



## **OSCE Chairmanship Conference on Tolerance and Diversity in the Federal Foreign Office on 20 October 2016 Pre-Conference for Civil Society on 19 October 2016**

### ***Opening***

On 20 October 2016, more than 350 delegates from the OSCE participating and partner States met in the Federal Foreign Office in Berlin for an OSCE Chairmanship Conference on Tolerance and Diversity.<sup>1</sup> **Federal Foreign Minister and OSCE Chairperson-in-Office Frank-Walter Steinmeier** opened the Conference together with **Daniel Barenboim, General Musical Director of the Staatsoper Berlin**. In his speech, Minister Steinmeier called upon the participants to see and use diversity as an opportunity for our societies and to counter the growing phenomenon of nationalism and spreading hate speech by putting in place a shared framework of principles. In the OSCE and also in Germany, such a framework of principles and values has a firm foundation, the foundation of OSCE commitments, the UN Declarations and Pacts as well as the German Basic Law. These cover the principles of basic rights, human dignity and the rule of law, the Minister said.

In his speech, Professor Barenboim addressed the ability of diversity to further the principle of respect and tolerance and underscore equality. For him, the concept of diversity overrides the principle of tolerance. By performing Robert Schumann's Piano Quintet in E-flat major, op. 44, together with four string players from his West-Eastern Divan Orchestra, all with different backgrounds and heritages, Daniel Barenboim demonstrated that even supposed contradictions can co-exist peacefully as long as there is dialogue.

The German **actress and author Renan Demirhan** took up this train of thought and developed it further in terms of respect, democracy and freedom of cultures. She, too, called upon the participants to engage in continued dialogue and to accept and understand one another.

### ***Opening panel***

The opening panel saw a discussion on the fundamental need to respect human rights and fundamental freedoms with contributions by **Michael Georg Link**, Director, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, ODIHR, **Nils Muižnieks**, Council of Europe

---

<sup>1</sup> The programmes of the Conference on 20 October and the Pre-Conference for Civil Society on 19 October are attached.

Commissioner for Human Rights, **Anastasia Crickley**, Chairperson the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, and **Lotte Leicht**, EU Director, Human Rights Watch. They reaffirmed that, without the respect and upholding of human rights and basic freedoms, there could not be peaceful co-existence within and between our societies. They emphasised the importance of open and pluralist societies and the acceptance of different world views while noting that contempt of human rights, extremist ideologies and discrimination do not just endanger individuals, specific groups and minorities, but are in fact a threat to social cohesion as a whole.

This stance has been put to the test particularly given the global situation and the refugee crisis, they stressed. Refugees' right to protection is juxtaposed with the policies of the countries taking them in. The participants noted a moral crisis and an increase in discriminatory discourse in the light of the current migratory flows and the refugee crisis. They considered this resurgence of intolerance to pose a threat to the fundamental principles of our societies. It was often associated with criticism of existing standards and mechanisms of international law. But just as important as combating discrimination, for the panellists, is the need to defend the freedom of the media and opinion as well as educational work for and including all social groups, also minorities.

The panellists spoke out against prioritising certain forms of discrimination and rejected all forms of discrimination as unacceptable. For them, cooperation with non-governmental organisations and civil society is a sine qua non if discrimination is to be combated.

### ***Panel discussions***

The two panel discussions in the afternoon focused on education and on combating hate speech, particularly in the social media.

Panel I entitled **Education for Diversity and Tolerance: Encouraging Commonality and Combating Discrimination** brought contributions from:

- **Thomas Heppener**, Head of the Live Democracy! Programme, Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth
- Ambassador **Blanka Jamnič**, Human Rights Sector, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Slovenia
- **Wade Henderson**, President and CEO, Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights
- **Karen Polak**, Anne Frank House
- **Barbara Lochbihler**, Member of the European Parliament, Vice-Chairperson of the Subcommittee on Human Rights; Human Rights and Foreign Policy Spokeswoman of the Greens/EFA Parliamentary Group
- **Ian Feldman**, Chairperson, Council of the Prevention and Elimination of Discrimination and Ensuring Equality in the Republic of Moldova

Here, too, the contributions focused on the advantages of diversity as an enriching and strengthening force in our societies. For the panellists, the lessons to be learnt from diversity and tolerance should be enhanced by personal experience, for example, by studying one's

family history and getting to know the "others". Experience with civil society and cooperation with ODIHR and the OSCE were emphasised. According to the panel, the OSCE can play a role, for example by collecting data, making available teaching materials, providing training for schools, promoting cross-border dialogue, cooperating with other projects to combat discrimination or radicalisation.

