



22<sup>nd</sup> CENTRAL ASIA MEDIA CONFERENCE

# **Strengthening Media Diversity and Pluralism in Central Asia**

Online | 7- 9 October 2020

## **SUPPLEMENTARY READING MATERIALS**

### **SESSION I: Current regulations and action plans concerning harmful speech in CA and globally**

#### **OSCE RFoM documents**

OSCE RFoM, Commentary on some provisions of the draft law of the Republic of Uzbekistan "On countering extremism" (August 2018), <https://bit.ly/3j8nf8q>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, Analiz proyekta zakona Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki «O manipulirovaniy informatsiyey» (July 2020), <https://bit.ly/2RGNAhU>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, Legal Review of the Austrian Federal Act for Diligence and Responsibility Online (May 2019), <https://bit.ly/3cHilgj>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, Recommendations on Protecting Media Freedom and Freedom of Expression in the Regulation of Online Content in South East Europe (June 2018), <https://bit.ly/33cH9JP>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, International Standards and Comparative Approaches on Freedom of Expression and Blocking of Terrorist or Extremist Content Online (January 2018), <https://bit.ly/3kZblhw>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

## Further resources

UN Special Rapporteur, Promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression (October 2019), <https://bit.ly/3izAALC>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

UN, Strategy and Plan of Action on Hate Speech (May 2019), <https://bit.ly/32wFDC6>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

UN OHCHR, Report on online hate speech (October 2019), <https://bit.ly/3hM5lqx>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression (April 2018), <https://bit.ly/33KEpCG>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

UN OHCHR, Freedom of expression vs incitement to hatred: OHCHR and the Rabat Plan of Action (October 2012), <https://bit.ly/2FQm4Mp>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, ECRI, General policy recommendation no. 15 on combatting hate speech (December 2015), <https://bit.ly/3kEzsSv>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, Recommendation no. R (97) 20 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on "hate speech" (October 1997), <https://bit.ly/2RJT6Ar>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE ODIHR, Hate Crime Victims in the Criminal Justice System (April 2020), <https://bit.ly/3c51Qua>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Article 19, Mongolia: Criminalization of defamation is another disturbing attack on media freedom, threatening anti-corruption efforts (April 2020), <https://bit.ly/2RtlWVw>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Transatlantic High Level Working Group on Content Moderation and Freedom of Expression, Freedom and Accountability: A Transatlantic Framework for Moderating Speech Online, <https://bit.ly/3iStHQP>, accessed 21 September 2020.

Internet & Jurisdiction Policy Network, Mappings of Key Elements of Content Moderation (June 2020), <https://bit.ly/2FYGBhO>, accessed 21 September 2020.

Association for Progressive Communications (APC), Challenging hate: Presentation on hatred, religion and gender in South and Southeast Asia (June 2020), <https://bit.ly/33vw6dK>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Article 19, 'Hate Speech' Explained: A Toolkit (December 2019), <https://bit.ly/3mtHPCb>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Legal Media Centre, Yazyk nenavisti v Kazakhstane: statistika, sudebnaja praktika, recomendatsii (2017), <https://bit.ly/3iJPSSG>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Legal Media Centre, Pravovye ramki I praktika blokirovaniya internet-kontenta v respublike Kazahstan (2017), <https://bit.ly/33CNFJ3>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Legal Media Centre, Svoboda slova i leksika neterpimosti v internete, <https://bit.ly/3kuorTX>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Media Policy Institute, Analiz proyekta Zakona KR «O vnesenii izmeneniy v Grazhdanskiy protsessual'nyy kodeks Kyrgyzskoy Respubliki» (2020), <https://bit.ly/2S7wREv>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

Philippe Yves Kuhn. (2019) Reforming the Approach to Racial and Religious Hate Speech Under Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights, *Human Rights Law Review*, Volume 19, Issue 1, pp.119–147, <https://bit.ly/33ai81R>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Ganesh, Bharath & Bright, Jonathan. (2020) Countering Extremists on Social Media: Challenges for Strategic Communication and Content Moderation. *Policy & Internet*, 12(1), pp.6-19, <https://bit.ly/3jcbfOp>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Siapera, Eugenia; Moreo, Elena & Zhou, Jiang (2018) Hate Track: Tracking And Monitoring Racist Speech Online, <https://bit.ly/3mU6Bvw>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Cavaliere, Paolo (2019) Digital Platforms and the Rise of Global Regulation of Hate Speech, *Edinburgh School of Law Research Paper No. 2019/29*, <https://bit.ly/2S7186D>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

