

Chairmanship: Sweden

1340th PLENARY MEETING OF THE COUNCIL

1. Date: Thursday, 21 October 2021 (in the Neuer Saal and via video teleconference)

Opened: 10 a.m.
Suspended: 1.05 p.m.
Resumed: 3 p.m.
Closed: 5.55 p.m.

2. Chairperson: Ambassador U. Funered
Ambassador T. Lorentzson

3. Subjects discussed – Statements – Decisions/documents adopted:

Agenda item 1: PRESENTATION BY THE OSCE SECRETARY GENERAL
OF THE 2022 UNIFIED BUDGET PROPOSAL

Chairperson, OSCE Secretary General (SEC.GAL/143/21 OSCE+), Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro, North Macedonia and Serbia; the country of the Stabilisation and Association Process and potential candidate country Bosnia and Herzegovina; the European Free Trade Association country Iceland, member of the European Economic Area; as well as Andorra, Georgia and San Marino, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1659/21), Russian Federation (Annex 1), Turkey (PC.DEL/1601/21 OSCE+), United Kingdom, Canada (PC.DEL/1644/21 OSCE+), Switzerland (PC.DEL/1638/21 OSCE+), Azerbaijan (Annex 2), United States of America (PC.DEL/1590/21), Norway (PC.DEL/1591/21), Kazakhstan (PC.DEL/1597/21 OSCE+), Armenia (PC.DEL/1650/21 OSCE+), Liechtenstein, Poland (PC.DEL/1600/21 OSCE+), Kyrgyzstan

Agenda item 2: REPORT OF OSCE REPRESENTATIVE TO THE
LATVIAN-RUSSIAN JOINT COMMISSION ON MILITARY
PENSIONERS

Chairperson, OSCE Representative to the Latvian-Russian Joint Commission on Military Pensioners (PC.FR/36/21 OSCE+), Slovenia-European Union

(with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro, North Macedonia and Serbia; the country of the Stabilisation and Association Process and potential candidate country Bosnia and Herzegovina; the European Free Trade Association country Liechtenstein, member of the European Economic Area; as well as Georgia, Ukraine and the United States of America, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1656/21), Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1592/21 OSCE+)

Agenda item 3: REVIEW OF CURRENT ISSUES

Chairperson, Secretary General

- (a) *Russia's ongoing aggression against Ukraine and illegal occupation of Crimea*: Ukraine (PC.DEL/1598/21), Canada (PC.DEL/1645/21 OSCE+), Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro and North Macedonia; the European Free Trade Association countries Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway, members of the European Economic Area; as well as Georgia, Moldova and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1651/21), Turkey (PC.DEL/1630/21 OSCE+), United Kingdom, Switzerland (PC.DEL/1636/21 OSCE+), United States of America (PC.DEL/1594/21), Norway (PC.DEL/1649/21)
- (b) *Deteriorating situation in Ukraine and continued non-implementation by the Ukrainian authorities of the Minsk agreements*: Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1595/21), Ukraine
- (c) *Aggression of Azerbaijan against Artsakh and Armenia with the direct involvement of Turkey and foreign terrorist fighters*: Armenia (Annex 3)
- (d) *The 21st anniversary of United Nations Security Council resolution 1325 on women, peace and security*: OSCE Chairperson-in-Office, Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro, North Macedonia and Serbia; the country of the Stabilisation and Association Process and potential candidate country Bosnia and Herzegovina; the European Free Trade Association countries Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway, members of the European Economic Area; as well as Andorra, Georgia, Moldova, San Marino and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1653/21), United States of America (PC.DEL/1599/21), Turkey (PC.DEL/1631/21 OSCE+), United Kingdom, Canada (PC.DEL/1647/21 OSCE+), Switzerland (PC.DEL/1639/21 OSCE+), Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1612/21 OSCE+), OSCE Parliamentary Assembly
- (e) *"UN Charter is our rules" campaign*: Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1608/21), Belarus (PC.DEL/1603/21 OSCE+)
- (f) *Intolerance and discrimination against Muslims in the OSCE area*: Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1611/21), Canada (PC.DEL/1648/21 OSCE+), Azerbaijan (PC.DEL/1627/21 OSCE+), Turkey (Annex 4), United Kingdom, Spain, Albania, North Macedonia