Two pilot projects were presented: "Our rights"<sup>2</sup> and [www.storiesthatmove.org](http://www.storiesthatmove.org).

Emphasis was placed on the importance of a comprehensive approach in education policy. Compulsory further training for teaching staff to communicate the topic was also proposed. The panellists underscored the importance of including marginalised groups, not just in education work but above all in political work. Furthermore they emphasised the importance of reflecting on historical events in order to learn from the past. For the panellists, it is also important to create a positive and favourable learning environment and to benefit from the experiences of young people.

Panel II entitled **Tolerance and Freedom of Speech: Countering "Hate Speech" and Combating Discrimination on the Internet** brought contributions from:

- Ambassador **Anne Brasseur**, Ambassador of the No Hate Speech Movement, Council of Europe
- **Dunja Mijatović**, OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media
- **Ross LaJeunesse**, Global Head of International Relations, Google Inc.
- **Christian Lange**, Parliamentary State Secretary to the Federal Minister of Justice and Consumer Protection, Germany
- **Iman Abou Atta**, Deputy Director and Head, Middle East and North Africa Programmes, Faith Matters.

The discussion focused on the relationship between freedom of opinion and hate crime, a relationship which is not always conflict-free, and on ways of combating hate crime in social media and the Internet. The relationship and inseparability of freedom and security was also underscored by the panellists who believed that the Internet poses new challenges. Special emphasis was placed on the individual's responsibility and on the commitment and activities of civil society: within the framework of the law, users (digital citizens) should cite hate speech in the Internet, report it to relevant agencies and combat it with counter-arguments.

The panellists also emphasised the need for governments to provide stronger support as well as the responsibility of commercial providers. Some called for stricter regulation while others attached greater priority to freedom of opinion as a democratic right to be guaranteed at all cost. There was consensus on the positive aspects and functions of the Internet, also for minorities and marginalised groups or those suffering from discrimination. At the same time, the panellists believed that social media and Internet search engines as well as Internet providers and companies need to focus on the individual's right to protection from discrimination and on effectively combating hate speech. The panellists

---

<sup>2</sup>

[http://www.mzz.gov.si/en/foreign\\_policy\\_and\\_international\\_law/slovenian\\_foreign\\_policy\\_and\\_human\\_rights/the\\_our\\_rights\\_project\\_human\\_rights\\_education/](http://www.mzz.gov.si/en/foreign_policy_and_international_law/slovenian_foreign_policy_and_human_rights/the_our_rights_project_human_rights_education/)

advocated comprehensive protection of free speech. Blocking or removing content is for them not a measure that can be effective. To combat hate speech, the panellists believe counter-arguments and joint initiatives are more important.

### ***Pre-Conference for Civil Society***

The day before the Conference, on 19 October, more than 100 representatives of civil society from all across the OSCE area came together to discuss the conference issues and draw up recommendations for the Conference, the OSCE and its participating States.<sup>3</sup> The results of the discussions were fed into the panels by the participants and presented together in the Closing Panel of the Conference.

The participants emphasised the importance of the topic and the opportunity to discuss as civil society, particularly given the shrinking space for civil society engagement in some OSCE participating States. Several speakers referred to the 2014 Basel Declaration by the OSCE-wide NGO coalition Civic Solidarity Platform which calls upon OSCE States to do more to combat intolerance, discrimination and hate crime. Given the situation in the OSCE region, the participants underscored the continued relevance of this call.

The role of political actors who encourage discrimination by their words and deeds was seen as especially problematic. Attention was drawn to the ODIHR programmes and materials as useful and helpful counter-measures. At the same time, the speakers believed that the OSCE needs a comprehensive approach to combating intolerance. Thus, some participants advocated reviewing the mandates of the Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office to combat discrimination in order to facilitate more comprehensive work to combat all forms of intolerance, to develop a specific approach and make available the considerable funding required.

