICHUEV	Ministry of Finance, Center of Economic and Social Reforms, Director
Ms. Aida BAYBOTOEVA	Ministry of Finance, Commission on Education and Science, Post-Graduate Specialist
Mr. Sanjar MUKANBETOV	Ministry of Finance, Department of Investment Policy, Director
Ms. Nuraim ABAZBEKOVA	Ministry of Finance, Department social and demographic problems, Chief specialist
Ms. Kubanyehbek OMURALIEV	Ministry of Finance, Educational Center, Director

Ms. Lidia KUZNETSOVA	Ministry of Finance, social and demographic problems, Head
Mr. Baktybek KYDYRALIEV	Ministry of Finance, social and demographic problems, Lead specialist
Ms. Dilyara MAANAEVA	Ministry of Finance, social and demographic problems, Chief specialist
Mr. Damir SAGYNBAEV	Ministry of Internal Affairs, Science Department, Chief
Mr. Asel BEKTENOVA	Urban Institute Bishkek, Executive Officer
Dr. Karabek UZAKBAEV	Academy of Management under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, Institute of the Public and Municipal Administration, Director
Ms. Tamara KOJOMURATOVA	Small Business Support Center, Director
Ms. Gulmira OKOEVA	Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection, Deputy Director
Mr. Temurbek Asanalievich KULOV	Economical Development, Kyrgyzstan

#### THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA

Mr. Aleksandar GOLEV	Civil Service Agency, Head of Sector for international cooperation and specialized training
----------------------	---

#### UZBEKISTAN

Mr. Rakhmatilla NURIMBETOV	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Attache of UN and International Organizations
Mr. Sherzod BUTAYEV	Ministry of Education, Chief of Main Department

#### NETHERLANDS

Mr. Slagfer WICHER	Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands, Counsellor
--------------------	---

#### ROMANIA

Mr. Sorin TANASESCU	Permanent Mission of Romania to the OSCE, Counsellor, Vienna, Deputy Head of Mission
---------------------	--

#### RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Mr. Valery OKNYANSKIY	Permanent Mission of Russian Federation to the OSCE, Vienna, Counsellor
Mr. Igor KOPELSKIY	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Third Secretary

## SLOVAKIA

Ms. Anna MACHALIKOVA Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family,  
Department of Human Resources, Director

Ms. Emilia TOMASOVICOVA Ministry of Finance, Department of Personel,  
Director

## SLOVENIA

Dr. Robert KOKALJ Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Task Force,  
Minister Counsellor

Ms. Blazka KEPIC Ministry of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Task Force,  
First Secretary

## SWEDEN

Mr. Per CARLSON Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Deputy Director

## SWITZERLAND

Mr. Martin STRUB Swiss Delegation to the OSCE, Vienna,  
Counsellor

Mr. Stefan BRUNI Swiss Cooperation Office

## TAJKISTAN

Mr. Qodir BOTUROV Ministry of Nature Protection, Department of the  
Information and International Affairs, State  
Committee on Environment and Forestry,  
National Coordinator of the Aarhus Convention

## CZECH REPUBLIC

Ms. Jana CIMBOLINCOVA Embassy of the Czech Republic in Kazakhstan,  
First Secretary

Mr. Cenek HAJNI Embassy of the Czech Republic in Kazakhstan,  
Consular Department

## TURKEY

Mr. Sefa AYTEKIN Turkish Embassy to Kyrgyzstan

Mr. Murat OMETOGLU Turkish Embassy to Kyrgyzstan

## UKRAINE

Mr. Petro SAVYCH Embassy of Ukraine to Kyrgyzstan, Counsellor

Dr. Vladimir BARYSHNIKOV Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Institute of  
Entrepreneurship, Dean of the Faculty  
entrepreneurship and self-employment

## MEDITERRANEAN PARTNER FOR CO-OPERATION

### ISRAEL

Ambassador MOSHE KIMHI	Israeli Embassy in Kazakhstan
Ms. Salim ALKULIN	Israeli Embassy in Kazakhstan, Consul

### INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

Mr. Pierre-Paul AUTHEUNISSENS	Delegation of the European Commission in Kyrgyzstan, Project Manager
Mr. Gabriel AL –SALEM	Director, Business Advisory Service Programme, EBRD, Central Asia
Mr. Tendik TYNYSTANOV	National Tempus Office Kyrgyzstan, Director
Mr. Bolotbek BATILOV	National Tempus Office, Kyrgyzstan, Trans-European Scheme for Cooperation in Higher Education/EU Programme, Program Assistant
Mr. Kemelbek CHOROEV	National Tempus Office, Kyrgyzstan, Trans-European Scheme for Cooperation in Higher Education/EU Program
Ms. Aina CHOREKLIEVA	National Tempus Office in Turkmenistan
Ms. Aziza ABDURAKHMANOVA	National Tempus Office in Uzbekistan, Programme Coordinator
Mr. Mahir KAZIMOV	National Tempus Office Azerbaijan, Coordinator of Tempus Program
Mr. Wojciech HÜBNER	UNDP / United Nations Development Programme, Kyrgyzstan, Economic Reforms Advisor in Central Asia
Mr. Kimo KARINI	UNDP, Sustainable Development Advisor
Dr. Talaibek KOICHUMANOV	UNDP in the Kyrgyz Republic, National Governance Programme, Policy Advisor
Mr. Leonid KOMAROVER	UNDP in the Kyrgyz Republic , Senior Policy Advisor
Mr. Jerzy SKURATOWICZ	UNDP in the Kyrgyz Republic, UN Resident Coordinator

### NON GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

Ms. Nurzat ABDYRASULOVA	Civic Foundation UNISON, Director, Kyrgyzstan
Ms. Anara ALYMKULOVA	Counterpart International Kyrgyzstan, Financial Sustainability Technical Advisor

Ms. Svetlana BORTSOVA	NGO Independent ecological assessment, Vice President, Kyrgyzstan
Ms. Gulnara CHOKUSHEVA	EuropeAid Project “Support to the National Coordinating Unit in Kyrgyzstan”, Expert
Dr. John KNIGHT	Education Network (EN), Kazakhstan, Regional Executive Director
Dr. David GRANT	International Business Council, Director, Bishkek
Dr. Boris JAPAROV	Association of education establishments “Education Network EdNet”, Executive Director, Kazakhstan
Mr. Eric JOHNSON	Global Internet Policy Initiative, France, Managing Director
Dr. Kulsina KACHKYNBAEVA	REC / Regional Environmental Center for Central Asia, Kyrgyz Branch, Director
Mr. Bakhadur KHABIBOV	Consumer’s Union, Tajikistan, Executive Director
Mr. Mukhtor KHOJAEV	Entrepreneurship Support Foundation “Aryana”, Tajikistan, Executive Director
Mr. Costas MASMANNIDIS	BSEC Business Council, Istanbul, Secretary General
Mr. Paul Mc GREGOR	EuropeAid Project “Support to the National Coordinating Unit in Kyrgyzstan”, Team Leader
Mr. Kliment MINDJOV	REC/ Regional Environmental Center - Central and Eastern Europe, Capacity Building Program, Hungary, Project Manager
Mr. Murat A. OMOEV	Association of education establishments “Education Network EdNet”, Academy of High Education “TeachEx”, Director, Kyrgyzstan
Mr. Robert Mc GUIRK	International Youth Hostel Federation, Member of the Board , Australia
Ms. Ludmila SAPOJNIKOVA	Center of Information and Education “Green Women” NGO, Kyrgyzstan, Director
Ms. Shakirat TOKTOSUNOVA	Eurasia Foundation, Kyrgyzstan, Country Director
Mr. Voldemar TOMUSK	Soros Foundation, Deputy Director
Mr. Alisher RAHIMOV	Association of Trainers for „Start to Improve your business program“, Tajikistan, Executive Director
Ms. Aigul AKMATJANOVA	Transparency International, Kyrgyzstan, Director

Mr. Bolot KULNAZAROV	Ecological Public Foundation, “Tabiat-Osh”, Kyrgyzstan, President
Mr. Andrew WILSON	Eurasia Foundation Central Asia, Kazakhstan, Office of the Vice President in Central Asia, Kazakhstan Regional Vice President
Ms. Dilbar ZAINUTDINOVA	Public Advocacy Center “ARMON” Uzbekistan, Director
Ms. Tamara KOJAMURATOVA	Kyrgyzstan, Small Business Support Center, Director
Mr. Iliya DOMASHOV	“BIOM” Ecological Movement, Kyrgystan
Ms. Victoria YELFIMOVA	National Coordinator of Aarhus Convention, Turkmenistan
Ms. Saulie TURLYBEKOVA	South Kazakhstan Business Women Association, Executive Director