- (g) *European and World Day against the Death Penalty*: Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro, North Macedonia and Serbia; the country of the Stabilisation and Association Process and potential candidate country Bosnia and Herzegovina; as well as Andorra, Georgia, Moldova, San Marino and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1654/21), United Kingdom, Switzerland (also on behalf of Canada, Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway) (PC.DEL/1634/21 OSCE+), Portugal (PC.DEL/1633/21 OSCE+), Belarus (PC.DEL/1605/21 OSCE+), Kazakhstan
- (h) *International Day of the Girl Child*: Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro, North Macedonia and Serbia; the country of the Stabilisation and Association Process and potential candidate country Bosnia and Herzegovina; the European Free Trade Association country Iceland, member of the European Economic Area; as well as Andorra, Georgia, Moldova, San Marino and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1655/21), Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1613/21), Spain (also on behalf of Kyrgyzstan and the United States of America) (Annex 5), Canada (also on behalf of Iceland, Liechtenstein, Mongolia, Norway, Switzerland and the United Kingdom) (PC.DEL/1646/21 OSCE+), Turkey (PC.DEL/1662/21 OSCE+)
- (i) *On the award of the Nobel Peace Prize for 2021 to the journalists Maria Ressa and Dmitry Muratov*: Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro and North Macedonia; the European Free Trade Association countries Iceland and Norway, members of the European Economic Area; as well as Canada, Georgia and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1657/21), United States of America (PC.DEL/1604/21), United Kingdom, Iceland (PC.DEL/1607/21 OSCE+), Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1618/21 OSCE+)
- (j) *54th round of the Geneva International Discussions*: Slovenia-European Union (with the candidate countries Albania, Montenegro and North Macedonia; the European Free Trade Association countries Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway, members of the European Economic Area; as well as Andorra, Georgia, Moldova, San Marino and Ukraine, in alignment) (PC.DEL/1652/21), United States of America (PC.DEL/1606/21), United Kingdom, Turkey (PC.DEL/1632/21 OSCE+), Georgia (PC.DEL/1663/21 OSCE+), Russian Federation (PC.DEL/1615/21 OSCE+), Ukraine (PC.DEL/1667/21)
- (k) *Violation by Armenia of the provisions of the trilateral statement of 10 November 2020*: Azerbaijan (Annex 6), Turkey

Agenda item 4: REPORT ON THE ACTIVITIES OF THE
 CHAIRPERSON-IN-OFFICE

- (a) *Malmö International Forum on Holocaust Remembrance and Combating Antisemitism: Remember – ReAct, held in Malmö, Sweden, on 13 October 2021*: Chairperson, United States of America (PC.DEL/1609/21)

- (b) *Participation of the Chairperson-in-Office in the 30th anniversary event of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, held in Warsaw on 14 and 15 October 2021: Chairperson*

Agenda item 5: REPORT OF THE SECRETARY GENERAL

- (a) *Announcement of the distribution of a written report of the Secretary General (SEC.GAL/141/21 OSCE+): Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities*
- (b) *Third OSCE-European Union high-level meeting, held on 11 October 2021: Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities*
- (c) *Meeting between the Secretary General and the President of Georgia, H.E. Ms. S. Zourabichvili, held on 13 October 2021: Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities*
- (d) *Visit of the Secretary General to North Macedonia, Serbia and Kosovo, to take place in the week beginning 25 October 2021: Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities*
- (e) *Call for nominations for the post of Chief Monitor of the OSCE Special Monitoring Mission to Ukraine: Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities*

Agenda item 6: ANY OTHER BUSINESS

*Fourth anniversary of the murder of the journalist and blogger
Daphne Caruana Galizia: Malta (Annex 7)*

4. Next meeting:

Thursday, 28 October 2021, at 10 a.m., in the Neuer Saal and via video teleconference



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.JOUR/1340
21 October 2021
Annex 1

ENGLISH
Original: RUSSIAN

1340th Plenary Meeting
PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 1

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION**

Madam Chairperson,

Allow me to thank the Secretary General of the OSCE, Ms. Helga Schmid, for presenting the Organization's Unified Budget Proposal for 2022. We are continuing to study this multi-page document. Nevertheless, we are already prepared to make some general comments and observations on it now.

We take note of the fact that the budget proposal called for an overall increase in funding of a little over 4 million euros or 2.9 per cent. We understand that over the past ten years, during which the Organization has often followed the policy of zero nominal growth, the real purchasing power of the Unified Budget has markedly declined. However, we are not convinced that this process has had the same consequences for all the executive structures. Indeed, in Vienna, for example, Staff Standard Costs have risen considerably in recent years owing to inflationary adjustments to the salaries of locally recruited staff in line with the recommendations of the International Civil Service Commission. At the same time, in Warsaw, say, the rise in these same costs has been insignificant. Hence, the situation is different everywhere, and differentiated approaches to resource needs are required.

We are in agreement overall that with regard to duty travel a reasonable balance needs to be found between online working and personal participation. We note in that connection that many OSCE executive structures have budgeted for a substantial increase in these expenditures next year, claiming that they should be restored to 2019 levels, when pandemic-related restrictions were not yet in place.

However, some OSCE field operations have refused to increase the outlay for official travel because of the continuing uncertainty as to how the pandemic might develop. The OSCE has invested heavily in the development of information and communication technologies, including the purchase of videoconferencing licences, to replace the need for staff to travel between different duty stations while the pandemic-related restrictions are in place. These investments must not go to waste; they need to be used in full for their entire benefit to be obtained. We do not believe it is cost-effective to maintain the technical capacity to carry out business contacts online and, at the same time, increase spending on travel. When

discussing the Unified Budget Proposal for 2022, the Russian Federation intends to oppose such increase in expenditure unless it can be justified for compelling programmatic reasons.