For the panellists, the role of the High Commissioner on National Minorities is particularly important when it comes to promoting diversity in society. Use should be made of the materials and recommendations issued by the High Commissioner when it comes to developing ways of promoting tolerance and combating discrimination. The civil society representatives also highlighted the importance of education work. Here, tolerance, the ban on discrimination and well as human rights should be taken as interdisciplinary topics in lessons and education establishments in general.

As ways to better combat discrimination, the speakers cited data collection on discriminatory incidents, training for police and the judiciary, simplified complaints procedures and advice for citizens in cases of discrimination, as well as improved implementation of recommendations issued by international players on anti-discrimination policy. Attention was also paid to the particular challenge posed by the refugee and migration crisis. When it comes to distributing resources and integration work, particular attention should be paid to local authorities and municipalities.

---

<sup>3</sup> These recommendations are enclosed.

## ANNEX 1 – Conference Programme

<b>PRE-CONFERENCE FOR CIVIL SOCIETY</b> Wednesday, 19 October 2016	
10:00 – 11:00	<b>Registration and Welcome Coffee</b> Venue: Europafoyer
11:00 – 13:00	<b>OPENING SESSION</b> Venue: Europasaal
11:00 – 11:30	<b>WELCOME SPEECH BY</b> <b>Dr Gernot Erler</b> , Special Representative of the Federal Government for the OSCE Chairmanship in 2016, Federal Foreign Office, Germany
11:30 – 13:00	<b>DISCUSSION: State and Non-State Actors and Their Role in Promoting Tolerance and Diversity</b>  <b>Experts:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ms Izabela Kisic</b>, Director, Helsinki Committee for Human Rights in Serbia, Serbia</li> <li>• <b>Ms June Zeitlin</b>, Director, Human Rights Policy, The Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights / The Leadership Conference Education Fund, United States of America</li> <li>• <b>Mr Larry Olomofe</b>, Adviser on Combating Racism and Xenophobia, Training Co-ordinator, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, United Kingdom</li> </ul> <b>Chair: Dr Almut Möller</b> , European Council on Foreign Relations, Germany (Simultaneous interpretation: English-Russian-German)
13:00 – 14:00	<b>Lunch /Market of Ideas</b> Presentation of Projects, Good Practices, Initiatives
14:00 – 16:30	<b>PARALLEL WORKING GROUP DISCUSSIONS I-IV</b>

	<p><b>WORKING GROUP I: Education for Tolerance and Diversity</b>  Venue: Europasaal</p> <p><b>Experts:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ms Oleksandra Delemenchuk</b>, Analytical Center for Interethnic Cooperation and Consultations ACICC, Georgia</li> <li>• <b>Mr Aycan Demirel</b>, Kreuzberg Initiative against Anti-Semitism KIgA, Germany</li> <li>• <b>Mr Szalai Kálmán</b>, Action and Protection Foundation, Hungary</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Mr Harry Hummel</b>, Netherlands Helsinki Committee, Netherlands  <b>Rapporteur: Ms Karen Polak</b>, Anne Frank House, Netherlands</p> <p>(Simultaneous interpretation: English-Russian-German)</p>
	<p><b>WORKING GROUP II: Combating Hatred in Social Media – Exploring Interrelations with Freedom of Opinion and Expression</b>  Venue: Willy-Brandt-Saal</p> <p><b>Experts:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Mr Steffen Eisentraut</b>, INACH International Network Against Cyberhate, Germany</li> <li>• <b>Mr Zdravko Cimbalević</b>, Rainbow Refugee, Montenegro / Canada</li> <li>• <b>Mr Øyvind Strømmen</b>, Hate Speech International, Norway</li> <li>• <b>Ms Inga Sikorskaia</b>, School of Peacemaking and Media Technology in Central Asia, Kyrgyzstan</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Ms Susan Corke</b>, Human Rights First, United States of America  <b>Rapporteur: Ms Iman Abou Atta</b>, Faith Matters, United Kingdom</p> <p>(Simultaneous interpretation: English-Russian)</p>