#### BUSINESS COMMUNITY

Mr. Abdusatar SARYBAEV	Chamber of Commerce, Director, Kyrgyzstan
Ms. Bobbe BARNES	Enterprise Development Project, Kyrgyzstan, Accounting Education, Regional Director
Mr. Charles FLETCHER	Caledonia Media, General Director, Scotland
Mr. Alexander GOGOBERIDZE	SMEDA-Tbilisi , Business Consulting Agency, Director, Georgia
Mr. Vladislav GURIN	Private company “DANA”, Turkmenistan, Commercial Director
Ms. Jamilya IMANKULOVA	El Group Consulting, Director, Kyrgyzstan
Mr. Claude POTELLE	Corporate Resources International, Brussels, Chairman
Mr. Andrzej SCHAFERNAKER	Enterprise Development Project, Kyrgyzstan, Country Director
Mr. Ainura TURDALIEVA	Closed Joint Stock Company “FINCA” Microcredit Company, Kyrgyzstan Executive Assistant
Mr. Emil UMETALIEV	“Kyrgyz Concept” Company, President
Klars LEHIZKE	GITZ company, Team Leader, Kyrgyzstan

#### ACADEMIC

Dr. Chinara ADAMKULOVA	Kyrgyz National University, Dean of the Faculty
Dr. Iryna AKHRAMENKA	Gomel State University, Belarus, Senior Lecturer,

	Entrepreneur
Mr. Michael ASSLAENDER	International High School Institute, Germany, Senior Assistant
Ms. Anar BEISHEMBAEVA	National Observatory, Team Leader, Kyrgyzstan
Ms. Irys BEYBUTOVA	School of International Relations, Kyrgyzstan, Dean
Ms. Irina CHEPURNAYA	Pavlodar Regional School of Management, Kazakhstan
Prof.Dr. Suleiman COHEN	Erasmus University, Netherlands School of Economics, Prof of Economics
Ms. Mila ESHONOVA	International Business School “Kelajak Ilmi”, Uzbekistan, Executive Director
Mr. Grigory FREIUK	Academy of Management under the President fo the Kyrgyz Republic, Department of Economy and Business, Pro-rector on education, PhD
Prof.Dr. Sulo HADERI	University of Tirana, Economic Faculty, Head of Economic Department, Albania
Ms. Fatima JANDOSSOVA	Sange Reseach Center, Social Department, Kazakhstan, Project Manager
Dr. Rufat KASUMOV	Azerbaijan State Economic University, Head of Talent Training
Ms. Annette KRAEMER	The OSCE Academy in Bishkek
Dr. Gulnara KUDABAEVA	Academy of Management under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, Department of Economy and Business
Prof.Dr. Snezana MEDIC	Belgrade University, Faculty of Philosophy, Department for Education and Adult Education, Serbia and Montenegro, Head of Department
Ms. Ketevan MELIKADZE	The Strategic Research Center, Georgia, Policy Analyst
Dr. Gaziza MOLDAKULOVA	Kazakh Economic University/T.Ryskulov (KazEU), Institute of Improvement of professional of economic staff, Director
Prof. Tokonai OJUKEEVA	Academy of Management under the President fo the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice President of research work
Mr. Almir PESTEK	YES trainer and SEED Entrepreneurship Trainers Pool (ETP), Bosnia and Herzegovina, Director

Mr. Kiril POSTOLOV	Kiril I Metodij University, Faculty of Economics, Department Management, Assistant
Dr. Slavica SINGER	Graduate Program in Entrepreneurship, J.J. Strossmayer University of Osijek, Croatia, Director of Program
Dr. Ryskeldy TABYSHOV	Institute of Social Development and Entrepreneurship under the Ministry of Labour and Social Defense, Rector, Kyrgyzstan
Mr. Vladimir TIKUNOV	Laboratory on Sustainable Development of the Territories, Faculty of Geography, Moscow University, Chair
Dr. Liliya TIMOSHENKO	International Academy of Business, Scientific Activities & International Affairs, Kazakhstan, Vice Rector
Ms. Bermet TURSUNKULOVA	Civic Education Project, Central Asia and Mongolia
Dr. Saltanat TURSUNOVA	International Education Programs Integration Institute, Kyrgyzstan, Deputy Director of Science
Ms. Olga KUZNETSOVA	International Academy of Business, Kazakhstan, Rector
Mr. Aziz SUNJE	University of Sarajevo, Faculty of Economics, Bosnia and Herzegovina
Ms. Irina CHEPURNAYA	Pavlodar Regional School of Management, Kazakhstan, Head Assistant
Ms. Nino DZOTSENIDZE	The Strategic Research Center, Georgia, Policy Analyst
Mr. Rasul UZENBAEV	Osh Technical University, Kyrgyzstan, Dean
Dr. Nicholas WEBB	Open University