We have noted with interest the Secretary General's initiative of conducting a functional review of the Secretariat. We call for this process to be extended to all executive structures and used to address the long-overdue imbalance in the funding of the OSCE's three dimensions. The overabundance of resources in the humanitarian "basket" requires decisive action to redistribute them in favour of the first and second dimensions.

In that context, we should also like to recall the recommendation made by the Court of Accounts of France (Cour des comptes of France) acting as the OSCE External Auditor following the audit of the human resources management system in 2020. This is a strategic review of all posts in the OSCE. As far as we remember, a review of this nature was recently carried out by the Secretariat and resulted in the adoption of specific measures leading to increased efficiency in staff costs. The question is, when do other executive structures intend to undertake such a review with an eye to achieving practical savings? We constantly hear complaints, especially from the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, about a supposed lack of funds. A strategic review of the post table, followed by the removal of obsolete or non-priority activities, would be the perfect way of addressing this problem in the medium term in the context of zero nominal growth.

We share the concerns raised regarding the practice of belated adoption of the Unified Budget. We should like to reiterate Russia's commitment to working constructively to reach consensus on the 2022 draft budget decision as soon as possible. At the same time, we emphasize that it is not the first year that the participating States have been considering the OSCE Audit Committee's recommendation to amend Financial Regulation 3.04 in order to provide the Organization with quarterly allotments after the first three months of the year, when the Unified Budget has not yet been adopted. We believe this would greatly facilitate the work of all executive structures in the absence of an approved budget estimate, increasing the predictability of their financial situation. We regret that some participating States continue to block this solution. We urge the Secretary General to push more actively for this solution in the relevant discussions.

We understand that the work lying ahead of us will be difficult. We are counting on fruitful and pragmatic co-operation with our colleagues from Poland, who recently assumed the chairmanship of the Advisory Committee on Management and Finance. We hope that they will take into account the experience of their predecessors and will be able to complete the work on the OSCE Unified Budget Proposal without undue delay.

I request that this statement be attached to the journal of today's meeting of the Permanent Council.

Thank you for your attention.



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.JOUR/1340
21 October 2021
Annex 2

Original: ENGLISH

1340th Plenary Meeting
PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 1

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF AZERBAIJAN**

Madam Chairperson,

The delegation of the Republic of Azerbaijan thanks Ms. Helga Maria Schmid, Secretary General of the OSCE for presenting 2022 Unified Budget Proposal. We will carefully study the budget proposal and will convey our comments and suggestions in due course during the discussions of specific funds in the Advisory Committee on Management and Finance (ACMF). At this stage, we would like to limit our intervention to some initial general observations.

We reiterate that full respect to and implementation of the OSCE principles and commitments across all three dimensions of security should be a priority of our Organization. Addressing often cross-dimensional challenges will require ensuring an appropriate balance across all three dimensions, which should be reflected accordingly in the programmatic work of the OSCE executive structures.

In accordance with the Permanent Council Decision No. 553 (PC.DEC/553) of 2003 on the OSCE's Unified Budget process, the OSCE adheres to the principle of programme budgeting. Accordingly, Fund Managers are expected to submit to the Secretary General for consideration budget proposals for their respective Funds that clearly define annual objectives and elaborate programmes in support of achieving these objectives and presenting the full resource costs required.

The Permanent Council in its decision on approval of the 2021 Unified Budget acknowledged that agreement could not yet be found on all programmatic activities and that there is the need to continue these discussions. In particular, no consensus could be reached on the future potential programmatic activities, objectives and planned outputs related to the Minsk Process, Personal Representative of the Chairperson-in-Office (PRCiO) and High-Level Planning Group (HLPG), which is subject to ongoing discussions in light of the trilateral statement signed by Azerbaijan, Armenia and Russia on 10 November 2020 that put an end to the armed conflict between Armenia and Azerbaijan. The Permanent Council in its decision specifically underlined that "the budget composition as presented in Annex I of the 2021 Unified Budget reflects an expenditure pattern specific to the 2021 and should not be seen as setting an annual base line for the allocation of resources in the 2022 Unified Budget Proposal".

The current proposal on the Funds related to the Minsk Process, PRCiO and HLPG does not reflect the new situation that emerged with the signing of the above-mentioned trilateral statement. Instead, it contains programmatic activities, objectives and planned outputs based on old narratives and assumptions that do not reflect the new situation and do not enjoy consensus within the Organization as reflected in the Permanent Council decision on the 2021 Unified Budget. As such, it cannot form a basis for consideration. Thus being said, we request Fund Managers of the above-mentioned Funds to reconsider their concrete proposal accordingly and to continue discussions on their programmatic activities, objectives and outputs as directed by the Permanent Council. This will allow for consideration of resource costs required for these Funds and timely adoption of the Budget.