	<p><b>WORKING GROUP III: Effective Safeguards against Discrimination</b></p> <p>Venue: Adenauer-Saal</p> <p><b>Experts:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Mr Daniel Bartel</b>, Anti-Discrimination Association Germany, Germany</li> <li>• <b>Ms Jamie Bolling</b>, ENIL European Network on Independent Living, Sweden</li> <li>• <b>Mr Piotr Godzisz</b>, Polish Coalition against Hate Crimes / Lambda Warsaw, Poland</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Dr Mattia F. Ferrero</b>, “Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom, Italy</p> <p><b>Rapporteur: Dr Christoph Lanz</b>, Swiss Helsinki Committee, Switzerland</p> <p>(Simultaneous interpretation: English-Russian)</p>
	<p><b>WORKING GROUP IV: Multi-Community Civil Society Alliances For Joint Advocacy</b></p> <p>Venue: Stresemann-Saal</p> <p><b>Experts:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Mr Ralph du Long</b>, UNITED for Intercultural Action / Civic Solidarity Platform, Netherlands</li> <li>• <b>Ms Tina Stavrinaki</b>, Racist Violence Recording Network, Greece</li> <li>• <b>Mr Nicolas Tavitian</b>, Europe of Diasporas, Belgium / Armenia</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Mr Ilja Sichrovsky</b>, Muslim-Jewish Conference, Austria</p> <p><b>Rapporteur: Ms Stacy Burdett</b>, Anti-Defamation League, United States of America</p> <p>(Simultaneous interpretation: English-Russian)</p>
16:30 – 17:00	<p><b>Coffee Break /Market of Ideas</b></p> <p>Presentation of Projects, Good Practices, Initiatives</p>

17:00 – 18:00	<b>CLOSING SESSION</b> Venue: Europasaal
	<b>Wrapping-up Civil Society Recommendations to the OSCE Chairmanship Conference on Tolerance and Diversity</b>  <b>Closing Remarks</b>  <b>Chair: Mr Peter Wittschorek</b> , Outreach Coordinator OSCE Chairmanship 2016, Center for International Peace Operations, Germany



**OSCE CHAIRMANSHIP CONFERENCE ON  
TOLERANCE AND DIVERSITY**

**Berlin, 20 October 2016**

08:30 – 9:45	<p><b>Registration</b> Venue: Europafoyer</p> <p><b>Network Breakfast</b> Venue: Side Lounge, Weltsaal</p>
10:00 – 13:00	<p><b>OPENING SESSION</b> Venue: Weltsaal</p>
10:00 – 11:00	<p><b>WELCOME SPEECH BY Federal Minister for Foreign Affairs Frank-Walter Steinmeier, OSCE Chairperson-in-Office</b></p> <p><b>WELCOME BY DISTINGUISHED GUEST: Maestro Daniel Barenboim</b> General Music Director of the Staatsoper Unter den Linden, Berlin</p> <p><b>Musical interlude:</b> Robert Schumann (1810 – 1856) Piano Quintet in E-flat major, Op. 44 I: Allegro brillante</p> <p><b>Performed by Daniel Barenboim with Members of the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra</b> Violin I: Guy Braunstein Violin II: Tyme Khleifi Viola: Sadra Fayyaz Cello: Astrig Siranossian Piano: Daniel Barenboim</p> <p><b>FOOD FOR THOUGHT: Ms Renan Demirkan, Actress and Author</b></p> <p><b>Chair: Mr Ali Aslan, TV Presenter and Journalist</b></p>
11:00 – 11:30	<p><b>COFFEE BREAK</b> Venue: Side Lounges, Weltsaal</p>
11:30 – 13:00	<p><b>PANEL DISCUSSION: Respect for Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms</b></p>