#### UNMIK/OMiK

Ms. Fikrije ZYMBERI	Ministry of Education Science and Technology, Vocational Education Officer for Development of Market Economy
Mr. Naim RRUSTEMI	Ministry of Public Services, Kosovo Institute for Public Administration
Mr. Edward PRESTON	Kosovo Police School Service, Chief of Operations, Office of the Director
Col. Atifete JAHJAGA	Kosovo Police School Service, Head of Training Department



## OSCE FIELD PRESENCES

Ms. Kledia DALLTO	OSCE Presence in Albania, Economic and Environmental Assistant
Ms. Larissa NEUFELD	OSCE Center in Almaty, Economic and Environmental Officer
Mr. Markku VISAPAA	OSCE Center in Ashgabat, Economic and Environmental Officer
Ambassador Markus MÜELLER	OSCE Center in Bishkek, Head of Center
Mr. Asim ACIKEL	OSCE Center in Bishkek, Economic and Environmental Officer
Ms. Svetlana RAPHALOVICH	OSCE Center in Bishkek, National Project Assistant
Ambassador Victor TKACHENKO	OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina, Deputy Head of Mission
Mr. Danielius PIVORIUNAS	OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina, Office of the Chief of Staff, Economic and Environmental Advisor
Mr. Aziz SUNZE	OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina
Mr. Torbjorn BJORVATN	OSCE Center in Dushanbe, Senior Economic and Environmental Officer
Mr. Alexandr KUZMIN	OSCE Center in Dushanbe, Head of Gharm Field Office
Ms. Natia NATSVLISHVILI	OSCE Mission to Georgia, Economic and Environmental Assistant
Ms. Suzanne SULIVAN	OSCE Mission in Kosovo, Office Peja/Pec, Team Leader of Democratization Department Team
Ms. Heidi SMITH	OSCE Office in Minsk, Economic and Environmental Officer
Mr. Stephen KELLEY	OSCE Mission to Serbia and Montenegro, Human Rights Department, Legal Advisor on Judicial Reform, Rule of Law
Mr. Zoran POPOVIC	OSCE Mission to Serbia and Montenegro, Senior Project Assistant
Mr. Shaun BARCAVAGE	OSCE Spillover Monitor Mission to Skopje, Department Public Administration, Public Administration Reform Officer

Mr. Douglas TOOKEY	OSCE Center in Tashkent, Economic and Environmental Officer
Mr. Alisher ISLAMOV	OSCE Center in Tashkent, Consultant for the Economic and Environmental Dimension
Dr. Yaroslav YURTSABA	OSCE Project Coordinator in Ukraine, Office of Economic and Environmental Affairs, SME Development Advisor
Ms. Gohar GHAZINYAN	OSCE Office in Yerevan, Senior Economic and Environmental Assistant
Mr. Robert MANGHAM	OSCE Office in Osh, Economic and Environmental Officer

#### OSCE SECRETARIAT

Mr. Marcin SWIECICKI	Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities
Mr. Kilian STRAUSS	Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, Senior Programme Officer
Ms. Nina Lindroos KOPOLO	Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, Associate Programme Officer
Ms. Annica CARLSSON	Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, Environmental Advisor
Mr. Gabriel LEONTE	Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, Economic and Environmental Advisor
Ms. Andrea GREDLER	Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities, Administrative Assistant

#### OBSERVERS/PRESS

Ms. Anna BEKRENYOVA	Environmental Press Center, Environmental Journalist, Almaty
Ms. Anna KUZNETSOVA	Neitralnyi Turkmenistan, Economic Issues, Journalist