The economic and environmental dimension as an important pillar of the OSCE's comprehensive concept of security has untapped potential and has to be further explored and developed. Improving implementation of commitments of the participating States in the economic and environmental dimension, strengthening its effectiveness and efficiency, including through further improvement of the organizational structure of this dimension will increase its relevance, help promote implementation of commitments in all other dimensions and will contribute to security and stability of the participating States. We welcome the intention of the Office of the Co-ordinator of Economic and Environmental Activities (OCEEA) to focus on connectivity through trade and transport facilitation, strengthening co-operation on energy security, digitalization and the opportunities it creates, promoting good economic and environmental governance, preventing and combating corruption and money laundering.

The OSCE, with its comprehensive concept of security and an extensive set of commitments, is well positioned to play a special role in combating intolerance in all its forms and manifestations in its region. Combating intolerance, xenophobia, including Islamophobia and anti-Semitism, promotion of inter-cultural and inter-religious dialogue are all of great importance in this regard. Strict adherence to all OSCE principles and commitments by all participating States is a key for eradicating serious consequences of hatred and intolerance. In this regard, Azerbaijan is determined to continue co-operation within the OSCE and is ready to share its experiences in this field. As one of the world's recognized centres of multiculturalism, our country attaches primary importance to the promotion of intercultural and interreligious dialogue at the national and international levels.

In conclusion, we wish every success to the delegation of Poland to the OSCE, which assumed the chairmanship of ACMF, in timely adoption of the 2022 Unified Budget and stand ready for constructive engagement to this end.

I request that this statement be attached to the journal of the day.

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.JOUR/1340
21 October 2021
Annex 3

Original: ENGLISH

1340th Plenary Meeting

PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 3(c)

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF ARMENIA**

Madam Chairperson,

I should like to start by informing the Permanent Council about the situation on the ground and the continued provocations by the Azerbaijani armed forces along the line of contact in Artsakh and the Armenia-Azerbaijan State border.

At the last meeting of the Permanent Council on 11 October, we informed participating States about the murder by sniper fire of Aram Tepnants, a civilian from the occupied village of Mataghis who was working on a field near the town of Martakert in the presence of Russian peacekeepers. The fact that the shot was fired from the Azerbaijani side was confirmed by the Russian peacekeepers.

On 14 October, in another gross violation by the Azerbaijani armed forces of the ceasefire established by the trilateral statement of 9 November 2020, six soldiers from the Artsakh Defence Army were wounded near the village of Norshen in Artsakh. The Azerbaijani military continued its ceasefire violations the next day, 15 October, by opening fire at a medical vehicle of the Defence Army in the north-east of Artsakh.

On 15 October, the Azerbaijani armed forces opened fire in the direction of the Armenian village of Yeraskh, on the western segment of the Armenia-Azerbaijan State border, setting fire to and damaging several buildings.

This was the second serious violation of the ceasefire by Azerbaijan within a week, targeting both civilians and military personnel. In its various statements, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Armenia has stressed the need for these crimes to be properly investigated and the perpetrators brought to justice.

Madam Chairperson,

The Armenian delegation has repeatedly raised here at the Permanent Council the plight of Armenian prisoners of war and civilian hostages held by Azerbaijan contrary to, and in violation of, the requirements of international humanitarian law and the trilateral ceasefire statement of 9 November 2020. This is the most pressing issue related to the trilateral statement that still remains unresolved.

We acknowledge and thank those of our international partners who continue to raise this issue bilaterally and in multilateral forums, calling on Azerbaijan to comply with its obligations under international humanitarian law and the trilateral statement and to release all the prisoners of war and civilian hostages in its custody. In this regard, I wish to inform delegations that two days ago, after almost one year of illegal captivity, five Armenian prisoners of war returned to Armenia, with the assistance of Russia.

At the same time, Azerbaijan continues to conceal the real number of Armenian prisoners of war. Moreover, the mock trials and the handing down of lengthy sentences on bogus charges against prisoners of war illustrate the anti-Armenian hate policy and smear campaign adopted and promoted in Azerbaijan at the highest level.

This attitude or, rather, policy of racial discrimination that has persisted in Azerbaijan for decades manifested itself most clearly during last year's war, which in the course of 44 days resulted in widespread and systematic violations of international humanitarian law and international human rights law.

We have predictably seen energetic attempts by Azerbaijan to twist and manipulate international law, including international humanitarian law, with the aim of covering up the atrocities and war crimes that it committed during the 44-day war of aggression. This includes attempts at whitewashing its misdeeds by mirroring the actions of Armenia and making allegations that are, however, utterly groundless, unsubstantiated and manipulative.