	<p><b>as a Basis for Tolerance and Social Cohesion</b></p> <p><b>PANELLISTS:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Mr Michael Georg Link</b>, Director, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights</li> <li>• <b>Ms Lotte Leicht</b>, EU Director, Human Rights Watch</li> <li>• <b>Ms Anastasia Crickley</b>, Chairperson of the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination</li> <li>• <b>Mr Nils Muiznieks</b>, Commissioner for Human Rights, Council of Europe</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Mr Ali Aslan</b>, TV Presenter and Journalist</p>
<b>13:00 – 14:30</b>	<p><b>LUNCH</b> Venue: Side Lounges, Weltsaal</p>
<b>13:20 – 14:20</b>	<p><b>SIDE EVENTS</b></p> <p><b>Dangerous Speech Project</b> Presentation by Professor Susan Benesch, Project Director, Faculty Associate of the Berkman Center for Internet and Society at Harvard University (Venue: Rathenau-Saal)</p> <p><b>Responding to Hate Crimes against Migrants</b> Presentation by OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) (Venue: Stresemann-Saal)</p>
<b>14:30 – 16:30</b>	<p><b>PARALLEL PANELS</b></p>
	<p><b>PANEL I: Education for Diversity and Tolerance: Encouraging Commonality and Combating Discrimination (Venue: Europasaal)</b></p> <p><b>PANELLISTS:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Mr Thomas Heppener</b>, Head of the <i>Live Democracy!</i> Programme, German Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth</li> <li>• <b>Ambassador Blanka Jamnič</b>, Human Rights Sector, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Slovenia</li> <li>• <b>Mr Wade Henderson</b>, President and CEO, Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights</li> <li>• <b>Ms Karen Polak</b>, Anne Frank House</li> <li>• <b>Ms Barbara Lochbihler</b>, Member of the European Parliament, Vice-Chairperson of the Subcommittee on Human Rights; Human Rights and Foreign Policy Spokeswoman of the Greens/EFA Parliamentary Group</li> <li>• <b>Mr Ian Feldman</b>, Chairperson, Council on the Prevention and</li> </ul>

	<p>Elimination of Discrimination and Ensuring Equality in the Republic of Moldova</p> <p><b>Chair: Mr Terry Martin</b>, TV Journalist and Moderator  <b>Rapporteur: Ms Cristina Finch</b>, Head of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights</p> <hr/> <p><b>PANEL II: Tolerance and Freedom of Speech: Countering “Hate Speech” and Combating Discrimination on the Internet (Venue: Weltsaal)</b></p> <p><b>PANELLISTS:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ambassador Anne Brasseur</b>, Ambassador of the No Hate Speech Movement, Council of Europe</li> <li>• <b>Ms Dunja Mijatović</b>, OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media</li> <li>• <b>Mr Ross LaJeunesse</b>, Global Head of International Relations, Google Inc.</li> <li>• <b>Mr Christian Lange</b>, Parliamentary State Secretary to the Federal Minister of Justice and Consumer Protection, Germany</li> <li>• <b>Ms Iman Abou Atta</b>, Deputy Director and Head, Middle East and North Africa Programmes, Faith Matters</li> </ul> <p><b>Chair: Ms Britta Sophie Weck</b>, Communications Consultant and Moderator  <b>Rapporteur: Dr Sejal Parmar</b>, Assistant Professor, Department of Legal Studies, Central European University</p>
16:30 – 17:00	COFFEE BREAK

17:00 – 18:00	<b>CLOSING PANEL</b> <b>Venue: Weltsaal</b>
	<p><b>Reports from the Panels and from the Civil Society Pre-Conference; Discussion</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Rapporteur Panel I: <b>Ms Cristina Finch</b>, Head of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights</li> <li>• Rapporteur Panel II: <b>Dr Sejal Parmar</b>, Assistant Professor, Department of Legal Studies, Central European University</li> <li>• Rapporteur Civil Society Pre-Conference: <b>Mr Harry Hummel</b>, Associate Policy Director, Netherlands Helsinki Committee</li> </ul> <p><b>CLOSING REMARKS :</b>  <b>Mr Michael Roth</b>, Minister of State for Europe, Federal Foreign Office, Germany</p> <p><b>Chair:</b> Mr Terry Martin, TV Journalist and Moderator</p>
18:30	<b>Transfer to Reception Venue</b>
19:00 – 22:00	<b>Reception hosted by Frank-Walter Steinmeier, Federal Minister for Foreign Affairs and OSCE Chairperson-in-Office</b>  Venue: Zeiss-Großplanetarium, Prenzlauer Allee 80, 10405 Berlin

## **Annex 2 – Recommendations presented by civil society**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE OSCE CHAIRMANSHIP CONFERENCE ON TOLERANCE AND DIVERSITY, BERLIN, 20 OCTOBER 2016**

On 19 October 2016, representatives of civil society groups and organizations met in Berlin for the Pre-Conference for Civil Society before the OSCE Chairmanship Conference on Tolerance and Diversity. The main purpose was to provide civil society with an opportunity to discuss current issues and priorities related to the topics of the Chairmanship Conference on Tolerance and Diversity across the OSCE region and to prepare recommendations to the OSCE participating States, the OSCE institutions and civil society on the development and implementation of OSCE commitments for the promotion of tolerance and diversity.