## **SESSION II: Diversity in mainstream media. Minority media in pluralist society**

### **OSCE RFoM documents**

OSCE RFoM, Joint Declaration on Freedom of Expression and Elections in the Digital Age (April 2020), <https://bit.ly/3mEgwFv>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, Joint Declaration on Media Independence and Diversity in the Digital Age (May 2018), <https://bit.ly/3hVSwu4>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE RFoM, IPI, A Dark Place: A SOFJO Documentary (2019), <https://bit.ly/348BbJi>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

### **Further resources**

OSCE HCNM, *Guidelines on the Use of Minority Languages in the Broadcast Media*, (10 October 2003), <https://bit.ly/2ESNkte>, accessed 2 October, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, The Tallinn Guidelines on National Minorities and the Media in the Digital Age & Explanatory Note (February 2019), <https://bit.ly/2RxZzy1>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, The Ljubljana Guidelines on Integration of Diverse Societies (7 November 2012), <https://bit.ly/2HGTUEb>, accessed 2 October, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, Minority-Language Related Broadcasting and Legislation in the OSCE: Survey of State Practice (September 2003), <https://bit.ly/2H6eePb>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, Recommendation on media pluralism, transparency of media ownership and media literacy (April 2018), <https://bit.ly/2FMTUC5>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, Media & Diversity: The next steps to promote minority access to the Media, <https://bit.ly/3j2BE5S>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, Cyberhate: an issue of continued concern for the Council of Europe's AntiRacism Commission (November 2015), <https://bit.ly/2RJNSEF>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

Council of Europe, Journalists under pressure - Unwarranted interference, fear and self-censorship in Europe (2017), <https://bit.ly/3jhciBD>, accessed 30 September, 2020.

IREX, The Development of Sustainable Independent Media in Europe and Eurasia (2019), <https://bit.ly/3hC7THC>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Konrad Adenauer Stiftung (KAS), K voprosu o sovremennoj jazykovej politike v Uzbekistane (June 2020), <https://bit.ly/33BFEnF>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Article 19, Uzbekistan: Law on Mass Media (May 2019), <https://bit.ly/2EdzBNr>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

International Women's Media Foundation, Attacks and Harassment: The Impact on Female Journalists and Their Reporting, <https://bit.ly/3jf038I>, accessed 30 September, 2020.

International Centre for Journalists, Online Violence: The New Front Line for Women Journalists (2020), <https://bit.ly/349gHQJ>, accessed 30 September, 2020.

World Association for Christian Communication, Global Media Monitoring Project, <https://bit.ly/3cGILyP>, accessed 30 September, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, Streamlining diversity: Access to media (21 September, 2020), <https://bit.ly/3l5u8bc>, accessed 2 October, 2020.

## Legal documents

### Kazakhstan

The Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Articles 5, 7, 12, 13, 14-20 (with changes and additions as of May 2007), <https://bit.ly/35LW0fY>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

Criminal Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Articles 170, 174, 180, 182, 183, 255-260, 272-274 (with changes and additions as of 7 July 2020), <https://bit.ly/3hBDPfa>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

The law of Kazakhstan "On the mass media" (with changes and additions as of May 2020), <https://bit.ly/2RBYIMK>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

The law of Kazakhstan "On combatting extremism" (with changes and additions as of February 2012), <https://bit.ly/2FIOw2t>, accessed 18 September, 2020.

### Kyrgyzstan

The Constitution of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan, Articles 5, 7, 10, 16 – 20, 29, 31, 32, 33, 38, 45 (with changes and additions as of December 2016), <https://bit.ly/2FGFwvh>, accessed 22 September, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan "On mass media" (May 1993), <https://bit.ly/3kEO7xb>, accessed 22 September, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan "On countering extremism", Articles 261, 264, 266, 309 – 315 (with changes and additions as of August 2016), <https://bit.ly/3kC1gXU>, accessed 24 September, 2020.

Draft law of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan "On manipulation of information" <https://bit.ly/3kWEZnZ>, accessed 24 September, 2020.

Draft law of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan "On amendments to the Code of Civil Procedure of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan" <https://bit.ly/3cDJcdj>, accessed 24 September, 2020.