Despite this long-standing tactic of Azerbaijan, which is clearly aimed at establishing ostensible parity between the sides, Armenia will continue to denounce the policy of anti-Armenian racial discrimination pursued by Azerbaijan.

In this regard, I should recall that we have already informed the Permanent Council of the case filed by Armenia at the International Court of Justice regarding the systematic violations by Azerbaijan of the provisions of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination – violations that intensified during the war of aggression. Armenia brought the case to the Court after almost one year of negotiations that failed to yield any result.

Yesterday, the Court concluded the public hearings in relation to the requested provisional measures. The hearings themselves were extremely important, since they provided the general public with an opportunity to learn about the extent and depth of the anti-Armenian racial discriminatory policy conducted by the Azerbaijani leadership for decades. Successive generations of Azerbaijanis have been indoctrinated with a culture of fear and hatred towards everything Armenian.

Murder, torture and other forms of inhumane or degrading treatment of ethnic Armenians who find themselves under the authority of Azerbaijan are carried out systematically, as are the rewarding and even glorification of the perpetrators, together with the persecution of anyone who dares to question the official dogma.

The continuous destruction of Armenian cultural heritage and religious sites in the areas of Artsakh that fell under Azerbaijani control and the negation of their Armenian origin are further manifestations of anti-Armenian racial discrimination.

Using its mirroring tactic, which I have already mentioned, Azerbaijan also filed a case against Armenia at the International Court of Justice, invoking the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. However, Azerbaijan was unable to establish any plausible link to rights arising under the Convention.

One of the main arguments exploited by Azerbaijan during the public hearings had to do with the laying of landmines, which was presented as an example of a policy of racial discrimination. Setting aside the fact that landmines are not a discriminatory type of defensive weapon, Armenia has no legal or political obligation with regard to these landmines, which were first and foremost the result of the first Nagorno-Karabakh war and were used as a line of defence. Moreover, it is worth stressing that hundreds of thousands of landmines were laid by Azerbaijan itself in the early 1990s. The presence of mines in the conflict region has affected everybody.

Here at the OSCE at least it should be well known that Armenia for decades strove to complete comprehensive demining activities, which it considered to be a purely humanitarian issue. However, Azerbaijan persistently blocked all such humanitarian efforts because the people of Artsakh would have been the primary beneficiaries. Only now, when these territories have been ethnically cleansed and/or Armenians have been forced to flee, does Azerbaijan suddenly discover the value of demining and begin to request assistance from the OSCE and its participating States.

I should emphasize once again, for the record, that Armenia has no legal or political obligation whatsoever with regard to landmines. The attempts by some delegations to link and establish an equivalence between demining and the return of prisoners of war, which is an obligation of Azerbaijan under the Geneva Conventions of 1949 and their Additional Protocols as well as a commitment under the trilateral statement of 9 November 2020, do not stand up to scrutiny.

Madam Chairperson,

More than one year has passed since the establishment of the ceasefire that halted the hostilities of the second Nagorno-Karabakh war. Unfortunately, though, the situation in the region remains highly volatile.

Azerbaijan continues its provocative actions along the line of contact with Artsakh and on the border with Armenia, periodically escalating tensions in the region. Following the illegal incursion by units of the Azerbaijani armed forces into the sovereign territory of the Republic of Armenia on 12 May 2021 and their presence there ever since then, Azerbaijan also continues to intimidate the border residents of Armenia, creating an atmosphere of fear, depriving them of their livelihoods and forcing them to flee from their homes.

The Armenian delegation has continuously warned the international community – during and after the 44-day war – of the imminent prospect of the conflict spilling over

beyond the region and leading to the involvement of other actors. These concerns are still valid.

We are also concerned about the timing of the aforementioned recent escalation, which has occurred so soon after the meeting of the Foreign Ministers of Armenia and Azerbaijan in New York facilitated by the Co-Chairs of the OSCE Minsk Group. That meeting at the end of September was seen by many as a sign of prospective revitalization of the peace process and as heralding a much needed and long-overdue visit by the Co-Chairs to the region. We do not consider this escalation to be a coincidence.

Azerbaijan's bellicose and aggressive statements and hostile actions continue to destabilize the region. Each escalation, provocation and ceasefire violation makes the prospect of achieving peace and security seem ever more remote.

Moreover, in an attempt to evade responsibility for its non-implementation of the requirements of the trilateral statement, Azerbaijan continuously distorts the essence of its provisions. We should be accustomed by now to the continued manipulative statements and rhetoric by Azerbaijan here in this room: today will not be an exception.

Madam Chairperson,

The current situation in Nagorno-Karabakh is the result of a flagrant violation by Azerbaijan of several core principles of the Helsinki Final Act, namely refraining from the threat or use of force; the peaceful settlement of disputes; equal rights and self-determination of peoples; and respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. No one should be under any illusion that the results of the use of force, accompanied by war crimes and violations of international humanitarian law, can ever become the basis for a lasting and sustainable peace. Such peace can be achieved in the region only through a comprehensive settlement of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict, which must include the determination of the status of Artsakh on the basis of the realization by the people of Artsakh of their inalienable right to self-determination; the ensuring of the safe and dignified return of displaced population to their homes; and the preservation of the region's historical and religious heritage.