The following recommendations were submitted and presented by civil society:<sup>4</sup>

#### **On education for tolerance and diversity**

OSCE participating States should:

- With the support of OSCE institutions, encourage co-operation between state actors and civil society in implementing projects in both formal and informal education.
- Foster a long-term structural commitment in facilitating dialogue between educational institutions and civil society groups and organizations working together in the field.
- Make inclusive teaching and non-discrimination education part of the professional development of future generations of teachers by making it mandatory during the initial teacher training. All teachers should gain the skills needed to be inclusive to all students and to respond to any form of exclusion or hate speech. A multi-dimensional approach to tolerance education should make diversity a positive experience.
- Within teacher training, give special attention to: the promotion of multi-perceptivity, for example in history and literature education; to the skills needed for dealing with sensitive topics; in pedagogy geared to developing critical thinking and empathy.
- Include tolerance education in many forms of education, for example in media education. This is of particular relevance for the outreach to many young people inside and outside of formal education and illustrates that there is a chance to recognize patterns of hate in the media and the power to oppose this.
- Ensure that the narratives of underrepresented minorities and diasporas are mainstreamed and integrated into school subjects across disciplines whether history, geography, media literacy education, civics.

OSCE institutions can play an important role in strengthening international co-operation and exchange of good practice, and should facilitate long-term coalition building between civil society groups and organizations. In particular, they should:

- Avoid fragmentation in education on intolerance and should mainstream non-discrimination approaches. Human rights abuses, hate speech and discrimination should be taken as a shared concern. Sharing both the common experiences of minority groups and

---

<sup>4</sup> Opinions and recommendations expressed in this document do not reflect the position of and/or recommendations of the OSCE Chairmanship or the OSCE.

acknowledging specific contemporary and historical specificities should be part of mainstreaming non-discrimination education.

- Encourage research on the effectiveness of both their own work and of projects run by governments and civil society groups and organizations: Which recommendations have had a positive influence in achieving the set goals; which projects are effective in relation to our goals?
- Encourage educational projects that have a common human rights framework and take account of intersectionality, but also take into account the specific regional contexts and the way in which contemporary developments are a threat to our societies.

### **On combating hatred in social media**

OSCE participating States can play an important role in engaging civil society coalitions as a key tool for successful implementation of preventative measures in tackling hate speech. In particular, they should:

- Strengthen international co-operation and exchange of good practice while facilitating long-term coalition building between civil society groups and organizations.
- Address the needs in tackling hate speech based on the different contexts of each region.
- Educate and raise awareness on tackling hate speech within the formal and non-formal education systems.
- Have in place laws and legislations against hate speech.

Civil society groups and organizations should:

- Provide counter narrative in promoting positive, inclusive and cohesive messages promoting tolerance and non-discrimination.
- Work with the media developing ethical and self-regulatory standards to tackle hate speech and bring positive change while ensuring that the freedom of information and expression is preserved and maintained.

OSCE participating States should support civil society organizations to:

- Push social media companies/Internet providers to take a more responsible approach in tackling hate speech.
- Monitor the implementation of the laws/agreements that are in place with governments, taskforces.
- Hold them accountable for noncompliance to commitments.
- Support investigative journalism as a means of exposing online hate speech.
- Support academic research highlighting the impact of hatred policies.
- Push social media companies to invest in a social fund to run research on hate speech under their Corporate Social Responsibility programs.
- Work collectively locally and globally on a definition for hate speech.
- Work with public authorities and political leaders on tackling hate speech.
- Reinforce the need for social cohesion and respect for all faiths and minorities as a strength of democracy.

### **On effective safeguards against discrimination**

OSCE participating States should, with special priority:

- Collect, maintain and make public, reliable data and statistics in sufficient detail on discriminatory acts.
- Promote a culture of non-discrimination that: raises awareness for intolerance and discrimination as an everyday experience and a social reality; provides people who have

been discriminated against as well as people/organizations responsible for the discrimination with tools to constructively deal with discrimination and to drive change.