## Twelfth OSCE Economic Forum

### Third Preparatory Seminar: “Professional Skills Needed for Developing a Market Economy”

*Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan, 29-30 March 2004*

#### LIST OF DISTRIBUTED DOCUMENTS

3PS12EF/OPS1a&b	Welcoming Address, H.E. Djoomart Otorbaev, Deputy Prime Minister, Kyrgyzstan.(Russian&English)
3PS12EF/OPS2	Welcoming Remarks, Ambassador Markus Mueller, Head of the OSCE Center in Bishkek.
3PS12EF/OPS3	Welcoming Remarks, Mr. Marcin Swiecicki, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental.
3PS12EF/OPS4	Welcoming Remarks, Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria.
3PS12EF/OPS5a&b	Keynote Address: Institutional skills for successful transitions: strategy and design, Mr. Solomon Cohen Erasmus University.
3PS12EF/WSI 1a&b	System of education of government officials in the Republic of Kazakhstan: current situation and perspectives, Mr. Serik Kaparov, Head, Department of Personnel Provision, State Service Agency, Kazakhstan.
3PS12EF/WSI 2	Training of Public Administration Staff, by Mr. Stephen Kelley, Legal Advisor on Judicial Reform, Rule of Law/Human Rights Department, OSCE Mission to Serbia and Montenegro
3PS12EF/WSI 3	Risks of Development on a local level and technology of the their reduction, Mr. Ahmat Madeyuev, Director, Center for Public Policy, Kyrgyzstan.
3PS12EF/WSI 4	Local Government Initiative in Kyrgyzstan: Promoting Decentralization and Local Government Capacity, Mr. Asel Bektenova, Executive Officer, Urban Institute in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan.
3PS12EF/WSI 5	State service and development of human resources / Russian, Ms. Anastasiya Kurasova, Deputy Head, Almaty City Administration, Kazakhstan.
3PS12EF/WSIIA1a&b	Higher Education: Challenges in Central Asia, Dr. John H. Knight, Regional Executive Director, Education Network, Kazakhstan.

3PS12EF/WSIIA2	Higher Education in the FSU: Lessons Learned, Mr. Andrew Wilson, Vice President, Eurasia Foundation, Central Asia.
3PS12EF/WSIIA3	Democratization of Educational System in Uzbekistan, Ms. Mila Eshonova, Executive Director, International Business School “Kelajak Ilmi”, Uzbekistan.
3PS12EF/WSIIA4	Creation of modern market-oriented educational system in transition countries, Dr. Rufat Kasumov, Head of Talent Training, Azarbaijan State Economic University.
3PS12EF/WSIIB1	Education and Training for Democratic Market Economies – Contribution of the International Higher Education Support Program, Mr. Voldemur Tomusk, Deputy Director, Soros Foundation, Budapest, Hungary.
3PS12EF/WSIIB2a&b	Joint presentation of Mr. Tendik Tynystanov, National Tempus Office, EU Tempus programme, Kyrgyzstan: in co-operation with Mrs. Aziza Abdurakhmanova, National Tempus Office in Uzbekistan and Mrs. Aina Choreklieva, National Tempus Office in Turkmenistan
3PS12EF/WSIIB3	OSCE Academy in Bishkek, Ms. Annette Kraemer, Director, The OSCE Academy in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan.
3PS12EF/WSIIB4	Importance of internet access for academic studies in Central Asia, Mr. Eric Johnson, Managing Director, Internews, Global Internet Policy Initiative, Paris, France.
3PS12EF/WSIIB5	Modern Market Economies can be defined by their Media, Mr. Charles Fletcher, Caledonia Media, Bratislava, Slovakia.
3PS12EF/WSIIIA1e&r	Working and Studying – Contributions to creating employment-oriented Qualification Systems, Mr. Juergen Kupfer, Programme Director, GTZ Project Coordinator Vocational Education in Central Asia and Countries of South Caucasus, GTZ, Kazakhstan (English, Russian)
3PS12EF/WSIIIA2a&b	Corporate Governance, Corporate Responsibility and the Need of Business Ethics Education, Mr. Michael Asslander, Internationales Hochschulinstitut, Zittau, Germany.
3PS12EF/WSIIIA3	Recommendations on training for business consultants, Mr. Gabriel Al-Salem Director, BAS, EBRD, Central Asia.
3PS12EF/WSIIIA4	The Kyrgyz Business View, Mr. David Grant, Director, International Business Council, Kyrgyzstan.
3PS12EF/WSIIIA5	Training for Entrepreneurial Development:, Mr. Wojciech Hubner, Regional Adviser on Economic Issues in Central Asia, UNDP, Kyrgyzstan.