Madam Chairperson, I kindly ask you to attach this statement to the journal of today's meeting.

Thank you.



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.JOUR/1340
21 October 2021
Annex 4

Original: ENGLISH

1340th Plenary Meeting
PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 3(f)

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF TURKEY**

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.

I thank the delegation of the Russian Federation for raising this current issue. I also thank the delegations of Canada and Azerbaijan for delivering strong messages.

Racism, xenophobia, hatred of Islam and hate speech are disturbingly on the rise throughout the world, constituting one of the biggest threats against our common values as well as against the peace and harmony of our societies.

Every day, Muslims around the world are increasingly becoming primary victims of discrimination, hate speech and hate crimes simply because of their faith.

I could cite many examples from various OSCE participating States. However, I will refrain from doing so and, instead, share specific data from just one participating State.

An NGO involved in combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims has reported a 33 per cent increase of anti-Muslim incidents in that State between 2019 and 2020. There is a significant gender dimension in the data: 74 per cent of the victims were women, while 73 per cent of the perpetrators were men.

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) noted “high levels of Islamophobia” in that country. It further reported that “[p]olitical speech has taken on highly divisive and antagonistic overtones particularly targeting Muslims and refugees.”

Anti-migrant and anti-Muslim public discourse fuels prejudice and intolerance, creating a poisonous atmosphere especially in Western Europe. Regrettably, some short-sighted politicians continue to add fuel to the flames.

We are also concerned about the recent legislative steps taken by some European countries aimed at increasing control over Muslim communities, which we think do contradict with the universal values and principles that we all stand for and defend here in this Organization.

The COVID-19 pandemic has served as yet another pretext to unleash hatred against vulnerable groups. All too often, hate speech prepares the ground or even spills over into hate crimes.

In his message on the occasion of the United Nations International Day Commemorating the Victims of Acts of Violence Based on Religion or Belief, the Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), Matteo Mecacci, stated the following: “COVID-19 has caused untold suffering throughout our societies, but we have been seeing intolerance and hatred increasing specifically against people belonging to religious or belief groups since the outbreak of the pandemic. [...] Not only does this have a hugely negative impact on individuals and communities, but it also erodes democracy, respect for human rights, and security more broadly [...].”

Similarly, in their joint message issued on 20 August, the three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office, Rabbi Andrew Baker, Associate Professor Regina Polak and Ambassador Mehmet Paçacı, denounced the “proliferation of online intolerance”.

We value the existing toolbox of the OSCE and in particular ODIHR. However, we, the participating States have to collectively augment our efforts and enable our Organization to achieve even more.

We hope that this year, the participating States will finally demonstrate the necessary ownership and responsibility by adopting a declaration addressing intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, Christians and members of other religions, in line with the tasking from the Basel Ministerial Council in 2014.

Turkey will continue its active efforts and initiatives with a view to keeping the fight against anti-Islam course high on the agenda of international and regional organizations.

I request that this statement be attached to the journal of the day.

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.JOUR/1340
21 October 2021
Annex 5

Original: ENGLISH

1340th Plenary Meeting

PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 3(h)

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF SPAIN (ALSO ON BEHALF OF
KYRGYZSTAN AND THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA)**

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.

On behalf of the Co-Chairs of the Group of Friends of Youth and Security, Spain welcomes the opportunity to commemorate the International Day of the Girl Child.

Girls are vital participants in securing our common security. Through the contribution of their unique perspectives, States are better able to address the greatest security challenges of our time, including the areas of concern outlined by OSCE's Perspectives 20–30 Core Group of Experts, namely: building peace, addressing the impact of new technologies, addressing the climate crisis, and ensuring the advance of human rights, and equality for all.

Efforts to attain these goals must recognize the unique challenges girls face to achieving their full potential, including unequal access to education and healthcare, the threat of violence inside and outside the home, and comparatively less economic security than their male counterparts. Sadly, many of these challenges to girls achieving their full potential have been exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic.

The OSCE plays a valuable role in advancing States' commitments to young women and men. Through inclusive, sustained, and meaningful initiatives such as the Junior Professional Officer programme, youth advisory groups, scholarships, trainings, and engagement through national programme delivery, and those opportunities advanced by the OSCE Academy in Bishkek, the OSCE provides girls with a variety of options for their meaningful participation in shaping decisions which affect them.

But more can always be done. We invite delegations to approach Group Co-Chairs to discuss ways in which we can use the OSCE and its participating States to advance the peace and security agendas across our region. We also invite you to join the next meeting of the Group on 29 October, when I will lead a discussion on "investing in education for safer societies". I am confident that, through a range of efforts, we can remove the barriers to girls' aspirations and in so doing build societies which are safer, more secure, and more prosperous.