- Ensure participation of civil society groups and organizations in drafting and implementing legislations, national action plans and projects on preventing and responding to hate crime and fighting intolerance and discrimination.
- Ensure access to justice for victims of discrimination and hate crime by eliminating barriers and providing legal standing to civil society groups and organizations to file discrimination cases.
- Include sexual orientation, gender identity and disability to the list of discriminatory grounds recognized by Principle 13.7 of the *Concluding Document of the Vienna Meeting of Representatives of the Participating States of the Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe* (1989).
- Develop and support an infrastructure of governmental and non-governmental groups and organizations within and outside the institutions enabling and empowering people to claim their rights when they encounter discrimination and/or to act on their behalf.

In addition, OSCE participating States should:

- Adopt stand-alone comprehensive national legislation prohibiting all forms of discriminatory acts, consulting civil society in the drafting procedure.
- Consider inaccessibility as a form of discrimination.
- Enhance national anti-discrimination mechanisms by providing them with effective investigative power into alleged acts of discrimination and mandating them to issue legally binding decisions.
- Provide for an independent complaints structure in cases where public and governmental institutions have performed their duties in a discriminatory way.
- Provide adequate public funding for measures aimed to prevent and respond to discrimination, including accessibility for disabled people.
- Analyse the reasons of underreporting of cases of discrimination and hate crimes and implement practical solutions to this end.
- Compile and publish a national report on hate crimes.
- Consider how vulnerability is an attitude and barrier to seeing crime as crime, as in the case of hate crime where vulnerability is used to excuse the crimes committed to disabled people.
- Train law enforcement agencies and criminal justice personnel in taking into account the personal characteristics of the victims as well as the nature and circumstances of the alleged crime when assessing the victims' needs and responding to the report.
- Ensure safeguards in the form of effective monitoring and audit mechanisms, making observations and reports by visiting the places of the sources.
- Ensure that state sponsored media does not reinforce or promote negative stereotypes of any group.

Political parties and leaders should:

- Prioritize the active recruitment of minority candidates to overcome the lack of representation in political life of minorities and targeted groups.

The Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination should:

- Focus on, and adopt a standardized approach to, country visits and subsequent reports.
- Intervene when episodes of intolerance and discrimination occur, through public statements and engagement with authorities of relevant OSCE participating States.

OSCE structures should:

- Make sure that all events are accessible and disabled people are not treated differently.

### **On coalitions of civil society groups and organizations**

OSCE participating States should engage civil society coalitions as a key tool for successful implementation of core commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination. In particular, they should:

- Craft funding opportunities that target initiatives by inclusive groups of organizations. The pooling of assets, skills and experiences increases chances for greater reach and success and promotes multiculturalism, and emphasizes the intersectionality of discrimination and bigotry issues.
- Form national anti-discrimination bodies in which diverse civil society coalitions are full members together with officials responsible for victim support, or responding to hate violence and discrimination, including violence against women, and addressing consequences of armed conflicts.
- Create task forces on issues like hate crimes comprised of civil society coalitions that can include national and local officials such as ombudsmen or law enforcement authorities who are the first responders to hate crime and discrimination.
- Incentivize regularized and successful engagement with civil society as a benchmark of success in public service careers. National Human Rights Institutions should be tasked with taking stock of civil society engagement by government agencies to elevate success and shine a light on this aspect of government responsibility.
- Create offices of civil society engagement within the bureaus of heads of state to bring the voices of the full range of civil society into policy making at the highest decision making level. This signals the priority of this engagement by officials in other ministries and at the local level. State officials should establish a regular roundtable or broad consultation with civil society coalitions.
- Lead by example by: relating to diaspora communities as full constituents, not as representing a foreign nationality; enfranchising communities that, even within the human rights movement, are marginalized.

The OSCE Ministerial Council should:

- Adopt a decision about the essential role civil society plays, not just around the margins, but to affirm that civil society participation is at the heart of whether government efforts to implement commitments will succeed.
- Create a special mandate on civil society participation in the OSCE region.
- Note the commencement of the *UN Decade of People of African Descent* and urge the next OSCE Chairmanship to convene a high-level meeting of civil society networks across OSCE participating States to focus on broadening the diversity of communities the government partners with.
- Encourage and support cross-border networks and coalitions to ensure the widest possible inclusion of all actors, as well as areas where civil society activity is limited or restricted. Funding through multilateral bodies like OSCE can create safe space and opportunities for this network building.