## **Tajikistan**

The Constitution of the Republic of Tajikistan, Articles 2, 5, 8, 14, 23, 25, 26, 30 (with changes and additions as of 22 May 2016), <https://bit.ly/36oTn4m>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On combatting terrorism" (with changes and additions as of 25 December 2015), <https://bit.ly/3ijp4yd>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On amendments to the Code of Administrative Offences of the Republic of Tajikistan" (with changes and additions as of 26 July 2020), <https://bit.ly/3jfpVKG>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On amendments to the Criminal Code of the Republic of Tajikistan" (with changes and additions as of 26 June 2020), <https://bit.ly/2SeU8V5>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

National strategy of the Republic of Tajikistan "On countering extremism and terrorism in 2016-2020" (12 November 2016), <https://bit.ly/30qn7d0>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On countering extremism" (with changes and additions as of 25 December 2019), <https://bit.ly/3l6kW6e>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On the right of access to information" (2008), <https://bit.ly/3cSpQkw>, accessed 01 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On broadcasting" (02 January, 2019), <https://bit.ly/33sKcOt>, accessed 02 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On printed press and other mass media" (24 February, 2017), (1 March, 2013), <https://bit.ly/3ipbbhY>, accessed 02 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On publishing activities" (15 July, 2016), <https://bit.ly/34m9614>, accessed 02 October, 2020.

Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On information security" (26 December, 2016), <https://bit.ly/36t86v4>, accessed 02 October, 2020.

## **Turkmenistan**

The Constitution of Turkmenistan, Article 44 (with changes and additions as of 9 October 2017), <https://bit.ly/2ZK6QQ1>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Criminal Code of the Republic of Turkmenistan, Articles 7, 30, 42, 52, 53, 58, 62, 76, 101, 107, 108, 113, 145, 168, 177, 295 (with changes and additions as of 9 June 2018), <https://bit.ly/30gU2Rq>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

## **Uzbekistan**

The Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Articles 4, 10, 12, 29, 67 (with changes and additions as of April 2018), <https://bit.ly/2ZJRzi7>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Law of the Uzbek Republic "On the national language of the Republic of Uzbekistan" (with changes and additions as of December 1995), <https://bit.ly/35HIM4Y>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Law of the Uzbek Republic "On mass media" (with changes and additions as of January 2007), <https://bit.ly/3hIMEUD>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

The law of the Uzbek Republic "On countering extremism", Articles 3, 5, 6, 11, 18, 19 (June 2018), <https://bit.ly/3hQ6ahZ>, accessed 22 September, 2020.

## **Mongolia**

The Constitution of Mongolia, Article 8, 14, 16 (with changes and additions as of 2001), <https://bit.ly/2FJjwze>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

The Criminal Law of Mongolia, Articles 117, 118 (December 1986), <https://bit.ly/3iCpNLQ>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

The law of Mongolia "On the information transparency and right to information" (June 2011), <https://bit.ly/3ch9mvA>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

The law of Mongolia "On the freedom of media", Articles 1-4 (August 1998), <https://bit.ly/3jbXMeg>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

## **SESSION III: Response to the COVID-19 Crisis: Media Regulations, Economic Pressure and Solidarity**

OSCE RFoM, COVID-19: Governments must promote and protect access to and free flow of information during pandemic, say international media freedom experts (March 2020), <https://bit.ly/30gQzID>, accessed 29 September, 2020.

OSCE ODIHR, Scapegoating of minorities during pandemic increases need for targeted action to combat intolerance and discrimination, OSCE conference concludes (May 2020), <https://bit.ly/3iEj7wA>, 16 September, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities offers recommendations on short-term responses to COVID-19 that support social cohesion (March 2020), <https://bit.ly/3cllWAC>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

UN, António Guterres, Appeal to Address and Counter COVID-19 Hate Speech (May 2020), <https://bit.ly/3huW1qY>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

UN, Guidance Note on Addressing and Countering COVID-19 related Hate Speech (May 2020), <https://bit.ly/3hCHABf>, accessed 16 September, 2020.

Internet & Jurisdiction Policy Network, I&JPN Secretariat Issues Framing Brief on User Data Access in the COVID-19 Context (April 2020), <https://bit.ly/2FWHze8>, accessed 21 September, 2020.

OSCE HCNM, Streamlining diversity: COVID-19 measures that support social cohesion (17 April 2020), <https://bit.ly/33nZDr9>, accessed 2 October, 2020.