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.



1340th Plenary Meeting

PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 3(k)

**STATEMENT BY
THE DELEGATION OF AZERBAIJAN**

Madam Chairperson,

The delegation of Azerbaijan would like to bring to the attention of the Permanent Council the recent gross violation by Armenia of its obligations under the trilateral statement of 10 November 2020 signed by the leaders of Armenia, Azerbaijan and the Russian Federation.

On 14 October 2021, an Azerbaijani serviceman was killed by sniper fire opened by illegal Armenian armed detachments in the territory of Azerbaijan, where Russian peacekeepers are temporarily deployed. It is particularly deplorable that this provocation took place at a time of a meeting between Foreign Ministers of Azerbaijan, Armenia and Russia. This is indicative of Armenia's policy of deliberately aggravating the situation in the region, jeopardizing the implementation of the provisions of the trilateral statements and obstructing the activities of temporarily deployed Russian peacekeepers. It also demonstrates once again that revanchist attitude is still prevailing in Armenia in the post-conflict period, undermining the prospects for consolidating peace and stability in the region.

We also draw the attention of the Permanent Council to other provocations committed by Armenia in the period from 13 to 15 October 2021. On 13 October, a column of vehicles with non-military cargo moving from Sugovushan settlement of Tartar region to Kalbajar region of Azerbaijan to build civilian infrastructure in the liberated territories was subjected to fire by illegal Armenian armed detachments near Gozlukorpu settlement. Fortunately, no one was killed or wounded, and only the car of the military police of the Azerbaijani side was damaged.

On 15 October illegal Armenian armed detachments with the use of a civilian ambulance attempted to commit a terrorist provocation against the units of the armed forces of Azerbaijan in the Aghdere direction. This attempt was fortunately suppressed by the armed forces of Azerbaijan. Relevant requests were sent by the Azerbaijan side to the Command of the Russian peacekeeping forces temporarily stationed in Azerbaijan and Russian-Turkish joint monitoring centre to investigate aforementioned terrorist acts and provocations.

Armenia's recent destructive behaviour fits well into the track record of provocations by Armenian side carried out on the eve, in the course or in the immediate aftermath of the

meetings between the Foreign Ministers or leaders of the two countries when the conflict was still ongoing. Armenia behaved similarly during the last year's 44-day war by violating humanitarian ceasefires agreed in Moscow and Geneva immediately after they came into force. When the conflict was still ongoing such behaviour of Armenia was aimed at derailing the peace process in order to avoid engaging in a peaceful negotiated solution to the conflict and continue the military occupation of the territories of Azerbaijan. Under the current circumstances, when the conflict is resolved, Armenia seeks to jeopardize the vision for durable peace, security and stability provided by the trilateral statements.

The recent provocations of Armenia are highly alarming and testify to an urgent need for ensuring the full implementation of the trilateral statements. In particular, we remind that the trilateral statement of 10 November 2020 put an end to all military activities between Armenia and Azerbaijan and envisaged the full withdrawal of Armenian armed forces from the territories of Azerbaijan. Armenia has yet to fully comply with the Article 4 of the statement, which requires Armenia to withdraw its armed forces from the territories of Azerbaijan in parallel with the temporary deployment of the Russian Federation's peacekeeping contingent.

Armenia also refuses to implement Article 9 of the 10 November 2020 trilateral statement, which envisages restoration of all economic and transport links in the region supplemented by another trilateral statement signed on 11 January 2021. This is one of the areas that can serve the cause of irreversible peace and co-operation in the region. In this context, the Zangazur corridor connecting mainland Azerbaijan with its inseparable part – the Nakhchivan Autonomous Republic – and Turkey will create new opportunities for the whole region.

Another serious challenge is posed by landmines planted by Armenia on a massive scale in the formerly occupied territories of Azerbaijan. Since the signing of the trilateral statement of 10 November 2020, around 30 Azerbaijani citizens, including two journalists, were killed, and around 130 citizens were wounded. Presently Azerbaijan is among the most heavily mined countries in the world. It slows down the rehabilitation and reconstruction process in the liberated territories and poses a significant barrier to the return of internally displaced persons to their homes. It is deplorable that Armenia refuses to release accurate maps of the minefields. The accuracy level of the maps for the three regions, which Armenia had to submit thus far, is only 25 per cent. The international community, including the OSCE must put additional pressure onto Armenia to provide accurate mine maps of all liberated territories of Azerbaijan, in line with Armenia's obligations under customary international law.

Furthermore, Armenia has yet to implement its obligations with regard to identifying the whereabouts of close to 4,000 Azerbaijanis missing since the armed hostilities in the beginning of 1990s. It is of urgent necessity to ensure that their fates are finally established and all those who committed serious war crimes against these Azerbaijanis are brought to justice. This is important for healing the wounds of the former conflict.