3PS12EF/WSIIB1	Effective Instruments for Development of small enterprises in Tajikistan, Mr. Alisher Rahimov, Representative of the Association of trainers for “Start and Improve Your Business Programme”, Tajikistan.
3PS12EF/WSIIB2	Centralized Decisions in a Command Economy, Mr. Claude Potelle, Chairman, Corporate Resources International, Brussels, Belgium.
3PS12EF/WSIIB3	Business Skills for Transition, Mr. Costas Masmanidis, Secretary General, BSEC Business Council, Istanbul, Turkey.
3PS12EF/WSIIB4	Why is entrepreneurship important: for individuals, for enterprises, for countries ?, Ms. Slavica Singer, Head of the Graduate Program in Entrepreneurship, J.J. Strossmayer University of Osijek, Croatia.
3PS12EF/WSIV1	Regional strategy in the area of education for constant development / Russian, Prof. Vladimir Tikunov, Chair of the Laboratory on Sustainable Development of the Territories, Faculty of Geography, Moscow State University.
3PS12EF/WSIV2	Armenian Aarhus Center as a Catalyst for Implementation of the ESD Strategy, Ms. Sona Ayvazyan, Environmental Policy Specialist, Centre for Regional Development, Armenia.
3PS12EF/WSIV3	Experience of the Tajik Republic in implementation of the Aarhus Convention, Mr. Kodir Boturov, National Co-ordinator of the Aarhus Convention, International Relations, Ministry of Nature Protection, Tajikistan.
3PS12EF/WSIV4a&b	The Green Pack - Challenges and Achievements, Mr. Kliment Mindjov Project Manager, Capacity Building Program, Regional Environmental Center, Szentendre, Hungary.
3PS12EF/WSIV5	OSCE/REC Green Pack Project in Serbia and Montenegro, Ms. Annica Carlsson, Environment Officer / Office of the Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Activities.
3PS12EF/WSV1	Faculty Training and Professional Development Programs in Civic Education Project - Central Asia and Mongolia, Ms. Bermet Tursunkulova, Deputy Program Director, Civic Education Project, Kyrgyzstan.
3PS12EF/WSV2	Programs in Employment Training and Youth Skill Development, Ms. Shakirat Toktosunova, Country Director, Eurasia Foundation in the Kyrgyzstan Republic.
3PS12EF/WSV3	Student internship program is a basis of career growth., Ms. Mila Eshonova, Executive Director, International Business School “Kelajak Ilmi”, Uzbekistan.

- 3PS12EF/WSV4 New challenges: Economic Camp for Youth in Tajikistan, Mr. Alexandr Kuzmin, Head of the OSCE Field Office in Gharm, Tajikistan.
- 3PS12EF/WSV5 Employment related trainings and development of the young generation - Projects of SEED and OSCE -, Mr. Almir Pestek, YES trainer and SEED Entrepreneurship Trainers Pool (ETP) Director, Bosnia and Herzegovina.
- 3PS12EF/CP1 Concluding Remarks, Ambassador Ivan Naydenov, Director of the OSCE Chairmanship Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Bulgaria.
- 3PS12EF/CP2 Concluding Remarks, Mr. Marcin Swiecicki, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental.
- 3PS12EF/CP3 Reports of the Rapporteurs: Recommendations of the Working Groups,
- 3PS12EF/Gen1 Обучение персонала компании: проблемы и пути решения/Company training: problems and solutions, Mr. L.S. Timoshenko, Международная Академия Бизнеса, Казахстан/International Business Academy, Kazakhstan.
- 3PS12EF/Gen2 Проблемы вступления молодёжи на рынок труда/Problems of the youth entering the labor Mr. L.S. Timoshenko, Международная Академия Бизнеса, /International Business Academy, Kazakhstan.
- 3PS12EF/Gen3 Faculty of Economics and its Impact in the Process of Developed Human Resources in the Economical Sciences, Mr. Kiril Postolov, University "Ss. Cyril and Methodius" Skopje, Republic of Macedonia.
- 3PS12EF/Gen4 EL GROUP Consulting Company, Specialists in Human Resource Management, Organizational Development, Marketing and Fund Raising established in May 2003, Kyrgyzstan.
- 3PS12EF/Gen5 OSCE Projects in the Field of Education for Sustainable Development and Environmental Education, Ms. Annica Carlsson, OSCE, Office of the Coordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities.
- 3PS12EF/Gen6 Training of academic professionals and students - Experiences and Recommendations from Serbia, Dr. Snezana Medic, Head of Department of Education and Adult Education, Faculty of Philosophy, Belgrade University - Serbia.
- 3PS12EF/Gen7 Recent Events (Winter 2003-Spring 2004), Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economics and Environmental Activities.