Meanwhile, Azerbaijan continues to take unilateral goodwill steps in humanitarian sphere. Most recently, on 19 October 2021, Azerbaijan has released five Armenian detainees. This was preceded by the release of another Armenian detainee on 6 October. We recall that overall since the end of the conflict Azerbaijan returned to Armenia more than 100 Armenian

prisoners of war and detainees in line with the provisions of the trilateral statement and international humanitarian law. Azerbaijan also created conditions for the search and retrieval of remains of the fallen Armenian servicemen. Members of the armed forces of Azerbaijan risk their lives to facilitate the retrieval operations in areas heavily mined by Armenia. So far the remains of around 1,700 deceased Armenian servicemen were located and handed over to the Armenian side.

Against this background, the recent provocations of the Armenian side confirm for another time that apparently this country feels emboldened by statements and wrong signals of some participating States which attempt to reanimate obsolete conflict narratives and concepts. We reiterate our call on those participating States to refrain from such messages, as they can in no way contribute to consolidation of fragile peace and stability in our region. On the contrary, as the recent events have demonstrated, such signals encourage Armenia to believe in an alternative to solidifying peace and normalizing relations with its neighbours, to divert from implementing the provisions of the trilateral statements in good faith and to sustain revanchist attitudes prevailing in Armenia in the post-conflict period.

At the current critical juncture in our region, when joint efforts must be undertaken in order to consolidate fragile peace and stability which emerged with the end of the armed conflict and the signing of the trilateral statements, Armenia bears full responsibility for aggravating the situation. Azerbaijan reserves the right to adequately respond to Armenia's provocations and to protect its sovereignty and territorial integrity.

In closing, we reiterate that it is essential for Armenia to soberly assess the new realities and not to rely on miscalculations or false expectations that could jeopardize fragile peace in the region established with the signing of the trilateral statement. Instead, Armenia should reciprocate the constructive offer of Azerbaijan and seize the historic opportunity to normalize its relations with neighbouring countries, which will open up immense opportunities for this country and for the broader region.

I request that this statement be attached to the journal of the day.

Thank you, Madam Chairperson.



1340th Plenary Meeting
PC Journal No. 1340, Agenda item 6

STATEMENT BY THE DELEGATION OF MALTA

On 16 October, we marked the fourth anniversary of the heinous assassination of the Maltese journalist Daphne Caruana Galizia.

Ms. Caruana Galizia was killed because she did not fear to speak out. She was killed by those who wanted to silence her.

Although they ostensibly did manage to silence her, it is now our responsibility not only to honour her work and her memory, but also to ensure that the right environment is in place to prevent such an abominable crime from ever happening again. It is above all our responsibility to ensure that Ms. Caruana Galizia's words are spoken even louder now, after her death. This can only be achieved if the necessary lessons are learned, and justice is fully served.

In the wake of the assassination, Malta embarked on a difficult process, but it is one that has led to a number of positive developments, which we believe have brought us ever closer to achieving justice.

Earlier this year, there were important developments on the judicial front. A total of six individuals are facing justice in connection with their involvement in the case. These include the suspected mastermind, who was formally charged this summer after the compilation of evidence was concluded. He will face trial by jury once the preliminary pleas have been decided, as will the two other individuals involved in the case who were formally charged in the summer of 2019. One of the aforementioned six individuals has already been convicted and sentenced to 15 years after he pleaded guilty. The compilation of evidence is under way in relation to the remaining two individuals who earlier this year were charged with participation in the murder.

The report of the public inquiry into the assassination of Ms. Caruana Galizia was also published this summer. This inquiry was a landmark. The report concluded that although it had no direct role in the assassination, the State had to "shoulder responsibility". The Prime Minister of Malta immediately issued a public apology to the family of the late Ms. Caruana Galizia and initiated efforts to implement the report's recommendations, notably on strengthening journalism and freedom of expression as well as strengthening the protection of journalists in Malta.

As the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media put it, the publication of this report is “a significant step in achieving justice for Daphne”.

I wish to express my sincere gratitude to the Office of the Representative on Freedom of the Media for the regular and open exchange of information, and also for the support it has extended to Malta in our efforts aimed at creating the right framework to ensure that journalists can continue exercising their profession with full dignity and without any fear. The Office of the Representative on Freedom of the Media plays a fundamental role in enhancing the capacity of participating States to improve their standards.

The assassination of Ms. Caruana Galizia, like those of other journalists, is a direct attack on the principles to which we have all committed ourselves, and which we must uphold. No country is immune to such attacks. It is therefore our collective responsibility to continue working tirelessly, together with the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media, to honour our commitments and ensure full implementation of the provisions agreed on in the Milan Ministerial Council Decision No. 3/18 on the safety of journalists (MC.DEC/3/18).